EXPLORING THE MELODIC PATH: DECODING THE JOURNEY OF ISTANBUL'S CONSERVATORY GRADUATES IN PURSUIT OF EMPLOYMENT

PELİN AKKAYA CAN

BOĞAZİÇİ UNIVERSITY

2025

EXPLORING THE MELODIC PATH: DECODING THE JOURNEY OF ISTANBUL'S CONSERVATORY GRADUATES IN PURSUIT OF EMPLOYMENT

Thesis submitted to the

Institute for Graduate Studies in Social Sciences

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

in

Sociology

by

Pelin Akkaya Can

Boğaziçi University

2025

Exploring the Melodic Path: Decoding the Journey

of Istanbul's Conservatory Graduates in Pursuit of Employment

The thesis of Pelin Akkaya Can

has been approved by:

Assoc. Prof. Bülent Küçük _____
(Thesis Advisor)

Assist. Prof. Sinan Erensü _____

Assist. Prof. Nur Sinem Kourou _____
(External Member)

May 2025

DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY

I, Pelin Akkaya Can, certify that;

- I am the sole author of this thesis and that I have fully acknowledged and documented in my thesis all sources of ideas and words, including digital resources, which have been produced or published by another person or institution;
- This thesis contains no material that has been submitted or accepted for a degree or diploma in any other educational institution;
- This is a true copy of the thesis approved by my advisor and thesis committee at Boğaziçi University, including final revisions required by them.

Signature.....

Date .....

ABSTRACT

Exploring the Melodic Path: Decoding the Journey

of Istanbul's Conservatory Graduates in Pursuit of Employment

Conservatory trained classical musicians in Istanbul face unique challenges as well as those they share with their global counterparts. A study was conducted, through semi-structured interviews with ten conservatory graduates, to investigate their experiences regarding their professional lives after graduation. From a perspective of contemporary neoliberalism research and taking into account Turkey's unique socio cultural landscape, the study aims to answer questions regarding conservatory graduates 'employment prospects, job seeking strategies, and professional outcomes starting from early personal life circumstances and following each participant's educational and personal development into adulthood and through various career paths. Analyzing the participants 'replies based on a theoretical framework informed by Foucauldian concepts of biopolitics, subjectivation and governmentality, this thesis explores how Istanbul's classical musicians navigate the complexities of their field affected by decreased state support, shifts in cultural preferences and the increased pressure to demonstrate entrepreneurial attitudes.

ÖZET

Melodik Yolu Keşfetmek: İstanbul'un Konservatuvar Mezunlarının İstihdam Arayışındaki Yolculuğunu Çözümlemek

Türkiye'nin konservatuarlarında klasik müzik eğitimi almış müzisyenler, yabancı meslektaşlarıyla paylaştıklarının yanı sıra kendilerine özgü zorluklarla da yüzleşmektedir. İstanbul'da eğitim almış 10 klasik Batı müziği konservatuarı mezunu ile yapılan yarı yapılandırılmış mülakatlara dayalı bir çalışma gerçekleştirilerek bu kişilerin mezuniyet sonrası iş yaşamı tecrübeleri incelenmiştir. Türkiye'nin öznel sosyo-kültürel koşullarını gözeterek çağdaş neoliberalizm araştırmaları perspektifinden yapılan çalışma, konservatuar mezunlarının istihdam olanakları, iş arama stratejileri ve profesyonel deneyimlerine dair soruları, erken dönem yaşam koşullarından başlayıp her katılımcının eğitsel ve kişisel gelişimini yetişkinlik dönemlerine kadar, çeşitli kariyer yollarını da takip ederek cevaplamayı amaçlamaktadır. Katılımcıların yanıtlarını Foucault'nun biyopolitika, öznelleşme ve yönetsellik kavramlarına dayalı bir teorik çerçeveden analiz ederek İstanbul'daki klasik müzik sanatçılarının mesleki alanlarının azalan devlet desteği, toplumun kültürel tercihlerindeki değişimler ve girişimci tutumlar sergileme baskısıyla şekillenen karmaşık dinamiklerini nasıl yönettiklerini incelemektedir.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis is the result of many months of sustained effort; not only my own, but also that of many generous individuals who supported me when I needed it most. First, I'd like to express my sincerest gratitude to my thesis advisor, Assoc. Prof. Bülent Küçük, whose priceless contribution helped improve my research design, thesis structure, writing style, and most importantly, my perspective as an aspiring sociologist. I am proud to be one of many who attended his fascinating lectures and learned from his valuable experience.

Next, I would like to thank my sister, Ayşegül Akkaya, whose musical journey inspired this thesis. She helped me connect with the participants of this study who will always have my gratitude for generously narrating their experiences and allowing me to share their stories.

I would also like to thank Dr. Feyza Akınerdem, who introduced me into the captivating world of fieldwork and continues to be an inspiration through her dedication, intelligence, humor and enthusiasm every day I work with her. And Team ZFA, thank you for being ever so accommodating.

Last, I would like to thank my family who emotionally supported me through this enriching but challenging experience. Without my mother's reassuring presence, my father's steadfast belief in me, my sister's uplifting encouragement, and fruitful debates with my brilliant brother, this process would not have been nearly as special.

And forever, I will be the luckiest to have my husband, Kutay Can, in my life; whose unwavering love and support makes my world go by. Thank you for all you've done to help me finish my thesis, and thank you for being my person.

DEDICATION

To Kutay,

whose loving patience carried me through.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION 1

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW 8

2.1 Career trajectories of conservatory graduates worldwide 8

2.2 Biopolitics, governmentality and subjectivity 13

2.3 Cultural policies in Turkey 22

CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY 31

3.1 Getting motivated 31

3.2 Reviewing literature 32

3.3 Conducting interviews 33

3.4 Analysis & synthesis 34

CHAPTER 4: MUSICIAN AS STUDENT 36

4.1 Beginning music, picking instruments and entering conservatory 36

4.2 The conservatory education model and learning environment 44

4.3 Technical challenges 49

4.4 Physical challenges 52

4.5 Emotional challenges 54

CHAPTER 5: MUSICIAN AS PROFESSIONAL 62

5.1 Professional experiences of conservatory graduates 62

5.2 Sector evaluations of conservatory graduates 74

CHAPTER 6: MUSICIAN AS SUBJECTIVITY 93

6.1 Identifying as a classical musician 93

6.2 Support mechanisms for classical musicians 107

6.3 Changes in the conservatory education and the future of classical music 123

CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSION.....133
APPENDIX A: LONG QUOTES IN TURKISH 137
APPENDIX B: INTERVİEW QUESTIONS IN ENGLISH 179
APPENDIX C: APPROVAL OF THE ETHICS COMMITTEE 181
REFERENCES.....182

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AKM	Atatürk Kültür Merkezi (Atatürk Cultural Center)
AKP	Adalet ve Kalkınma Partisi (Justice and Development Party)
CHP	Cumhuriyet Halk Partisi (Republican People's Party)
CRR	Cemal Reşit Rey Concert Hall
CSO	Cumhurbaşkanlığı Senfoni Orkestrası (Presidential Symphony Orchestra)
İDSO	İstanbul Devlet Senfoni Orkestrası (Istanbul State Symphony Orchestra)
İÜDK	İstanbul Üniversitesi Devlet Konservatuvarı (Istanbul University State Conservatory)
MSGSÜDK	Mimar Sinan Güzel Sanatlar Üniversitesi Devlet Konservatuvarı (Mimar Sinan Fine Arts University State Conservatory)
YTB (Presidency	Yurtdışı Türkler ve Akraba Topluluklar Başkanlığı for Turks Abroad and Related Communities)

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

- Münir Hayri, this matter is very important. Very important. You understand me, don't you?
- Pasha, of course I understand. But the Shah of Iran is arriving in a month. How can it be done in such a short time?
- We drove the enemy out in five days. We changed the alphabet in three months. We can compose an opera in one month, Münir Hayri.[1]

Classical Western music played quite a unique part in the modernization story of the Turkish Republic, which was beautifully represented in the 2024 movie *Bir Cumhuriyet Şarkısı* (Chords of Change). As the movie begins, Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, the founder of the Turkish Republic, asks his aide Münir Hayri to arrange for the composition and the staging of the first Turkish Opera, *Özsoy,* just in time for the arrival of the Shah of Iran, which is only a month away. With extremely limited resources and experience, they manage to pull it off; overcoming many obstacles and facing an enormous sense of uncertainty along the way.

The importance of staging an opera for the Shah of Iran stems from the importance of showcasing the creation of a national identity that positions the young nation as modern, not just through prioritizing economic and technological development but also reforming the cultural sphere. While classical Western music was first introduced as a cultural element in the Ottoman era, it was mostly limited to the Istanbul audience. It is telling that in the movie, the opera singers arrive at the new capital Ankara from Istanbul, signaling to the viewer that the tradition was

[1] -Münir Hayri, bu iş çok mühim. Çok mühim. Anlıyorsun beni, değil mi?
-Paşam, elbette anlıyorum. Yalnız İran şahı bir ay sonra geliyorlar. Bu kadar kısa sürede nasıl olacak?
-Biz beş günde düşmanı söküp atmışız. Üç ayda alfabeyi değiştirmişiz. Bir ayda da opera yaparız Münir Hayri.

already present in the Ottoman capital. It was through the Republic's musical reforms supervised by Atatürk himself that classical Western music became recognized as a symbol of modernity throughout the nation.

The classical music conservatories were vital institutions for the musical reforms to be enacted. While classical Western music was symbolically valuable for the new state, for the citizens, it was rather foreign. In order to become widespread, it needed to be taught, performed and broadcast. In the conservatories, students practiced Western musical techniques and were also shaped as the modern citizens the new republic desired. While this subjectivation mechanism was not limited to conservatory students, in comparison to the rest of the population, they were uniquely positioned to become closely familiar with the classical Western music tradition. This position, as is the case with other groups of professionals, resulted in them being shaped by common experiences, and values that they carry to this day.

Certainly, since the foundation of the classical Western music conservatories, and the Republic, Turkey has experienced many turbulent political, cultural and economic shifts. The ideals, habits and lifestyles of its citizens transformed dramatically, along with the priorities of state governance. As mentioned earlier, state support for Western classical music was not just cultural, it was political. Although the nation was struggling economically in the early Republican period, conservatory-trained musicians were prestigious figures who increasingly became more financially secure, as a result of strong institutional support. However, this symbolic and material support declined over time, especially after the 1980s, as Turkey underwent profound neoliberal transformations. While these changes paralleled global economic trends, they were also influenced by nation-specific dynamics such as the growing visibility of marginalized cultural forms in urban

centers affected by rural-to-urban migration, and the evolving process of Islamization that was initiated with the transition to a multi-party political system from the 1950s onward.

With focused attention on the conservative-neoliberal transformation period of the past 20 years under the AKP rule, this thesis explores the subjectivities of Istanbul's young classically-trained conservatory graduates through a qualitative analysis of the narratives of their education, professionalization and employment processes in order to understand how they navigate the contemporary classical music scene in the city. It is important to consider that Istanbul still stands out as the city that hosts the majority of classical Western music performers in Turkey, as well as the most prestigious events of the field. Despite this status, Istanbul's classical music scene offers only a limited number of state-funded, stable positions, posing a major challenge for the city's aspiring conservatory graduates trying to survive the city's rising cost of living while fulfilling their artistic aspirations. Faced with having to perform in irregular gigs and short-term projects without job security, even with stable performance or teaching jobs on the side, classical musicians struggle to achieve the living conditions they need to stay motivated to sustain the high musical standards their rigorous training requires. After spending years meticulously practicing to perfect their technique hoping to become the ones who qualify in the auditions of prestigious institutions, they find themselves needing to strategize for having to try again at a later date, relocating, or giving up hope for a career in their field as many graduates change career paths due to a lack of secure, long term employment opportunities. The paradoxes playing out between the historical significance of classical Western music for the nation, Istanbul's symbolic centrality for the field, the high investment required for successful musical training and the

shrinking institutional support forms the backdrop of this study, as well as the subjectivation processes of the conservatory graduates.

Theoretically, this thesis investigates the paradoxical network of these developments through the lens of Foucauldian concepts of biopolitics, subjectivity and governmentality. According to Barry, Osborne & Rose (Barry, Osborne, & Rose, 1996, p. 9), for Foucault the liberal mode of governance operates by shaping the "conduct of conduct," (Foucault, 1988) meaning that individuals in a society are not to be governed through direct intervention, but through the internalization of norms that lead them to regulate their own behavior. This is why the creation and the transformation of a national identity is a crucial aspect of state governance and also why a neoliberal shift brings about a dramatic change in the nation's official discourse. While liberal governance is marked with the intention of sustaining a free market where competition between actors is encouraged to unfold without state intervention, under neoliberalism, governance no longer just protects market freedom but actively constructs the conditions under which market rationality can permeate all aspects of life (Barry, Osborne, & Rose, 1996, p. 9). This means that all professionals, especially increasingly in the younger generations, go through similar shifts under neoliberal governance, facing precarious conditions such as lower pay, reduced benefits, heightened operational costs, decreased state support and wealth inequality.

What is unique about the conservatory graduates in Istanbul in comparison to their Western counterparts and peers of other fields in the nation is that their institution subjectivates them through a long and highly specialized training period heavily informed by early Republican era ideals and values as conservatories remain relatively outside the margins of the national education system. Due to the

institutional neglect conservatories face and the cultural isolation of the classical music field in the contemporary conservative-neoliberal governance period, after graduating, they enter into a narrow and isolated market that is marked by minimal public demand and job creation.

By looking deeper into classically-trained conservatory graduates' training and career paths, this study was set out to answer the following questions:

- What are the strategic approaches used by musical conservatory graduates in Istanbul to secure employment within or beyond their specialized domains?
- What are the perceived advantages and challenges of conservatory graduates competing in Istanbul's job market?
- How do the conservatory graduates' perceive their professional experiences differ from that of their counterparts in the Western world?

In order to answer these questions, 10 in person and online semi-structured interviews were conducted with classical musicians who trained at the classical Western music performance departments of Istanbul's two state conservatories, the Istanbul University State Conservatory and the Mimar Sinan Fine Arts University State Conservatory. The interviews sought to explore how the subjectivities of classical musicians determined to fulfill the expectations of their field under precarious conditions were constructed in Istanbul's state conservatories and how these subjectivities persisted or were transformed by market forces.

The literature review section of this thesis explores the training and employment processes of conservatory graduates in the classical music field under neoliberal governance. The chapter then delves into the Foucauldian concepts of biopolitics, governmentality and subjectivity in order to provide a theoretical lens to make sense of the fieldwork. The third pillar of the literature review contributes by

bringing contextual information about cultural policies in Turkey as they relate to the beginnings of the field of classical music in the nation as well as the neoliberal transformation of the governing rationale. The next chapter begins by stating the motivation of the researcher in aiming to answer the research questions listed earlier in this chapter, and continues with justifying the body of literature and the theoretical background adopted to achieve a sound analysis of the participants' individual and collective experiences in the field. Later, the interview process is described in detail, along with an overview of the selected participants' profiles. The process of analysis and synthesis are also included in this chapter.

The fourth chapter marks the opening of the fieldwork analysis and traces the classical musicians' early beginnings in music as well as the inner workings of the conservatory as an institution and its model of education. The importance of this chapter stems from the fact that it reveals the building blocks of a classical musician's subjectivity and establishes the major influences in the training period and the career progression of each graduate. The fifth chapter is reserved for the professional experiences of conservatory graduates, and how they perceive the working conditions for the different roles available in their sector. Drawing attention to the precarious nature of the classical music field in Istanbul, this chapter highlights the characteristics of state-funded orchestras, private ensembles, and freelance opportunities, as well as how classical musicians navigate the market while aspiring to maintain artistic integrity. The sixth chapter focuses on how classical musicians conceptualize their professional identities and roles in the broader society as well as the changes that influence their field and how they expect the future of classical music to take shape in the light of those changes. Based on the participants' reflections, the chapter underlines how classical musicians' subjectivities are not

only shaped by institutional influence but also by societal dynamics and cultural expectations. In addition, it reveals how participants' artistic training informs their worldview, ethical positions and moral obligations.

The seventh and final chapter summarizes the key findings of the research and contextualizes the thesis within the existing literature. Drawing connections between the participants' narratives and broader themes of subjectivation under neoliberal cultural policies, it reflects on how Istanbul's classical musicians negotiate and maintain their professional aspirations and identities in the classical music field heavily influenced by market forces and shifts in state support. The conclusion chapter also highlights how the specific case of Istanbul's conservatory graduates contributes to the studies on the transformation of artistic professions under neoliberalism.

Ultimately, this thesis places its central focus on the self-described lived experiences of Istanbul's conservatory trained classical musicians, giving voice to their struggles and highlighting the issues of reproduction that threaten the future of their field. The case of Istanbul's conservatory graduates contributes to the growing literature on the neoliberal transformation of the arts by revealing the distinct position of the classical musicians, negotiated between early Republican ideals and conservative-neoliberal policy shifts. It offers insight into the localized expressions of global neoliberal trends.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Career trajectories of conservatory graduates worldwide

In order to understand how conservatory graduates of Istanbul deal with employment issues, it is important to understand the historical conditions that shape their field and industry, as well as their identities as classical musicians. First of all, conservatory graduates of Istanbul can and should be considered as part of a large network of classical musicians around the world in terms of employment opportunities and challenges. Although they may be based in different localities, the genre of classical music has its origins firmly grounded in European arts and culture and this heritage informs many aspects of their profession. Secondly, from their model of education and performance practices to professional networks and musical ideals, all classical musicians feed from the same cultural source, and in turn, become actors in the same industry, influencing its trajectory to varying degrees. For these reasons, I found it useful to start my research by familiarizing myself with the literature on the educational goals and employment strategies of conservatory graduates worldwide.

Although conservatories are established to train highly skilled performers, making a living as a performer seems to be out of reach for so many of the graduates around the world. Ellis (1999) talked about "stages and cycles of commitment" that operate in the conservatory music student culture (p.43), stating that career risk is announced early on in the classical music performance training, and by the time students reach conservatory stage their personal commitment and knowledge of the risks are well established. Ondracek-Peterson (2013) suggests in her dissertation that being employed as a full-time musician is considered success, regardless of what it

pays. She explains that many participants in her survey consider themselves underpaid for their skill level, while also acknowledging that supply and demand in the classical music industry is "completely out of proportion" (p. 341). One of her informants states that many of them "do not enter into a career in the arts in expectation of financial stability/freedom" (p. 341), and one must have "passion and desire to do what they love to do" (p. 343), even though it could mean "years of hard work chasing a pipe dream" (p. 74). The study also points out that conservatories do not provide students with statistical or factual information about job prospects, like other schools may be asked to do, and the students do not at all seem to be concerned by it. Chafe and Kaida (2019) mention that professional musicians endure "significant initial income penalties in the course of costly skills acquisition, formal education, training and time, only to face further years of perpetually low, inconsistent income" necessitating coping strategies to deal with occupational uncertainty that increases with "the digitization and technological advancements in music production and dissemination." (pp. 3–4).

Although developments in technology, lifestyle changes and shifts in cultural preferences require adaptation from educators and performers both, one aspect that remains stable throughout the classical music tradition is the "well-established gatekeeping practices," according to Knotek et al. (2020, p. 4). They explain that in high-performance domains gatekeepers facilitate access to "resources and opportunities" that committed competitors need in order to rise in their respective fields (p. 2). The authors rate the importance of gatekeeping practices in classical music to be especially high, reminding readers of the continuity of the tradition for over hundreds of years. For similar reasons, Jarvin and Subotnik (2010) consult

gatekeepers as well as faculty teachers in their study where they discuss factors that determine a classical music performer's success. They define gatekeepers as "individuals who are influential in determining the success of aspiring artists, such as artistic directors or critics." (p. 79) Interestingly, these gatekeepers perceive some of these factors for success to be "innate," such as "musicality" and "charisma," which for them can only be "enhanced but not taught" suggesting the classical music tradition expects hard to define abilities and expertise of students beyond perceived talent, passion, commitment and hard work (p. 79).

Bennett (2007) reveals that success as a professional musician requires "the skills to run a small business" as well as "the confidence to create new opportunities, pedagogical and communication skills for use in educational, ensemble and community settings, industry knowledge and strong professional networks," along with performance skills (p. 185). Sternberg et al. (2022) suggest that conservatories in the U.S. teach music students adaptive skills that their counterparts in liberal arts colleges are found lacking, which could prove beneficial for transitioning into a competitive job market. It is stated that the conservatory is seen as offering mere technical training by many educators, when in reality "it is a place to learn how to learn, learn how to think, learn how to adapt, and learn how to perform in real, consequential worldly settings" (p. 9). The authors explain that the conservatory model aims to develop "not only students 'academic skills, but also their psychosocial skills as they apply to real-world careers and related adaptive contexts," whereas the traditional liberal arts model is mainly concerned with developing "academic and cognitive skills" (p. 1).

Kadushin (1969) concluded that conservatory students develop professional self-concept through meaningful contact with circles of professional musicians, which increases the longer one attends school. Kadushin states that this conception is unrelated to skill, and conservatories help develop this self-concept as they "increasingly permit students to make use of their abilities in the professional world" (p. 404). In other words, since classical musicians begin their training at a young age and learn how to perform in professional settings throughout their school years, by the time they start attending university they do not consider themselves to be students in the regular sense. They identify as professionals, work on and off or part time during studies, and graduate having started building relevant experience and network opportunities for when they transition to full-time employment.

The literature on conservatory students and graduates reveals that career trajectories are influenced by a long list of factors not limited to professional self-conception, interpersonal skills, amount of dedication, external rewards, availability of performance opportunities, ties to professional networks, technical proficiency and parental support. In addition to these requirements, according to Lorenzo de Reizabal and Benito Gómez (2020) there has been a growing interest in entrepreneurship in the arts, mainly due to the reduction in public contribution to cultural enterprises in many countries, over the last 20 years. Authors explain that for many music profession scholars, orchestral performance can no longer be considered as a "sector of highest interest and growth for students" as they increasingly feel the "need to operate according to entrepreneurial logic and to look for alternative sources of funding" (p. 13).

Conservatory graduates in Istanbul are not exempt from the broader global trend that demands the adoption of an entrepreneurial mode of professional conduct,

particularly in the face of significant decline in state support for the classical music field that has been going on in Turkey since the 1980s. However, the Turkish case is distinct in context of the early Republican modernization project, in which classical Western music was deliberately positioned as a symbol of modernity and a tool for constructing a new national identity, to which the significance of conservatories in Turkey is deeply tied. Carrying out this ideological mission, the state actively established conservatories by inviting seasoned European professionals to institutionalize music education and sending promising young students abroad to receive training and return as educators. These efforts created both a supply and demand for classical music professionals, effectively securing their status as integral contributors to the Republican vision of cultural modernization.

This historical context makes the application of a Foucauldian framework particularly relevant for this study. Unlike in Western paradigm where classical music emerged organically and holds deep-rooted cultural value, in Turkey it was introduced as a top-down state initiative. It lacked a broad historical or cultural foundation and was not sustained by broad public demand. Consequently, the neoliberal shift in governance has had more disruptive effects on the classical music field in Turkey, dismantling not only material support structures but also the symbolic scaffolding that legitimized the field's existence. By employing Foucauldian concepts of governmentality and subjectivation, this thesis seeks to examine how conservatory graduates 'identities are shaped by the shifting rationalities of governance and how their experiences reflect the broader cultural, historical, and demographic transformations of twentieth-century Turkey.

2.2 Biopolitics, governmentality and subjectivity

2.2.1 Foucault's account

In his book titled Biopolitics: An Advanced Introduction, Thomas Lemke (2011) offers us valuable insights about Foucault's understanding of biopolitics and how it relates to the "government of living beings." According to Lemke, Foucault has a unique perspective of biopolitics in which "life denotes neither the basis nor the object of politics" but constitutes "a border that should be simultaneously respected and overcome" (pp. 4–5). Lemke ties this conception of life to the emergence of the idea of a "nature of society" that is stated to form "the basis and the border" of liberal governmental practices (p. 45). In other words, liberal governance is centered around society being a natural phenomenon that can be observed and understood, as well as influenced by external interventions. As such, Lemke explains that for Foucault liberalism is not "an economic theory or a political ideology" but "a specific art of governing human beings" (p. 45). And while we may use the word government in a "purely political" context today, in the 18th century it also "addressed problems of self-control, guidance for the family and for children, management of the household, directing the soul, and other questions"; generally understood by Foucault "as a way of acting to affect the way in which individuals conduct themselves" (pp. 44–45).

As stated by Barry, Osborne & Rose (1996), Foucault (1989) identifies a key shift in the understanding of governance at the end of the eighteenth century, which is the emergence of society as a new object for political consideration;

> It seems to me that at that very moment it became apparent that if one governed too much, one did not govern at all - that one provoked results contrary to those one desired. What was discovered at that time - and this was one of the great discoveries of political thought at the end of the eighteenth

> century - was the idea of society. That is to say, that government not only has to deal with a territory, with a domain, and with its subjects, but that it also has to deal with a complex and independent reality that has its own laws and mechanisms of disturbance. This new reality is society. From the moment that one is to manipulate a society, one cannot consider it completely penetrable by police. One must take into account what it is. It becomes necessary to reflect upon it, upon its specific characteristics, its constants and variables. (Foucault, 1989, as cited in Barry, Osborne & Rose, 1996, p. 9)

Foucault's observation underscores that effective governance requires not just control over territory or subjects, but an understanding of society's internal dynamics. This foundational shift would later advise neoliberal approaches to government that operate through norms, incentives, and self-management.

Lemke (2011) explains that in the Middle Ages, before the introduction of a "nature of society" that requires to be known by the ones who wish to govern it, "a good government was part of a natural order willed by God" (p. 45). The sovereign power ruled with an entitlement over the "right of life and death" of his subjects, and was "characterized by power relations operating in the form of deduction: as deprivation of goods, products, and services" (p. 35). "In Foucault's reading," Lemke argues, "this ancient right over death has undergone a profound transformation" after the 17th century, and was "complemented by a new form of power that seeks to administer, secure, develop, and foster life" (p. 35). Lemke stresses that this development did not happen within politics alone but was the "result of some important historical transformations" such as "the increase of industrial and agricultural production in the 18th century" and the "growing medical and scientific knowledge about the human body" (p. 35). While the impact of "epidemics, disease, and famine" was "quite high" until then, "the technological, scientific, social, and medical innovations" paved the way for a "relative control over life" (p. 35).

> It is no longer a matter of bringing death into play in the field of sovereignty, but of distributing the living in the domain of value and utility. Such a power has to qualify, measure, appraise, and hierarchize, rather than display itself in its murderous splendor; it does not have to draw the line that separates the enemy of the sovereign from his loyal subjects. It effects distributions around the norm. (Foucault, 1980, as cited in Lemke, 2011, p. 39)

Lemke (2011) explains that it was the gathering of specific forms of knowledge about human bodies through disciplines such as "statistics, demographics, epidemiology and biology", that made it possible to talk about "norms and averages" with regards to the "population", which separated the notion of life from the individual experience of it (p. 5). The emergence of "population", according to Lemke, facilitated the government of individuals by "practices of correction, exclusion, normalization, disciplining, therapeutics, and optimization" (p. 5). Lemke explains that "in contrast to more traditional forms of domination such as slavery or serfdom", discipline allowed for "the increase of the economic productivity of the body, while at the same time weakening its forces to assure political subjection" (p. 36).

> The historical moment of the disciplines was the moment when an art of the human body was born, which was directed not only at the growth of its skills, nor at the intensification of its subjection, but at the formation of a relation that in the mechanism itself makes it more obedient as it becomes more useful, and conversely. (Foucault, 1977, as cited in Lemke, 2011, p. 36)

Burchell (1996) states that governmental techniques that together form "a distinctive liberal art of government", techniques including but not composed of 'the disciplines', require governed individuals to adopt "particular practical relations to themselves in the exercise of their freedom in appropriate ways" when conducting themselves (pp. 25–26). These "techniques of the self" can be concerned with the promotion of behaviors around "saving and providentialism, the acquisition of ways

of performing roles like father or mother, the development of habits of cleanliness, sobriety, fidelity, self-improvement, responsibility and so on" (p. 26). To the author, "the essential characteristic" of a neoliberal government is "the promotion of an 'enterprise culture 'within all forms of conduct — to the conduct of organizations hitherto seen as being non-economic, to the conduct of government and to the conduct of individuals themselves" (p. 29).

> A characteristic form of relationship that has developed throughout these new practical systems is what Jacques Donzelot (1991b) has called procedures of "contractual implication". This involves "offering" individuals and collectivities active involvement in action to resolve the kind of issues hitherto held to be the responsibility of authorized governmental agencies. However, the price of this involvement is that they must assume active responsibility for these activities, both for carrying them out and, of course, for their outcomes, and in so doing they are required to conduct themselves in accordance with the appropriate (or approved) model of action. This might be described as a new form of "responsibilization" corresponding to the new forms in which the governed are encouraged, freely and rationally, to conduct themselves. (1991, as cited in Barry, Osborne, & Rose, 1996)

Now that we understand the Foucauldian concepts of biopolitics, governmentality and subjectivity, as well as the historical processes leading to the contemporary techniques of governance (such as the emergence of the concepts of society, population and discipline, along with the individual responsible for conducting themselves appropriately) we can start exploring how an entrepreneurial mindset came to be a requirement for employment in the 21st century.

2.2.2 Subject of the 21st century

In the introduction of his book The Entrepreneurial Self: Fabricating a New Type of Subject, Ulrich Bröckling (2015) brings to our attention a report dating back to 1997, by the "Bavarian-Saxonian Commission for Future Concerns", that envisions to supply the 21st century society with "creative, enterprising people with a much

greater readiness and capacity than hitherto to assume responsibility for themselves and others in all matters" (unlike "the perfect copyists of preset blueprints" that the 20th century society had previously demanded) to ultimately achieve "a reduction of the social welfare state" (Introduction). While the author's narration of the report quickly and neatly explains the reason why the 21st century's workforce needs to develop an entrepreneurial logic, it is important to understand the ways in which individuals "obey the imperatives of the economy" instead of having the economy function as "an instrument in the service of society and its political institutions" (p. 24).

Bröckling (2015) suggests that "acting entrepreneurially is the very condition of participation in social life" in our "marketized world", because people are afraid of being left out of the "society of competition" and wish to stay connected (Foreword). By positioning themselves as entrepreneurs, one can embrace an "active posture" as "the rugged individual making it on her own in the wilderness of the labour market" instead of feeling helpless in the face of actual or potential unemployment (p. 26). Of course, assuming this position means having to accept any failure to achieve goals as personal faults. The entrepreneurial self then has to "subject itself to permanent self-monitoring either on its own or with the help of professional advisors, therapists, coaches and other authorities, in order to continually re-adjust its life trajectory" (p. 5). Bröckling warns his readers about the "normalizing interventions" of these "experts of subjectivity" as he maintains that these professionals operate by turning "existential questions about the purpose of life and the meaning of suffering into technical questions of the most effective ways of managing malfunction and

improving quality of life", and he sees the "chances of self-realization" to be intertwined with the "risk of crashing" (pp. 5–14).

While Bröckling's neoliberal subject, the entrepreneurial self, becomes an "entrepreneur of her own labour force" by dissolving the boundary between "wage earning and leisure, work life and private life" under 'the pressure to economize" (p. 21), Lazzarato and Jordan's "indebted man" has to "account for himself as a future subject" by proving to be "capable of promising and keeping a promise" (p. 88). The authors identify debtor-creditor relationship as a fundamental mechanism of social control under neoliberal governance, pointing out that although countries are running programs to reduce debt, they do not stop creating new debt, "since debt serves to prolong and expand the neoliberal political program" (p. 29). According to them, "neoliberalism has, since its emergence, been founded on a logic of debt" (p. 25).

> Credit or debt and their creditor-debtor relationship constitute specific relations of power that entail specific forms of production and control of subjectivity-a particular form of homo economicus, the "indebted man." (p. 30)

Lazzarato and Jordan (2012) explain that the "morality of debt" influences the behaviors of "the unemployed, the assisted, the users of public services, as well as of entire populations" (p. 30), allowing capitalism to "bridge the gap between present and future" due to its effects over subjectivity (p. 46). The indebted subject performs what is called by Nietzsche the "labor of man on himself," a "self-torture" that results in the creation of the individual subject, "answerable and indebted to his creditor" (p. 42). Even if it's the public, not the individual who is in debt, "every individual must take responsibility for it" (p. 38). Because under neoliberal policies, it is the

individual subject who needs to assume “the costs as well as the risks of a flexible and financialized economy” which “are not only those of innovation, but also and especially those of precariousness, poverty, unemployment, a failing health system, housing shortages, etc.” (p. 51).

> Around the globe, trillions of dollars have been pumped by central banks, not into public work programmes, infrastructure projects, bridging technologies into a post-carbon future, health infrastructure, or investments in education, training and employment initiatives that might promise some hope, some cause for optimism among the world’s tens of millions of unemployed, underemployed and precariously employed young people, but into the inflation of asset prices. (p. 5)

Under the title of Neoliberalism, austerity, and the moral economies of young people’s health and well-being Kelly and Pike (2017) bring together studies that illuminate how neoliberal policies affect young generations. They report in their article, Is Neo-Liberal Capitalism Eating Itself or Its Young?, referencing Chakrabortty (2016), that ‘in the period 2009–2012 the Bank of England’s £375 billion QE (Quantitative Easing) programme had inflated the value of shares and bonds by £600 billion, and that 40% of these gains had gone to increase the wealth of the top 5% of UK households’. In addition to that, “the wealthiest 1% of US households took 91 cents of each dollar in new wealth generated, while the 99% had to share the remaining 9 cents”, earning QE the honor of being announced as “the biggest redistribution of wealth from the middle-class and the poor to the rich ever” by a billionaire hedge fund manager. (p. 6)

The authors predict that “today’s young people and young adults, and the generations who will follow and grow up in the unfolding aftermath of the GFC (Global Financial Crisis) will be struggling with “changed education and employment circumstances and opportunities, consequences for physical and mental

health and well-being, consumption, housing, relationship and parenting aspirations, and a sense of self in relation to the possibilities for participation in the liberal democracies" (p. 8).

2.2.3 The creative subject

> Precarious workers in the creative industries, for example, are encouraged not merely to rationally manage their human capital, but also to take a leap of faith to acquire unpredictable successes. It is this latter risk-loving, extra-calculative side to neoliberal subjectivity that economists usually designate as 'entrepreneurial'. (Christiaens, 2019, Abstract)

Tim Christiaens (2019, p. 73) argues that the Beckerian "utility-maximizing agent" on which Foucault based his claim that "neoliberalism produces subjects as entrepreneurs of themselves" fails to "deliver the toolbox to describe" why young creatives stay in the creative industries. He explains that young creatives work under conditions in which "they have to migrate to a few global cities with vibrant art scenes and compete for a minuscule number of jobs; most work multiple low-wage jobs on the side to fund their artistic projects; access is acquired via quasi-clientelist networking and unpaid internships; many freelance and temporary jobs give no access to social security; because employment in art projects is temporary, when it comes to job offers, workers are at the mercy of a few employers who pick and choose the most exploitable; sexual harassment is rampant" (p. 3).

Although "the personal satisfaction of 'doing the work one loves" may be considered a form of "psychic income that compensates for the monetary costs", the author argues that it does not explain why many creatives choose to stay even when they feel miserable (Christiaens, 2019, p. 3). The answer for him lies with the fact that young creatives view "risk, flexibility, and permanent self-reinvention" to be

fundamental to success. Even though their future likens “a hazy mist of uncertainty” they remain assured that they are “destined” to succeed if only they keep improving their mastery (Christiaens, 2019, p. 4).

> The aim of creative subjects is not to do away with all forms of utility-maximization, but there is an aspect in their behaviour that undercuts these cold calculations with the warm glow of imagined success. They do not strive to become flexible to market conditions, but to become ‘agile ’individuals who generate their own market demand. The aim is to create their own job ex nihilo. (Gillies, 2011, as cited in Christiaens, 2019).

Christiaens proposes that this mindset creatives seem to adopt has become a “template” for the “high-risk career pathways” within the “new cultural industries” (p. 4). Bröckling (2016) explains this issue by suggesting that creativity itself is a “programme of governing” in which “faith in the creative potential of the individual is the secular religion of the entrepreneurial self” (pp. 101–102). The author draws a picture of the ideal “creative subject” that constantly tries to balance “contradictory demands” made of it (p. 110):

> Creative people possess large quantities of energy but stay calm and relaxed. They combine intellectual subtlety with naivety, can think convergently and divergently, are disciplined and playful, responsible and uncommitted, switch between fantasy and realism, are extroverted and introverted, humble and proud, ambitious and selfless, competitive and cooperative, masculine and feminine, traditional and conservative, as well as rebellious and iconoclast, passionate yet objective in assessing their own work, sensitive to the suffering of others yet capable of intense joy. (Bröckling, 2016, p. 110)

According to Bröckling (2016), “homogeneity, identity, norm and repetition” are the antitheses of the “creative imperative” because “only non-conformists have a unique selling point” (p. 112). This means that in order to participate, and stay relevant, in a neoliberal market, one has to consistently strive to be even more creative, as being creative essentially means “being more creative than others” (p. 112). The author identifies this endless competition as the “essence of neoliberal governmentality” and

“the ideal tool for conditioning people”, because governing through competition involves guiding “the innate addiction to self-aggrandisement” instead of restraining it (p. 60).

While conservatory graduates have acquired subjectivities during their education shaped by the statist approach in the tradition of the early Republican era when state support for the arts was strong, they are pushed to adapt to neoliberal market conditions in their professional lives. This tension becomes particularly visible in the lived experiences of many participants, who—despite securing positions in state orchestras or other public and private institutions—report having to pursue additional income in the form of freelance gigs, private ensemble work, or instrument teaching in order to maintain a basic quality of life. These strategies reflect the growing insufficiency of institutional support and the increasing need to self-manage one's career under precarious conditions. To better understand this dual formation of subjectivity, the next chapter will focus on the historical development of Turkey’s cultural policies. Tracing this trajectory will provide valuable insights into the structural and ideological shifts that have shaped the subjectivation experiences of conservatory graduates.

2.3 Cultural policies in Turkey

Unlike their Western peers, classical musicians in Istanbul are performers of a musical genre that was imported, or at best adapted, to their cultural sphere rather recently, and is deemed ‘foreign ’to their past. The introduction of classical music to the cultural life of Istanbul dates back to the Ottoman era, when an ensemble was sent by the king of France in the 16th century, as a gift to the palace. Their first reaction to the genre is said to be rejection, made apparent by the breaking of the

ensemble's instruments. Later, as part of the modernization efforts by the Ottoman palace, *Tanzimat*, *Mızıka-yı Hümayun* (The Imperial Military Music School) was founded (1826), as a replacement for the existing *Mehterhane. Mızıka-yı Hümayun* was led by a Western musician, Giuseppe Donizetti, who was assigned to train musicians for the palace band.

While non-Muslim Ottomans organized and participated in classical music performances in the 19th century, the traditional Ottoman art music was the preferred musical genre of the Muslims, especially in urban settings. Meanwhile, in the Ottoman palace and among the elites, Western manners were increasing in popularity, affecting a shift in their musical taste. This development marked the beginning of a divide in the cultural sphere, which would cause years of turbulence in the future of music debates.

In Music Sociology In Turkey: Changing Paradigms, Interchanging Themes, Güneş Ayas (2016) expertly compiles the sociological debates around music, and reveals how integral a tool music has been to the nation's evolving intellectual, political and cultural space. Never for its own sake, always a means to an end, music in Turkey seems to have been a battleground for the formation of a national identity for the state, since the earliest days. The author explains that in the Early Republican era, the ruling elite were in need of a model that legitimized, at once, their decisions to turn West, protect the Turkish identity and reject the imperial heritage. For that end, it was a matter of debate which cultural elements would be accepted or excluded. Ziya Gökalp had envisioned a model that divided the Ottoman musical heritage that predated the introduction of Western music, into two distinct parts: "the Eastern music taken from Byzantium by Farabi and the folk melodies descendant of Turkish music" (Ayas, 2016, p. 345). According to this classification, the Ottoman

art music, referred to as *alaturka* in the music debates, was actually as foreign to the culture as it was backward. Thus, it had to make way for polyphonic Western music. But, at the same time, if the Western music was taken just as it was, there would be no trace of Turkish music left. The solution to that problem was to collect "pure" melodies from Anatolian villages, untouched by foreign influences in the urban settings, and create a new and modern national music by refining the folk melodies using Western techniques. Ayas (2016) borrows a phrase from Orhan Tekelioğlu that he thinks perfectly captures the dominant discourse around music in the Early Republican era: "the enemy is Eastern music, the source is folk music, the model is Western music and harmony, while the goal is national music" (Tekelioğlu, 2006, as cited in Ayas, 2016, p. 346).

Parkinson and Muslu Gardner (2020) explain in their article on higher music education in Turkey, quoting Ayas, that although Atatürk was personally fond of Ottoman art music, he did not find it sophisticated enough to "feed the needs of the creative Turkish soul" (p. 368). The fact that it was taught in sufi lounges led to the worries of an 'Islamist revival 'taking place, and sufi lounges were abolished in 1926 (p. 369). In 1927, Ottoman art music was banned from being taught in the educational institutions as well. In the 1930s, Western musicians were invited to take part in the reform efforts, and Paul Hindemith, was asked to create a new repertoire that was 'both national and European', as he was working to establish the first State Conservatory in Ankara (p. 369). The authors mention that President Inonu continued to open state conservatories, which "operated as both discursive and practical mechanisms for Republican control" (p. 369). Traditional Turkish

instruments would not be included in official and higher education programmes until the late 1970s.

Ayas (2016) explains that it was Gökalp's model that informed the Musical Reforms and was supported by Atatürk, along with authors such as Ahmet Adnan Saygun, Halil Bedii Yönetken, Cevat Memduh Altar, Mahmut Ragıp Gazimihal and Vahit Lütfi Salcı, who helped guide the reforms and participated in music debates. Both supporters of the exclusion of Ottoman music from the national music and those who advocated for a place in it based their arguments on political, ideological and sociological grounds instead of aesthetic and technical concerns. For those who sided with the exclusion of Ottoman art music, the Western music was presented as the latest form in the evolution of musical technique, or the music of the 'free ' societies, while the Eastern music was associated with 'moaning', 'narcotic 'melodies and 'trembling under an executioner's knife '(Ayas, 2016, p. 348). On the other side, Rauf Yekta Bey, who supported the inclusion of the Ottoman art music as a legitimate part of the national identity, rejected a division between "folk music" and "classical Turkish music", maintaining that there simply was an "aesthetic hierarchy" between them, not "contrast or dissonance" (Ayas, 2016, p. 350). According to Ayas (2016), he was the first to refer to Ottoman music as Turkish music deliberately, instead of using terms such as "Eastern music, Enderun music, palace music, Byzantium music" which were aiming to "push classical music tradition outside of the sphere of cultural legitimacy" (p. 350).

Ayas (2016) states that while these debates continued among the elites, the popular wing of Ottoman music remained to be the most widespread musical tradition in the city, even in the periods of severe repression. In fact, while the

urbanization of the population was almost steady until the 1950s, especially after the transition to a multi-party system and Turkey's acceptance into NATO and the Western wing, the repression of alaturka became a matter of high political cost.

According to Parkinson and Muslu Gardner (2020), after the 1950s, "cultural hegemony was fought over by the Kemalists and an emerging Islamist political class who sought to reinvigorate interest in the Ottoman past" and policy changes were made in music and education that reflected these developments (p. 369). Influenced by *Milli Selamet Partisi* (The National Salvation Party), educational textbooks featured religious content and *Türk Musikisi Devlet Konservatuarı* (Turkish Music State Conservatory) started teaching "Turkish (Ottoman) classical music" for the first time in 1976 (p. 369).

According to Ayas (2016), after Turkey's rapid capitalist transformation in the 1950 s, the assumption that socio-cultural problems of the industrial West were increasingly more relevant to Turkish society paved the way for the music debates to shift from Gökalp's model of civilization-culture tension to class and urban-based popular culture analyses. While the Marxist cultural critics, influenced by the revolutionary currents of the left between 1960-80, deemed almost all musical genres to be "bourgeoisie music" (except for protest music with a revolutionary content and various examples of folk music) still attributed a higher value to "progressive" Western classical music in comparison to "reactionary" Eastern music (Ayas, 2016, p. 357). In this respect, they still maintained a common ground with the cultural policies of the Early Republican era. However, after the 1980's, Ayas (2016) highlights a major shift in the music debates, where popular music was seen as a field of struggle, and elitist approaches were being condemned

The *arabesk* debate formed a bridge between the East-West tension and the capitalism-urbanization discourse, opening up space for new debates. Meral Özbek (1997) conceptualizes arabesk as a site of resistance against elite-driven modernization narratives, and "a metaphor for popular identity" (p. 212). She argues that while arabesk emerged as a popular response to the capitalist modernization process influenced by state policies, market forces, and social changes, its spirit came specifically from the impromptu, composite form created by the urbanizing working class. Özbek (1997) also points out that arabesk arose during a time of intense political repression, when culture became the prime medium for the expression of societal conflicts. She suggests that while the official nationalism discourse rejected social differences, arabesk embraced cultural diversity, giving marginalized groups a voice and challenging hegemonic cultural narratives (pp. 217–219). Meanwhile, according to Martin Stokes (1992), for the center-left of the political spectrum, state reforms were "the only force capable of transforming Turkey into a modern and European society" against which arabesk backlashed (p. 22). Arabesk, therefore, marked a transformation in cultural expression and identity representing a shift in how society responded to modernization.

Ayas (2016, p. 367) states that, according to İren Özgür (2006, as cited in Ayas, 2016), the popularization of arabesk, which was marginalized until the 1980s and became the most popular genre in the 1990s, had to do with the shift in the aesthetic and cultural preferences of the ruling elites. Having lost faith in the reliability of the West, the elites were gradually distancing themselves from it, and returning to their Eastern roots. The Eastern elements in arabesk no longer bothered the middle and upper classes as they once had, and arabesk ceased to be the music of marginalized people with poor socio-economic status. What, for Orhan Tekelioglu

(2006), was the “march of popular taste to the center” took place and “the center-periphery divide was largely overcome.” (as cited in Ayas, 2016, p. 365)

However, according to Ali Akay (2002), the exclusionary cultural policies of the classical bourgeoisie (Istanbul) and Ankara bourgeoisie were in fact replaced by the inclusive policies of the new bureaucracy and provincial capital represented by Turgut Özal and a new “arabesk bourgeoisie” was created, who had hegemony over the classical bourgeoisie in the civil society as well as the state. (as cited in Ayas, 2016, p. 367)

Parkinson and Muslu Gardner (2020) emphasize that the military coup of 1980 marked “a critical juncture that stimulated public criticism of Kemalist ideology” (p. 369). In the aftermath of the coup, the *Anavatan Partisi* (Motherland Party) government, led by Turgut Özal, integrated Turkey’s economy into the global free market and “evoked the Ottoman past to garner public enthusiasm for its ambitious global outlook” (p. 369). The ‘Ozalian Ottomanism ’upheld Islam as a “unifying national identity concept at a time of increasing ethnic division” and this approach was continued by the *Refah Partisi* (Welfare Party) and *Adalet ve Kalkınma Partisi* (Justice and Development Party, AKP) (p. 369). Both parties were “openly critical of Western globalization” and AKP envisioned a “New Turkey” whose identity, culture and values would be separated from Western-centric ideals, and endorsed “a revival of traditional Islamic aesthetics” (pp. 369-370).

The authors characterize the prevalent ideology of the AKP government as a “synthesis of Islamism, nationalism and neoliberal capitalism" (p. 369). While the AKP government pursued a “pluralistic stance” regarding cultural policies during its

first decade in power that started in 2002, this position was attributed to the "ongoing accession bid to the European Union" (p. 370). In Ottomentality: neoliberal governance of culture and neo-ottoman management of diversity, Erdem (2017) proposes that currently, neo-Ottomanism is operated according to "market principles" and "involves the withdraw of the state's role as a provider of arts and culture to the public, transformation of the cultural sphere into a free market, and reduction of the state's intervention to ensure the functioning of the free market of culture" (p. 8). While doing so, AKP is stated to manage existing cultural diversity by "dividing the subjects into categorical, if not polarized, segments based on their cultural differences", resulting in categories such as "the pious and the secular, the moral and the degenerate, and the Sunni-Muslim-Turk and the ethno-religious minorities", based on everyday practices on preferences (p. 11).

According to Ayas (2016), popular music and arabesk, which were excluded by the left and right wing elites until 1980's, have now become the central, dominant culture. Today, the "elitist" tastes and "high culture" are the ones being excluded, regardless of them originating in the East or West (p. 367). He suggests that even intellectuals try to hide these tastes, and music sociologists are afraid of being accused of elitism, refraining from researching topics containing "high culture" elements (p. 367). He also points to a contradiction in the ruling conservative discourse that critiques the elitist culture, while also identifying with "strong Ottomanist tendencies" (p. 368). He suggests that the taste of the masses has never been a condition for cultural legitimacy in the Ottoman civilization, asserting that in Ottoman culture "the jury is not the public, as is often said today, but the musical public who have proven their musical taste and knowledge"(p. 368). This

contradiction highlights a shift in the cultural sphere where legitimacy is increasingly being imposed by the marketability of cultural products instead of artistic qualities.

In sum, the literature around cultural policies in Turkey reveals that music persistently remained as a critical tool for governing its subjects. Governments of opposing ideologies provided or retracted support for different genres through the years, affirming the tensions between divergent societal groups. While classical Western music was positively perceived as a gateway to modernity in the early years of the Republic, it slowly but surely lost its privileges in the upcoming decades, along with its supporters. This review of cultural policies aims to provide a useful lens with which to understand the experiences of the classically-trained conservatory graduates in Istanbul, whose unique position in the cultural sphere illustrates the relationship between shifting dynamics in the nation-building paradigms in Turkey and global trends of governance.

CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

3.1 Getting motivated

First of all, I would have to mention that this research topic remained very close to my heart, for a really long time. This was for two reasons, the first of which is that youth unemployment and underemployment, as well as resulting career changes, had been very personal issues for me and my peers, the infamous generation Y. I studied to be an architect in Istanbul and successfully graduated, only to go through a complete disillusionment with the construction sector, roughly one year after the Gezi protests. During this period, my interest in the field of sociology intensified, which led me to eventually decide to formally study it. One thing led to another, and eleven years later, I thankfully feel better that this has been the case.

The second reason behind my motivation to research young people's paths to employment, especially in the context of musicians, is that I grew up observing my younger sister's musical journey that began when she was in the 3rd grade. For more than twenty years, I have witnessed her, as well as her friends, practice endless hours, shed many tears, and spend a lot of money, in order to become conservatory trained classical musicians. I watched my sister switch instructors, cities, conservatories, take private lessons, buy expensive gear and collect many black stage outfits in her wardrobe over the years. After all of this effort, I was sad to see her move across the world, 14,620 kilometers away to be exact, for stable employment. It's been almost two years.

Of course, we are not the only ones who spent our childhoods studying to achieve a "bright future" that was glorified by our parents but simply never arrived.

Many people of our generation, and the one after us, are struggling to come to terms with the hand we'd all been dealt by the previous ones. As a result, I figured that researching for the steps that brought us here today, could help us make sense of what's still to come.

3.2 Reviewing literature

The literature review section of this study started taking shape in accordance with my initial questions about the classical music education and performance sectors. Although I was familiar with the field due to my personal experience of growing up with an aspiring classical musician, my sister, I was not fully aware that her experiences and employment problems were shared by a worldwide community of classical musicians. After achieving this understanding, I expanded my research to include a theoretical framework that centered around Foucault's concepts of biopolitics, subjectivity and governmentality that helped me conceptualize how classical musicians around the world, just like their peers in Istanbul, experienced a shift in their employment expectations, as well as their identities as professionals, that paralleled a global reduction of state support in arts.

Through Foucault's work and the literature on the employment of classical musicians around the world, I developed the assumption that the professional identities of conservatory graduates in Istanbul would also be shaped in accordance with the current market conditions, but wondered how their locality influenced their self conception. After this point, I looked into the history of classical music and conservatories in Turkey, and tried to make sense of the relationship between the changes in cultural policies and the development of professional self concepts of conservatory trained classical musicians. In the light of my literature review, I

prepared my interview questions with the intention of discovering the unique challenges of Istanbul's conservatory trained classical musicians and situating their experience within the broader themes around the process of subjectivation under neoliberal regimes.

3.3 Conducting interviews

For my fieldwork, I reached out to ten classically trained musicians who studied at either Istanbul University State Conservatory or Mimar Sinan Fine Arts University State Conservatory for a duration of their studies. Although this study is focused on the career building strategies of conservatory graduates, I included one participant who dropped out just one year before completing the undergraduate program and changed their career path, after having spent more than ten years in the conservatory. Four participants initially started their musical training in other cities and later transferred to Istanbul conservatories. One participant ultimately graduated from the musicology department after failing to pass their undergraduate entrance exam for the performance department. Two participants moved abroad after completing their studies and attempting to build their careers in Istanbul for multiple years, one of which also changed their career path upon leaving Istanbul. I made sure to include a broad range of stories in order to capture a diversity of paths taken by conservatory trained students. While eight participants of this study were working on building their careers and aged between 25 and 30 years old, two participants were above 35 years old; seasoned professionals with industry experience for more than 20 years. These two participants were included in order to learn about the changing dynamics and varying career paths in the classical music industry over the years. In the chapters that include narrations from my fieldwork, I refrained from sharing any

personal information about the participants, such as gender, age or institutional ties, to protect their identities, due to the small size of the classical music performance community and tight professional networks shared by the participants.

The interviews were conducted in Turkish, either in person or via online meetings, depending on the preference and availability of participants. Two participants attended online meetings due to having moved abroad, while six participants asked for this arrangement due to tight schedules. The interviews lasted between 45 and 90 minutes, and were semi structured. I prepared 15 questions to ask each participant, and added relevant questions depending on the personal stories of the participants. My standard set of questions regarded musicians ʾbeginnings in music, experiences in conservatories, professional endeavors, opinions about the classical music sector and the future of classical music in Turkey. I focused on understanding how each participant was transformed by their musical training, how they perceived their positions in their sector as individuals and what they thought of being classical musicians in contemporary society. The interviews were recorded upon permission from the participants, and later transcribed by the researcher.

3.4 Analysis & synthesis

After the interviews were conducted, recorded and transcribed in Turkish, they were coded by the researcher. After the coded segments were analyzed and grouped into sections that formed the basis of the thesis structure, selected interview transcripts were translated into English by the author, with careful attention to preserve the tone and demeanor embodied by each participant. The synthesis of the collected data was informed by the three-part literature review, whose main focus was on understanding the Foucauldian concepts of biopolitics, subjectivity and governmentality in order to

make sense of the career trajectories of conservatory graduates as they unfold under neoliberal policies both in Turkey and worldwide

CHAPTER 4

MUSICIAN AS STUDENT

4.1 Beginning music, picking instruments and entering conservatory

This part aims to explore the very beginnings of the process through which individuals are shaped into classical musicians. My fieldwork showed that each musician's story of becoming was deeply influenced by external forces that varied depending on the environments they found themselves in. The family they were born into, their neighborhood of residence, the institutions they were involved with and their gender all factored into how they were initially guided into the field of classical music. In order to trace these decisive moments of subjectivation my interviews started with me asking the participants how they got their start in music.

Although each participant had a different story to tell, an overarching theme was their early start. Each musician, either as a toddler or as a child (or a teenager in rare cases), was introduced to classical music under the guidance of their families. The instances of initiation revealed in my interviews included the participants attending a classical music concert with their families, observing parents or relatives playing their own instruments, or simply having their musical talent discovered by their loved ones and being directed into receiving informal music education provided by local music centers.

> Since it starts at very young age, your family puts you on that path, really. It's not like you can say "I will be a musician" or things like that at a young age. For example I started at age 11 but people start at age 6-7. Even 4 years old. Especially in Asia and Europe, they start at those ages and you don't really have too much of a say in this. (personal communication, Appendix A, 1)
>
> My family were musicians. My mom is a pianist and dad plays the flute. I happened to be constantly exposed since I was little. I used to go to ISSO concerts etc. We had a membership for every Friday, as a fun activity with my mom. (personal communication, Appendix A, 2)

Due to these external influences and their young age, many musicians ʼmemories were blurry regarding how they first decided they wanted to play an instrument, attend conservatory and become professional musicians. Although most participants of this study expressed contentment with being a musician, they also emphasized that "decision" was a strong word for their child selves. While some of them recalled being more informed and aware of the journey that awaited them upon being accepted into conservatory, some said they were simply going through the motions. The lack of information was most prevalent among those who had no other musicians in their family and the ones whose entrance to conservatory was coincidental rather than the result of a sustained, dedicated effort. Even then, the reasons behind their decision to attend conservatory and how they prepared for the entrance exams were largely affected by their family circumstances. While some participants prepared for the conservatory exam by being trained by the teaching staff of the same conservatory they wished to attend, others were trained either by private tutors or at the local music centers. One participant trained at a Fine Arts High School before enrolling at a conservatory at undergraduate level.

> So, perhaps I did not make a decision. I think we first need to discuss the decision making abilities of an 11-12 year old child. Honestly, I wasnʼt a very happy child at my home environment, and somehow I had started taking music lessons. I was taking piano lessons from a free municipal school. Then I started to get more into it. I tried to be more interested there than any other child would, like those who took it as a hobby (personal communication, Appendix A, 3)
>
> Actually I didnʼt start at an early age. You know I was born and raised abroad. When I was 15 an opportunity for fine arts came up. Because my father was trading in Istanbul and I because I liked Istanbul so much, I used to visit during vacations. I decided to follow a path like that. Really, my dad, being a musician, encouraged me too. I began classical music training in high school at 15. (personal communication, Appendix A, 4)

The participants expressed that for their parents, the reasons behind the decision to send their children to conservatories varied. Some parents wished to support their

children's interest in music, being guided towards conservatory education by the teachers or other professionals teaching their children. For some parents, who were already musicians themselves, conservatory was viewed as a natural path that their children could follow if they were talented and interested. A third category of parents wanted their children to play an instrument to either "embellish" their child's life (*hayatına renk gelsin diye*) or because they took pride in being a parent whose child could play instruments.

> Well, my mom directed me, I first started with part-time while I was abroad, I mean, I was living abroad until I was 18. Families there, for the sake of competing, like, "my child plays this and also this"… For the sake of this type of thing she sent me to music school. At least it led to something good. I mean, it led to me choosing my profession. But I wasn't too eager then, obviously. Umm, I was a bit bored. (personal communication, Appendix A, 5)
>
> I wasn't a playful or anything like that as a child, maybe, so with that, like, they enrolled me in the school that "it might bring some color to the kid's life". (personal communication, Appendix A, 6)

Like the decision to train at a conservatory, the selection of an instrument appears to be a critical but blurry step for a musician's life. The cultural environment they were introduced to by their families, the institutional requirements of conservatories and the traditional selection mechanisms and market conditions in the classical music field determined this major defining factor in the participants 'future professional paths. One participant talked about being drawn to the violin at four-and-a-half years of age, pointing at the violin section of the symphony orchestra and exclaiming to her mother "I want to be one of those girls who sit there!". While some participants described an aha moment of gravitating towards a specific instrument, some explained that the decision was influenced by "chance" or practical reasons, or even forgotten ones. These reasons consisted of the selection procedures at conservatories which were based on the applicant student's physical traits and instrument quotas for

each year. The number of players required for each instrument in a classical music orchestra was another important factor for the process of matching students with instruments.

Some participants explained that they happily agreed to play the instrument to which they were assigned, while some expressed that it took some time before an emotional connection was established. One participant revealed that the instrument never really grew on them and that they wished they had objected, but they were unaware of this being an option at the time. Another participant explained that they were advised to play the flute based on their physical traits, but they insisted on playing the violin as their love for the instrument paved their way into the conservatory in the first place.

> My family knew I had a good ear but of course having it as a sense is a separate issue. There was a separate issue of having aptitude for the instrument. We didn't have experience on that. Honestly, it started with me going to these concerts, liking violin so much and trying the conservatory exam. After I passed the exam I was selected to play the violin, you know, by luck. (personal communication, Appendix A, 7)

> I had said something, I had said "I want a violin". They had said "the flute". But because I wanted the violin so much, I stayed with it. If a child wants something so much, of course, no one tries to change that. But with a child who has no idea, you can look at his hands for example, gonna have big hands, he's tall and say "piano" like that, as if it's a rare thing. (personal communication, Appendix A, 8)

> However, I really wanted piano. Afterwards I didn't like the violin that much, in fact I didn't like it at all. But out of obligation I did it that way… Also I never even thought of insisting on piano. Like, cause my hands were small they guided me towards the violin, they said. But actually, they select violinists the most. Because the orchestras need violinists the most, they select violin students more often. They do things like, for example, select for violin and then they switch to viola or to the flute, those who were unsuccessful with violin. They first recommend violin to kids. (personal communication, Appendix A, 9)

Two recollections of instrument selection stood out for me in terms of their reasoning. One of them featured a boy who was asked to choose between the violin

and the piano at the local music center. The participant's mother wanted him to play the violin while his father preferred the piano instead. As he was keen on opposing his father's preferences at the time, he chose to play the violin as it was his mother's wish. The other story was of a girl who wasn't accepted into the piano class as it was full, and was told she could pick the violin if she didn't want to wait for an opening. The participant recalls that she would watch *Sihirli Annem* as a Turkish child living abroad, and agreed to play the violin because *Ceren* was taking violin lessons in the show. These examples were important because they revealed that the developmental stages of children and the popular culture influences in the media were also deciding factors in shaping the future of aspiring musicians and their subjectivities.

> I mean, I chose it myself really. They said piano or violin and since my mom wanted violin I chose that. Back then, I mean, my dad is a Galatasaray fan and I'm a Fenerbahce fan, there are parameters like that. So I sided with my mom more often. Therefore my mom wanted the violin. Dad said "play the piano". I did what mom wanted. That's why I'm playing the violin right now. (personal communication, Appendix A, 10)

> I mean, actually there weren't any seats left for me in piano, no seat with the teachers. "Instead of waiting on the substitute list, there's space in violin classes," they said and there was My Magic Mom back then, what was her name, Ceren I think? The girl, not Cilek, the other one. She was taking violin lessons in one episode, I remembered that. I said "OK," that's a bit of how I chose violin. (personal communication, Appendix A, 11)

Similar to their stories of being introduced to music, the participants 'conservatory exam preparation stage was largely shaped by parental guidance. For some musicians, who were essentially born into a world of music and fellow musicians, there was no dedicated preparation for the exam. They were already being trained on their respective instruments from an early age and the exams only marked the beginning of their formal education. Other musicians described a moment of decision in their musical journey where they were guided, either by experienced private tutors

or teachers from conservatories, into learning what it means to be a conservatory student and what it takes to become a classical music artist. Some participants share that they were prepared in less formal settings, such as free courses offered by the municipalities, and passed the exam with minimal effort.

> I had taken a few lessons, someone had come to give me theory lessons. A bassoon teacher in the conservatory, I forgot the name. I started there half time in fourth grade. (personal communication, Appendix A, 12)

> No, I didn't get prepped, it was an ordinary school offered by the Kadikoy Municipality. I was going to one class per week like a regular student. But I didn't have a prep period, I just went to the exam and passed. (personal communication, Appendix A, 13)

Some graduates revealed that their entrance to the conservatory was influenced by factors outside of their –or their family's– musical aspirations, though still closely related to family circumstances and institutional conditions. One participant mentioned that their family became bankrupt when they were around 11 years old, and therefore unable to keep paying her private school tuition, so they were asked by their parents to choose between public school and conservatory. Intimidated by the large and crowded classrooms, the participant then decided to switch to the conservatory where the environment felt different and free. Another participant reflected on their decision and stated that it was their unhappy home environment that influenced their decision to enter the conservatory, pointing to the fact that musical training at a conservatory required one to be away from their home for long periods of time, providing them a much-needed escape route at the time.

> I had no such plan (plan to attend conservatory). I just hated my primary school. So, at fifth grade, because I hated school, going to the conservatory simultaneously felt different, I had liked it. I felt more freedom. And I already really liked playing an instrument. I had written in my notebooks, like, being a pianist is my dream job etc. I mean I was dreaming about it. Also my parents had went bankrupt around that time. They said, "you'll either go to the conservatory or to public school. You can't go to private school anymore". Even though I hated private school, the public school felt too big

> to me, the classrooms were too crowded. I remember being a bit intimidated. I didn't like it. So instead I had decided to go to the conservatory. (personal communication, Appendix A, 14)

> I think in the background of this was the idea of being out of the house. I came to this conclusion after going to therapy as an adult. Turns out I had tried to run away from home. And conservatory was a perfect fit because you need to practice constantly. Even at times you don't have classes you are at school, which keeps you away from home. (personal communication, Appendix A, 15)

In addition to families, private tutors and mentors were found to be influential for musicians 'decision making processes that informed their future life paths. For one participant, it was their high school piano teacher at the fine arts high school who guided their decision to enter the conservatory. Even though they initially hoped to become a professional football player, the participant mentioned, thanks to their teacher's support and guidance, they loved playing their instrument so much that they let go of their dream of a career in sports and focused on music instead.

> I said yes, thinking, "I can maybe become a football player in Istanbul". I started fine arts that way but then I started to love music, I forgot about football. My piano teacher is a very good person and educator. I became immersed in music that way and forgot about football altogether. (personal communication, Appendix A, 16)

For musicians, which conservatory to attend was also a decisive factor influencing their future subjectivities as musicians. Istanbul University State Conservatory (IÜDK) and Mimar Sinan Fine Arts University Istanbul State Conservatory (MSGSÜDK) are the only state conservatories available to aspiring classical music artists in Istanbul, with the former being situated in the Anatolian side and the latter in the European side. Although some participants recited closer distance to home as an important criteria to consider, the teachers who prepared students for the conservatory exams also guided participants 'choices of which conservatory to attend. One participant mentioned that while they initially were preparing to try for a

place at the IÜDK, they were turned down for being “too late” to at the age of 11 when they went to the institution to apply for the exam with their mother. The participant was then redirected to the MSGSÜDK by the tutor who prepared them for the exam. Another participant recalls preparing and applying for the IÜDK as it was said to be the best option for a pianist at the time and their piano teacher usually directed his students there.

> First I was preparing for the Istanbul Conservatory. I went with my mom, to apply for the exam. They said "11 years old is too late, don’t bother". They said it’s too late and sent us away. Then when I started working with the teacher I told you about, they said "don’t go to Istanbul University, go to Mimar Sinan". I prepped and got in, I mean. (personal communication, Appendix A, 17)

> Back then it was said that Istanbul University State Conservatory was the best for the piano department. Or one of the best. And since my teacher in high school had sent a lot of people there and because I wanted to stay in Istanbul, I wanted to try that place. (personal communication, Appendix A, 18)

My fieldwork showed that the participants ’beginnings in musical training was influenced mainly by their families and trusted mentors as many of them were simply too young to decide on their own. Although each participant was involved in decision making to varying degrees, the decisions to attend conservatory or become a musician was unlikely to be described as a conscious decision by participants due to their young age and limited agency in making life altering choices. Likewise, the instrument selection process was dependent on a range of factors such as physical traits, institutional quotas, parental preferences, in addition to personal desires, and was also perceived as being coincidental by the participants. In this light, the family, the specialists guiding the initiation processes and the institution of conservatory itself can be identified as technologies of subjectivation that shape the individuals into future classical musicians that are tasked with fitting in a mold that is already mapped out for them to fill through years of hard work, devotion and discipline.

4.2 The conservatory education model and learning environment

For the purpose of examining one of the major mechanisms that inform the development of a musical subjectivity, this part will explain in detail the conservatory model of education in Turkey, which is distinct from the standard formal education model in many ways. First, it is important to mention that the students have the option to study part time or full time in Istanbul's conservatories. A student has the option to continue their formal studies in the standard model and attend conservatory part time, leading to the acquisition of a different type of music diploma and a different set of skills than if they had studied full time. Second, the conservatory teaching model resembles an apprenticeship. Students are selected by instrument instructors based on their physical traits, and sometimes their personal interest in the instrument, and they are expected to start and continue their training with the same instructor until they leave or graduate. In other words, a student can begin their training in the first grade and work with the same instructor until they graduate from the institution's PhD programme.

> Every year and term a personal education is designed for you. I mean, it's a great thing for your musical development. That, of course, if you happen to have a good teacher. If the teacher is really eager, if you get along, if you like the teacher and the instrument… If everything goes well, a really good education can be received. (personal communication, Appendix A, 19)

The conservatory education model brings with it unique advantages and challenges that play an important role in the development of a musician's subjectivity, the greatest of which is attributed to the quality of individual instructors. The participants of this study highlighted the importance of learning from a "good instructor" (*iyi hoca*) as a determinant of a successful technical development in their instruments, as well as the longevity of their studies in their institutions. The "good

instructor" can help build a solid technical foundation, as well as mold the student into a disciplined, successful musician while a "bad instructor" will kill the student's spirit and take the joy out of music, even leading the student to quit music in some cases.

> Which teacher do you have? It's the biggest matter of luck, cause, the teacher is like your parents for the instrument. It has an effect on everything. If you'll develop stage fright later, it's for this reason. I don't know, not knowing how to practice is everyone's biggest issue. It's a great loss. And you learn that from your teacher. The time you can save if you're taught how to plan and practice on your first day… And the hours and years you lose practicing without knowing these… (personal communication, Appendix A, 20)

> I believe I had a very valuable teacher. If we're talking about education in this interview, we will have to talk about teachers a lot. I think both technically regarding violin, and psychologically, teachers are the most important, I think. (personal communication, Appendix A, 21)

A "good instructor" attracts students like a magnet, and is a reason for envy amongst conservatory students. They also may get to pick the "good students", although this is not expressed explicitly. Due to the difference in instructors 'teaching styles and resulting outcomes, the participants mentioned a constant comparison between instructors and students alike. In the conservatory culture, an instructor and their students form small cliques within the institution, and these cliques are in a not-so-silent competition. Even the students of the same instructor are compared with each other, because the curriculum remains unchanged for many years and all students perform the same classical pieces throughout their studies. Although the perpetual state of competition was described as a motivating factor by some participants, most of them recited this fact as the most challenging part of conservatory education.

> In the end, I'm not the only pianist. You're always in competition with other pianists. And the teachers… compare students inevitably. Even among their own students they do it, I mean. It doesn't have to be with students of other teachers. The repertoire hadn't changed for years when I was there. Since

> most students play the same pieces, there is a comparison naturally. But the person isn't evaluated as an individual. It's more like "how does this one play compared to the other one?" (personal communication, Appendix A, 22)

The participants also highlighted monitoring practices as an intrinsic part of the conservatory experience. In addition to closely tracking the students 'duration and efficacy of technical practice, the instructors paid focused attention to their general appearance, style choices, friendships and demeanor. Some instructors also stayed in contact with the students 'parents to keep them in the know, especially but not exclusively when they were still young, so the feeling of being inspected accompanied the students at all times. Moreover, senior students from the instructor's instrument class would observe and listen to the younger students as they practiced in the rooms or the corridors, interrupting them to correct their postures or playing styles. This surveillance mechanism was described to be effective for technical development as well as an atmosphere of seriousness, but often left students having to deal with high expectations and constant criticism.

> At the same time, it's a destructive education filled with trauma where often the baby is thrown out with the bathwater. For one thing, it's not something you expect. Suddenly your life is filled with people expecting things no one has expected from you before. And it's not even just your teachers, it's your upperclassmen… Say, you're practicing in the corridor, another older violinist interferes. "You played that too high, play this part like this, that part like that, you're holding it this way, be careful etc." (personal communication, Appendix A, 23)

> You're under constant surveillance from older students, and say they saw you somewhere… you find out you're ratted out to your teacher. (personal communication, Appendix A, 24)

The conservatory curriculum is explained to be divided between "music classes" and "culture classes". According to the participants, the music classes such as the instrument, music theory and auxiliary piano lessons were taken more seriously

while the culture classes such as maths, literature, history and English could be sidelined by the music classes. As a result, conservatory students were expected to spend most of their time perfecting their performance while they felt less competent in other areas in comparison to their peers in standard formal education. Due to this prioritization, many participants emphasized that deciding to train at a conservatory full-time required courage to navigate the risks of choosing one's profession at a young age and dedication to stick with their decision to become musicians. One participant shared that their mother, who is a musician herself, wanted her child to stay in the standard system and continue conservatory part time until undergraduate level so that their child could develop English-speaking skills and have the opportunity to pick an area besides music if they wished to. Another participant mentioned that some of the part-time conservatory students who were able to sustain both their musical development and standard formal education until high school ended up highly successful and often went abroad to continue their musical training at the undergraduate level. While that is the case, it is important to mention that the opportunity to remain a part-time student is not available at all conservatories, and students have to transition to full time at a certain age at some institutions.

> That's what we're saying, yes. Musical classes and cultural classes. Cultural classes are everything you already need to learn. But they were sending us university professors if I remember correctly. And they had, with our teachers, some conflict. Like, "this child needs to practice the violin," and the other is saying, "she doesn't know math", "she needs to study more", or, "she needs to learn piano". The other one says, "she hasn't learned English yet." It's a system out of touch with normal life. Actually all should be equally important. (personal communication, Appendix A, 25)

> Istanbul University and Mimar Sinan, you start both as a part-time student with theory and instrument classes until some point, and schools can differ where this is, there can be a point where they say, "you are obligated to go full-time from now on". Istanbul University didn't have that limit but then they give you a different diploma. It's not the same as the one we received. It's more like a certificate. It can still be really good. There are many

> examples at Istanbul University. Very smart, very talented… A lot of them going abroad and such. Actually I think it's a good thing they're doing it this way. Most probably they're starting very young and part-time as well, but unlike us, study for regular high school and prepare for university exams. They choose their own fields during this time. But for us, if you're in 8th grade and say I can't do this anymore, there's nothing you can do. I mean, of course there can be some way to reroute. But the conservatory student would need a lot of extra time and education to catch up with people from outside the conservatory. It's almost impossible to switch to regular high school. We have nothing like the exams everyone else takes. Our cultural classes are, how should I put it, like, non-existent. (personal communication, Appendix A, 26)

> Afterwards I was accepted into the conservatory, I went part-time. Even the reason my mom didn't want to send me full-time is so that I can learn a language. Since foreign language skill is very important, they don't teach it very well at conservatories, sadly. Therefore I went part-time throughout high school. (personal communication, Appendix A, 27)

The conservatory education model, in the form that was revealed by the participants of this study, directed students to focus on their musical development to the detriment of other skills and conditioned them into adopting mannerisms that ensured their conformity to the values upheld by the classical music tradition through collective monitoring and correcting interventions. By dividing students into small, manageable sections and comparing them with each other, and with the help of students themselves as observers of others, the conservatory as an institution is able to produce the desired type of musician subjectivity that is answerable to the requirements of the classical music field, especially in the presence of a "good instructor". Though, for the students lacking this proper guidance, the road to success was revealed to be rockier. The next three parts will describe the ways in which the participants struggled during their musical education process, and what they identified to be the particular reasons behind their struggles.

4.3 Technical challenges

For the participants, the ideal conditions for the production of a successful classical music performer are created by introducing the individual to musical education at a young age, with a "good instructor" and the right technique and instrument that is suitable for their physical traits, under supportive and well-informed parental guidance with plenty of opportunities to observe live classical music performances. That being said, most participants of this study found themselves lacking regarding these criteria, in one way or another. The only participant who could tick all of these boxes was a musician whose parents were classical musicians willing to guide their child into this path, and they were born in a major city with an active classical music scene.

The participants were in agreement that improper technique taught to students at the beginning of their musical education leads to a delayed development as well as physical injuries, even when their technique is corrected at a later stage of their training. More than one participant shared that they had to relearn even how to hold their instruments when they eventually switched schools or instructors, highlighting the importance of starting out the "right way". This adversity was mostly attributed to bad luck, leading to the students of the "good instructors" being called the "lucky ones".

> We weren't aware of anything. How serious what we're doing is, how much we need to practice, how serious life is, you don't know, at least, we didn't use to. What we were doing was like going to school to play a game. It had become that aimless. I think my dad noticed this when I was in third year of high school. In reality, my whole class was the same way. And a lot of responsibility falls on the families in this regard. Because they don't know anything. If you aren't from a musician family, you have no control over that education. You have no way to understand what's happening to your child. It was, therefore, an event of good fortune for me. At the third year of high school in Istanbul, I started extra private lessons. Then I noticed I didn't know

> anything. It was like I began playing the violin all over again. Back to fourth grade. Of course, everything was renewed starting from my grip. I suspended school for a year. Then I continued, this time at a conservatory in Istanbul. On the other hand, there are these people, in fourth grade, as an example, who started with the same teacher I had in high school. They are very lucky. An education that could be really good can turn into a disaster if you lose control of it. (personal communication, Appendix A, 28)

> So, if a violin teacher isn't holding sessions, but there's also the syllabus they need to go through… but they aren't doing sessions. They end up teaching it half-assed as a result. They didn't teach me proper grip. Say, my left hand, I learned how I should hold it much later. I used to put my hand flush against the violin and my wrist really hurt. I learned how to hold it, later. Or the bow, say, you need to make a certain movement and we used to pull it like a stick. They never taught us technical things like these. When you begin with these technical difficulties, without technical competency, you can't practice pieces. You are unable to. You play poorly. You play very poorly. (personal communication, Appendix A, 29)

For "unlucky" participants who started playing without proper technical guidance and in a substandard learning environment, making up for the lost time required private lessons and added practice hours. If the students 'parents were unaware of their challenges or struggled to provide the financial means to take additional measures, the gap between the proficiency levels of "lucky ones" supported by "conscious parents" and "good instructors", and the "unlucky" ones would widen every day.

> Let me put it like this, back then there was this girl. She was in fifth or fourth grade, let's say. Part time prepping for full time. She was, say, playing the violin for one or two years, I mean, she was new. I was in the last year of high school. She was producing so much better sound with the violin than I did. And the teacher was saying to me, "look at her tone, the sound coming from her violin". Technique. It's entirely about technique. (personal communication, Appendix A, 30)

Meanwhile, late-starters in the private conservatories were depicted as hopeless cases by nearly all participants. In fact, it was stated that it would be an instrument instructor's duty to inform the student of their very slim chances of succeeding.

> Now, the students there began playing the violin at18 years old. 18 is very late, very very very late and I don't want to appear unfair to those friends there, and I told them this, I mean, "late, you started very late. We'd like to help but if you really want to be a violinist, you need to have a problem". "If you are obsessed with playing, you can do it", and it's very difficult, I mean. I think I was honest with them. I didn't sell a pipe dream. I didn't say "you'll become an extraordinary violinist". I didn't even tell them they would become a good violinist. I made them see how difficult the road would be if they chose to go along, in a polite way I learned from my own education. Because, I don't think people who struggle psychologically are very happy. (personal communication, Appendix A, 30)

Throughout the study, the participants expressed that being a performer is strenuous physical work, as well as mental. Many pointed out that the lack of music physiologists in Istanbul's conservatories, who are specialists that work with musicians to help prevent or assist with physical injuries, sometimes led students to develop long term health problems due to incorrect posture or repetitive movements. Although some instrument instructors were reported to be more informed about anatomy and would better advise their students about correct playing postures for their body type, the participants of this study emphasized the need for such specialists for musicians to prevent long term injuries and avoid health problems. One participant mentioned that the "Alexander technique" is taught in many music schools around the world to improve musicians 'performances but currently is lacking in Turkish conservatories.

> First few years, for example, I played without a shoulder rest. It's a very difficult thing. I mean, I had a lot of pain. I have a very long neck, it's impossible. And the distance between my neck and shoulder is very short. I'm forced to keep my shoulder too far up so that I can hold the violin, which leads to injuries. Even though I haven't had them, there are many who have physical issues. That's because there is no physical education for musicians that teaches musicians 'health, the correct posture etc., things like the Alexander method. None of it exists in Turkey. (personal communication, Appendix A, 31)
>
> The education we received abroad wasn't, I mean, very rigorous. I mean, when I came here, with the orchestra, chamber music and because I changed

> my violin technique, I had something like fibromyalgia. I don't know the exact definition, it was never diagnosed. I struggled a lot to overcome that. It was most apparent during the orchestra. I went to things like physical therapy. That seemed to work. Of course because I kept playing since it's my life, it became chronic. Now I live with that pain. In fact I'm so used to it, I can't imagine how it would be without it. (personal communication, Appendix A, 32)

> Abroad, since this is a very physically demanding work, you work with physiotherapists. There's special physiotherapy for this. Say a violin physiotherapist, the school has that. Violin students see that person. Like, the school has that kind of support. I… had some edema in my elbows. It was very painful. I had pain all over, really. Scoliosis, cervical disc herniation are things we all have. The teacher doesn't provide any support with this. You see a physiotherapist, who doesn't understand the work you're doing. One of them told me to start swimming, and I told my teacher, "I have a lot of back pain and I was told to swim". He replied, "swimming will also tire you out. Instead, practice your violin more". (personal communication, Appendix A, 33)

As the participants emphasized, the lack of proper guidance manifested as physical injuries as well as the loss of precious time required to develop correct playing techniques. The students without the necessary resources felt frustrated and left behind in comparison to their peers who enjoyed skillful support, and this comparison by the participants, at times, even exceeded the limits of their families, instructors and institutions, reaching the level of national policies. They regretted the unavailability of specialists and technical know-how they needed to have access to, in order to excel in their fields globally.

4.4 Physical challenges

Even the whereabouts of the participants 'institutions, in addition to their places of residence, were discussed in the interviews as being vital to the musical development of students, as well as their education and career trajectories. In Istanbul conservatories' case, the distance to major performance halls was decisive. The graduates of the IÜDK mention the perks of having studied within a walking

distance to the Süreyya Opera (*Süreyya Operası*), where MSGSÜDK graduates were situated closer to the Cemal Reşit Rey Concert Hall (*CRR Konser Salonu*). The participants mentioned that they could attend the shows free of charge when they were not completely sold out, and the performances were indispensable in terms of setting examples and familiarizing themselves with the art scene in Istanbul. Meanwhile, the participants who began their studies in Bursa emphasized the lack of an established classical music orchestra and the narrow scale of the cultural industry in the city as a detriment to their musical development.

> The location was very good. Say, there's a concert. Sureyya Opera is right there. You can take the ferry to CRR. AKM is close by. But now the school has moved to Maltepe. (personal communication, Appendix A, 34)

> Since Ankara is the city where the republic was founded, they took art institutions into account. When the republic was founded, these institutions were created and they wanted the populace to attend plays, operas and symphonies here. In Istanbul, due to the imperial tradition, the Sultans in the 1800s would bring foreign operas, foreign composers. In the name of westernization, there were performances like these. As a result, people would go to these. In Europe, this is a bit like, entertainment for people. I mean, people go to a Mozart concert as entertainment. Buy a ticket and go, I mean, a poor person can also go there. Or a poor person can go to a Shakespeare play. The aim here, too, was to set up an arts environment the average person can access. Especially in Ankara. For example, the Presidential Symphony Orchestra was founded for this reason. The existing Muzika-i Humayun was converted to the Cumhurbaşkanlığı Senfoni Orkestrası (Presidential Symphony Orchestra). It was taken really seriously. Something supported by the leaders. Inonu, for example, went to CSO concerts every week. Every week. I mean, he had a regular seat at least. Otherwise, Sultans in Istanbul had initiatives like those I talked about. Sultans themselves engaged in composition etc. This is something brought by westernization. But in Bursa… when you look at Bursa, this doesn't exist. The environment isn't there. Bursa is more like outdoors socialization. Picnics, nature walks, having home guests… This type of thing happens in Bursa. Going to an indoor space to have an event is rare in Bursa. That tradition doesn't exist. As a result, there's no theater, symphony etc. (personal communication, Appendix A, 35)

The unavailability of practice rooms was stated to challenge students as well. One participant mentioned that their conservatory did not have nearly enough rooms for

all students to practice, so some would have to play in the corridors or restrooms, if their living arrangements did not allow them to practice at home.

> Conditions in the school were very bad but it didn't bother me. We lived in a family building so if I couldn't find a room at school I could just practice at home whenever I wanted. Nobody complained. But for other people… I remember this was a very big issue. There's not enough room, people practicing in the bathroom and such, in corridors but can't do it at home. Neighbors make a fuss. So I didn't really have a problem. And that's pure luck, the family apartment. Otherwise the conditions at school weren't great. (personal communication, Appendix A, 36)

We can see that even having access to practice rooms was experienced as a challenge and a matter of luck by the students in the conservatory setting. The students who had to practice wherever was available found it much harder to focus, leading to their practice hours being spent less efficiently. The students who were able to quickly reach performance halls after school were more likely to attend live performances, while students from outside of major cities struggled to even observe the organizations they would one day be expected to perform in. Similar to the case of high quality instructors and institutions, the inequality of access into cultural environments was cited as an important barrier to the desired subjectivation of classical musicians.

4.5 Emotional challenges

The process of becoming a classical musician through a strict mode of training and surrounded by the high expectations of one's environment was generally not without psychological cost to its aspirants. All participants described the emotional hardships arising from the difficulties of sustaining long term interpersonal relationships within a close-knit, high pressure learning environment as a major challenge. These

problems were also cited as the leading cause of dropping out, or even quitting music altogether, among conservatory students.

> The work we do is like a master-apprentice relationship in the end. We don't have classes in lecture halls like other university departments. We are one on one with our teacher and communication in that human relationship is very important. When there's a psychological pressure from the other side, it becomes unpleasant, and it's a captive relationship in a way. It's not friendship. Most times you don't have the option to say "this isn't good for me, I quit." (personal communication, Appendix A, 37)

> I can say these hardships were entirely created by the teachers. It was unbelievably hard, I got unbelievably traumatized. I mean, I should've quit that school after that first year. I absolutely shouldn't have been pulled out of that school. I mean, it's that serious, the constant bullying, treatment verging on insult, constant humiliation during lessons. He was a vile person who said anything he could think of unrelated to the lesson, things like what I was wearing, how I looked, why I didn't do my eyebrows, nonsense about my parents having come from a village, calling them rural etc. I can say it loud and clear. He was a straight up bully. (personal communication, Appendix A, 38)

My fieldwork showed that at the heart of these emotional challenges was the students 'relationship to their instrument instructors. The participants mentioned having considered their instructors as their mentors, bosses, or even parental figures that they had to please, in order to stay afloat in the education system and ultimately achieve their goal of being a successful musician.

> Like I said, my mother would call my teacher every week, "how was this week, how was today?" My teacher also called my mother. They became almost like friends on the phone, always talking about me, and I knew they were always talking about me, I mean, what kind of pressure is that? It's something like, "have you managed to make them happy this week," every week. (personal communication, Appendix A, 39)

> Generally they're someone who knows everything, maybe closer than your mother and father. But how should I put it? It's like a babysitter perhaps. Because they really look after you. You're in the same school for five days and they're your teacher. You're under their watchful eye all the time. Your friendships are surveilled, are you smoking? What did you wear? How are your other classes? Are you respectful to other teachers? How do you sit and get up? Are you crawling on the floor in recess? I don't know, everything

> about you is picked apart by this person. After a point you become the same person for real. I mean the same haircut… students become a bit identical to their teachers. This is very interesting. Because you spend too much time together. You spend more time with that person than your own parents. "The teacher can make or break you," you could say. (personal communication, Appendix A, 40)

The instructors are viewed as having extremely high expectations of their students, especially considering that the beginning of these relationships date way back to when they were children. Most participants admit that they struggled with having to endure seemingly constant criticism and eventually internalized their instructor's negative comments as personal failings, leading to confidence issues as well as a perfectionist mindset.

> The other day I was discussing this with my partner. I think this exists in music education too. I keep observing that big names, people much more successful than we are pay a bigger price. This is not easy. Spending so much time with an instrument, trying to become this professional. And we have this in our education at the end of the day. You practice for hours and go to class, and the violin teacher there has to tell you what isn't working. (personal communication, Appendix A, 41)

> We had something called the day before class. The day before class, you can't sleep. Because you don't know what the next day will be like. Even if you practiced a lot you as if it'll be okay. Once that psychology set in, despite spending 8 hours every day in practice, you'd become unable to do things you could, wondering what the teacher will say this time. You'd think "how do I get out without being scolded?" We weren't looking at the end of year exams, or how to finish this piece… How do we survive the next session? After that, we're fine for another six days, or however many days until the next one. We had the mindset to deal with the next session somehow. All of us had that. I mean, I can safely say this for my immediate circle. (personal communication, Appendix A, 42)

> I don't like being asked questions. I become stressed. For example, when the director asks for me, I go to their room in a panic. Other can go in like, "what's up", but it's a big thing for me. I think this is performance anxiety. Always surveilled and evaluated. Being unable to make mistakes. When I have to send an email I think is important, I show it to everyone one by one. Maybe they aren't happy with this at all. It's a disadvantage, really. Because, maybe it means you aren't confident. There's some perfectionism. Cause you're working to make everything perfect since you're 8. Those two notes in a piece, I don't know, 300 times back to back, "oh, it's still not perfect, let me

> make it perfect, let me play it again and it'll be better". Thinking like this I can exaggerate and overcomplicate even simple things. (personal communication, Appendix A, 43)

The participants attributed these outcomes to the known lack of pedagogical training of their instrument instructors, emphasizing that in the Turkish conservatory education model the same instructor teaches multiple students in their class whose ages may range from 8 to 25+, sometimes in the same day, leading the instructors to experience difficulties in adapting their teaching style according to the learning needs of their students.

> I think the hardest part of conservatory education is working one on one with a teacher from a very young age. The fact that the teachers didn't have any pedagogy. They didn't know how to teach a child at all. All they know is being a performer of the instrument, really. The man has a master's student but also a fifth grader. He doesn't know how to approach different age groups. (personal communication, Appendix A, 44)

The participants also mentioned that many instructors maintained an environment of competition in their class, pitting students against each other expecting a surge in their practice motivation. Furthermore, this push for constant competition is stated to exceed the limits of the instructors 'own classes, affecting the whole institution. In other words, instructors of the conservatory also seemed to compete with one another. While many participants found this method to be psychologically damaging, some expressed that it contributed to a sense of camaraderie within the instructor's class.

> That's one of the things my teacher got wrong. They used to try to make us compete. We would go in, say, to pick up a belonging and suddenly praises out of nowhere… Or when they come to my session they would listen, making these faces. (personal communication, Appendix A, 45)

> In my class they tried to train everyone like soloists, as if everyone would be able to do that. When one can't, it's devastating for them, obviously. Because there's someone who was able to do it right next to you. There's of course another who cannot do it at all. He sees their devastation. Feels empathy

> towards them. On the other hand he sees the happiness and the spoiling of the successful one. There's those who spoil their students, even though my teacher never did that to me. Too much flattery, making them seem bigger than they are. (personal communication, Appendix A, 46)

> (Among students) there's no competition. You're with the same teacher even, "oooh, we have the same teacher." "Solidarity!" "We have to be very good!" "We're the greatest!" motivating each other and uniting forces. Like a big family or something. (personal communication, Appendix A, 47)

Many participants revealed having felt humiliated, incompetent and inferior among their peers facing their instructor's harsh comments in the classroom. One participant even expressed that they were in disbelief when their achievements were recognized during an exchange programme in Europe, and pleasantly surprised that they were offered constructive criticism in a respectful manner instead of the destructive style of communication they had come to get used to.

> I was really surprised here. I came to attend the exam. And that feeling of inferiority was ingrained so much in two years in Turkey… I thought I couldn't play when I first came here. I went through the exam, the teachers all congratulated me. I saw reactions I wasn't used to. And all constructive criticism, when something didn't work out. Normally I'm used to different reactions, and I'm surprised when I see a rather positive reaction here. And once you get used to it, it motivates you to practice and work, and it strengthens interpersonal relations too. (personal communication, Appendix A, 48)

Even when a participant considered themselves "lucky" for working with a "good instructor" who treated them with respect, they were not exempt from the negative effects of institutional gossip and being brought down by others, which was identified by participants as a general condition of being a conservatory student.

> Some things cannot be discussed. For example, it's my graduation exam, the part-time graduation exam. It was June and my teacher was in the jury, but they weren't in the jury on the exam the following month. And people who congratulated me, who said "you played like a master's student" the previous month said completely different things for the same repertoire. And not only to me. And being told things I didn't do… I was a bit shocked. It's a small world, and people do these things and look each other in the face. (personal communication, Appendix A, 49)

One participant went as far as to suggest that conservatories, like engineering departments, resort to methods of “psychological torture” in order to ensure a certain level of professional competence in their graduates. Although nearly all participants took pride in their strong work ethic, relentless determination and ability to stay disciplined, many admitted to ending up as highly self-critical individuals who are usually dissatisfied with their own performance.

> I have a psychologist friend, in fact. They told me this about engineers and about us. They call this psychological torture training. You’ll spend hours and hours, go to class but still, surely, hear a lot of negativity. That’s the correct thing by the way. I mean, if you give out too much satisfaction, the student can feel they’re too good and slow down their development. You have to balance this somehow. I thin in conservatory training, in violin training, all the really good teachers expect a very serious discipline because they know that’s how this is done. And this discipline, of course, isn’t easy. I mean for no one. It’s highly difficult for someone who lacks discipline. Therefore, honestly, it wasn’t an easy education. (personal communication, Appendix A, 50)

> So I became someone with a lot of self criticism, noticing what I couldn’t do a lot more than what I could, like, that’s also wrong. A person should feed on what they can do, we should value those too. (personal communication, Appendix A, 51)

Perhaps the most distinctive and taxing aspect of the conservatory education is the early exposure to the concept of “professionalism” that is required of classical musicians of all ages, which was usually mentioned in the interviews alongside concepts such as responsibility, discipline, requirement and obedience. One participant shared their memory of summer vacations, reminiscing that their mother would not allow them to play outside with other children until mandatory practice time was over, as their weekly meetings with their “good instructor” wouldn’t really pause in summer.

> She said, "you’re talented but you have a serious shortcoming". She said, "you aren’t playing like a professional." And I asked what it means to play

> like a professional. Apparently I didn't have enough knowledge to understand that criticism. She said that it is a package. She said, "I recommend you something and you're able to do it immediately but you really should be able to find these yourself. During your practice, you should've been able to identify what I recommended and worked on it. If you need to practice for 7 hours to accomplish something, you should be practicing for 7 hours that evening instead of eating pizza with your friends. That's what professionalism is." (personal communication, Appendix A, 52)

> Summer was approaching. My teacher kept holding sessions throughout summer. I wasn't allowed outside before I practiced for at least 3 hours. My friends were playing in the yard, I could hear them. I would put the violin down and listen to them. In that moment I can't improve my violin. Nope, it's impossible. Even today, at my age, if I feel that same emotion I wouldn't be able to, despite all my experience. (personal communication, Appendix A, 53)

Not being able to play freely as a child, or being "too free" to the detriment of their future prospects seems to have left some participants regretful, either for feeling unable to enjoy their childhood to the full extent, or not having the structure they needed to excel at their profession.

> We were told, "ride a bicycle, go swimming and do no other sports. Do not play basketball." I was short, I wanted to play basketball. No, the ball will hit your hand, something will happen to your finger. But despite that, they would take our football away and we would play with a plastic bottle. We fought it but fighting this is in itself an abrasive thing for a child. Every time they came and took our ball we were enthusiastically playing in the middle of our match. We would just look at each other. You do that to me and now I don't want to practice the violin for you, when you do that. It's like, you're restricted in every way. (personal communication, Appendix A, 54)

> The session time would pass and it would be, "come tomorrow," "let's do this on Thursday," things like that, and our sessions would get cancelled all the time. And we would drink chocolate milk in the cafeteria cause our lesson was cancelled, and we didn't practice either. If there's no one expecting a performance, you don't practice. Because classes weren't happening, and we weren't practicing… I mean, if we had spent those times at least practicing, we could be improving more. We weren't improving. (personal communication, Appendix A, 55)

The conservatory experience was characterized by participants to be a strict learning environment that aims to develop a high level of technical competency and instill a

strong sense of discipline in their students from an early age. The graduates ' narratives showcased that some students were perceived as being luckier than others for learning from better instructors and thriving in the system while others felt burdened by a sense of inadequacy due to constant criticism and competing against one another. Either way, their conservatory training left graduates with long lasting effects that carried on in their professional and personal lives. The participants who started off their musical journey as children without the autonomy and the level of maturity to make calculated decisions about their futures were shaped into disciplined subjects dedicated to excelling in their professions regardless of the psychological and economic costs they may have to bear in the future.

CHAPTER 5

MUSICIAN AS PROFESSIONAL

5.1 Professional experiences of conservatory graduates

This chapter will begin by touching upon the professionalization processes of conservatory-trained classical musicians, which is a central theme of this research as well as an important pillar of the subjectivation of conservatory graduates. In three parts, I will explore how the participants as students were socialized into professional settings in their training years, how they experienced the intricacies of the job market after graduating and why some musicians decided to opt out of their careers in music after years of hard work and preparation.

5.1.1 Before graduation

Training as a musician starting from an early age allows conservatory students to embark on their future careers long before most of their peers in standard formal education do, setting them apart in terms of when they start experiencing professional environments and expectations. When reflecting on their professional experiences, most participants mentioned that they started getting paid work opportunities years before actually graduating, but felt as though they were a professional musician even earlier. They described attending masterclasses and performing at the end of these workshops as the beginning stages of their professionalization processes. During these events, they would have the opportunity to meet, and learn from, the most sought after musicians in the classical music scene, and get together with their peers from other cities and conservatories. One participant who started their musical training outside of Istanbul mentioned that attending a

masterclass was how they knew they were "lagging behind" their peers in their musical development.

> This, as an example, I went to a masterclass. This in itself isn't much, but this is how it works. You go to a masterclass and get a workshop from a foreign or Turkish master, like, someone who has reached a certain point in their career. Then summer camp happens, you go to that. You, again, don't get paid but get into an interactive thing with people doing their own things, people from other cities and countries. Within the scope of the masterclass you have a concert too, meaning, you gain some stage experience. (personal communication, Appendix A, 56)

> When we went to the masterclasses, we were shocked seeing how other kids were playing. Our school almost didn't hold any classes. However, because whole school was like that, I mean, lagging behind, nobody was aware that it should've been better. But later, seeing how kids coming from Hacettepe, Mimar Sinan… I don't know, Cukurova, Mersin, all of those places other than our conservatory were playing... even kids from Eskisehir were playing so much better. And we were shocked. Then we were like, "these [people] are doing some different things. I think our teachers are really bad." (personal communication, Appendix A, 57)

Meeting their peers and comparing themselves with their levels of musical achievements allowed the students to feel and act as though they were already competing with fellow job-seekers in a future marketplace. In other words, the environment students experienced while attending masterclasses operated as an ideal setting for them to internalize the norms and standards of classical music performance and later optimize their skills and behaviours accordingly through self-surveillance and discipline. Another similar stage of musicians 'professionalization process was participating in musical competitions. Like the masterclasses, these organizations would provide a stage where young musicians to showcase their competence, compare their development with that of others, and even start making a name for themselves if they did well. Success in these competitions would also lead to other performance, training or travel opportunities, instilling in students the necessity of constantly investing in themselves to reap benefits later.

> You also go to auditions and competitions. I participated in 4 competitions. I came second in one, or more like shared first place. I came third in two of them. I was very young for one of them, I got eliminated. After competitions, you slowly kinda make a name for yourself. I mean, among your peers at school start to mumble your name. "Oh, you're that person," or something like that can happen. Then I got in an orchestra, a youth orchestra once again, going on tour abroad. That was my first international experience, and I received my first stipend there. I don't remember my age but it was 2013. Netherlands, Germany, Belgium, it was that sort of tour. In terms of cadre, quality, level it was very enjoyable, obviously. I mean, the woman who was head violinist in that orchestra works at Berlin Philharmonics today. It's a very valuable thing. It's really nice to have that kind of connections in music. (personal communication, Appendix A, 58)

Playing in the school orchestras as part of the curriculum, along with other youth orchestras and chamber orchestras, were other ways for students to experience performing with others in a professional setting. However, one participant was careful to mention that these experiences did not really reflect the experience level required for playing at a professional orchestra, referring to the additional social and technical dynamics intrinsic to performing as a paid professional.

> I mean, there's serious differences between what you need to do in professional life and what you learn in school for us. A violinist who graduated top of their class can turn into a fish out of water when they join an orchestra, because they haven't grasped those dynamics, they only have a grasp of playing the violin. (personal communication, Appendix A, 59)

Freelance work was another way for students to learn how to be a professional musician while earning themselves extra allowance. They would tutor younger students privately or at the local music centers, play at opening ceremonies, weddings, hotel lobbies and the like. One participant recalls singing a jingle with his classmates for a TV commercial. They mentioned they were contacted by the tutor who prepared them for the conservatory exam, highlighting the importance of these early connections that later evolved into professional networks. Another participant highlighted their anticipation to perform professionally while still training at the

conservatory, citing their "professional education" as a reason for being excited to find a gig as a student.

> I think I was 12 or so, which must've been my second year in conservatory, my teacher who prepped me for conservatory called one day and said, "they're looking for child voices for Istikbal kids 'room commercial. Gather a few people from your class, we'll record voices." We went and did vocals for Istikbal children's commercial. That's how I made my first money. I mean, obviously this isn't the beginning of a career or anything but it's a small start. (personal communication, Appendix A, 60)

> When you receive a very professional education you're a bit like, "I'm ready. Just give me a job." How you find it is the difficult part. But when I was in Istanbul University, professors came and said, "we're putting together a baroque orchestra, would you play? We'll do 1-2 concerts a week, or on the weekend in the church." I had accepted gladly. (personal communication, Appendix A, 61)

In light of these examples of early professionalization the conservatory students go through, we can see how an entrepreneurial logic is embodied within the subjectivities of classical musicians. The students already internalize the precarity of the market in recognizing that what's difficult is finding the job and not the doing part. The conservatories instill the discipline and the personal responsibility of working hard to develop technical skills as well as building their networks and personal reputations to access professional opportunities that will clearly be hard to come by in a withering, unstable market.

5.1.2 After graduation

Passing their final exams and receiving their undergraduate degree marks the beginning of the search for a stable income in a precarious market for conservatory graduates. Which opportunities would arise after graduation, just like at the beginning of their conservatory education, was mostly attributed to personal luck by

the participants. On the one hand, some graduates considered themselves fortunate for being able to audition for empty spots in the state orchestras, not even for securing them, as soon as they graduate, while they could still enjoy the fruits of their hard work and peak level of performance. On the other hand, some graduates were in despair as it was common knowledge that these auditions would not be available every year and some graduates would have to wait until next time, not knowing when that would be. In the meanwhile, the graduates mostly had to depend on irregular gigs and teaching opportunities, and many ended up choosing to continue graduate level training in conservatories with their instructors so that they can keep improving, or at least maintaining their technique, while staying connected to their professional circles. While state-funded jobs meant status and stability for the graduates, irregular jobs evoke a sense of insecurity and hardship for indefinite durations.

> I do have friends among extras, like, playing for all the singers. But that's also not guaranteed. I've been in an orchestra for about two years now. You can't prove to your family, to your community without some government position or something. In a way it was satisfying in that regard. I felt that for the first time. "Alright," I said, "I made it. It was worth it. All the struggle, all the fatigue was worth it." I'm where I want to be. I'm very happy as well. It was something I very much dreamed of. (personal communication, Appendix A, 62)

> In the end, these exams are held every four years. In those four years, new people are trained. With new musicians coming up, it becomes more difficult. It's because there are people who go into the exam straight out of school. That's when the test happens to be. It's entirely based on luck. Because they had practiced for graduation exams, they're warmed up, they have an advantage already. Age-wise they also have an advantage. Everyone prefers hiring a 20-25 year old instead of a 35-40 year old. When will the next exam be? Will I be over 30 by then? We don't know. We don't know what will happen. (personal communication, Appendix A, 63)

> Well, this type of exam is very rarely held. Someone has to be retiring or must have quit, changed organizations etc. (personal communication, Appendix A, 64)

Many participants without stable employment shared having struggled to make ends meet, relying on contract work and balancing multiple roles to stay afloat in Istanbul, where cost of living is high. They taught lessons and attended rehearsals in the day, performed at night, and played for commercial events that meant hours of standing, waiting, and carrying their instruments around. This period of running from one job to another was conceptualized by participants as a temporary lifestyle that would hopefully end, or at least settle down, upon securing a stable income. But in reality, there were no guarantees that each musician would eventually achieve the career of their dreams, and they had to stay patient, productive and flexible just in order to survive.

> So what does a typical week look like? Usually, for example, when there is theater, the theater plays between Wednesday and Saturday. Wednesday and Saturday are double performances. Thursday and Friday are usually single performances, evening performances. Other than that, Sunday, Monday, Tuesday, I try to arrange the students, I go to school, if I have to teach a class, I do it on one of those days. I usually cram students on these days when I am free. Or I try to cram the students on the days when the play will take place in the evening. Apart from that, also during the day.... Now when the theater is in the evening, I have time to work during the day on Thursdays and Fridays. I can work during the day. Of course, I also rest in the meantime. For example, on Sundays, if there is no work, I have one class. Usually one or two on Sunday. Other than that, I sometimes sleep on Sundays. I mean, I don't leave the house much that day. But on other days I work during the day. When there is a rehearsal, of course everything is organized according to the rehearsal. For example, the rehearsal for the last concert was between 3:30 and 9:30. Before that, I went to school or something, I had a lesson with my own teacher, and then I rushed from there to rehearsal. When I come back in the evening, the day is over. (personal communication, Appendix A, 65)

For some participants, permanent teaching positions filled the gap of stable employment. These participants either opted out of performing music for a living, or postponed this dream to a later date while generating stable income by teaching for the time being. One participant mentioned that they enjoyed playing for the independent chamber orchestra they had formed with friends in their school years, without the expectation of compensation, while being a full time teacher at a private

conservatory. Still, it is important to emphasize that there is a certain hierarchy among teaching jobs. While teaching at conservatories is highly regarded, having to receive "formation" to teach at a regular school due to lack of performance opportunities was described as a last resort. This hierarchy between the contrasted forms of teaching stems from the prestige attributed to musical performance careers as well as the conservatory as an institution which became part of the subjectivities of classical musicians 'throughout their training years.

> Well, yeah, I've been a teacher for about three years now. I work at a university, you know, and I always teach part-time kids. In that regard it's very enjoyable. I mean, working with children, and, say, starting them on things. Giving them a start on the instrument… They're all really unique. Psychologically, physically… discovering them. Besides musicianship, this became like a whole another world for me. I like it so much. Other than that, my own, I mean, we have a chamber music group. Playing with them is very fun. (personal communication, Appendix A, 66)

> When they come and say, "you could also be teaching," it's really a bit hurtful because we need performances. Proposing teaching as an option isn't really very nice. If they can't do anything, they can be a reacher, after learning formation. But would they be happy? No, in no way they can. It's like that, I mean, "if I'm unemployed, what else can I do?" Classroom teaching is something you can apply for as a last resort. (personal communication, Appendix A, 67)

Even if teaching at conservatories is considered prestigious, it is not the perfect solution to graduates 'economic problems. One participant stated that while they had a permanent position in the same state conservatory they graduated from, the purchasing power of their salary declined dramatically as the cost of living in Istanbul skyrocketed, leading them to leave the country and move back to their city of birth. Even in the case of achieving professional success after years of practice and hustle, as signaled by the securing of a tenured teaching position, deteriorating economic conditions and policies that prevent working multiple roles left the participant without options to sustain their career in the city.

> Well, my last transition has been a forced transition due to Turkey's economy. I was, like I said, a university professor. Assistant professor. Seeing my rent surpass my salary, I knew this couldn't go on like this. And you can't work at another place when you're working for a government organization. I need to make money in another way to survive. When I saw it couldn't go on like this, I made a decision. (personal communication, Appendix A, 68)

Leaving the country to pursue better options was stated to be a common path for conservatory graduates who had the means to do so. While the decision to leave was not uncommon, it was usually explained with a heavy heart and perceived as an option that was to be considered after exhausting all others. One participant who moved abroad explained their reasons to leave as follows:

> It's a hundred percent related to the conditions there. Otherwise I'm very happy with Kadikoy and Istanbul. I'm a citizen at peace with everything positive and negative about our… culture. But as I said, I first saw that there was no possible way. I mean if I took every job that came up, like, if I covered my eyes and said alright, I'm not doing classical music. I'll just teach every student I can find and make money, I saw that the only thing that happens is that it's never enough and I can't improve myself further. It's because I don't have the time. I'm very tired, it's a very tiresome life. And it's irregular. And like, feeling unsafe. It happened a lot. Where does this lead to? And how long can I keep doing this? Will I work additional jobs until I'm 40? (personal communication, Appendix A, 69)

While permanent positions in state orchestras and conservatories did provide a safety net for musicians, some participants pointed out that they still needed to rely on contract work, private orchestras or private lessons to generate additional income for goals such as buying a house or collecting savings to have a greater peace of mind about their future. One participant emphasized that tenured musicians used to be able to enjoy a high standard of living and become homeowners with a single income, but circumstances changed dramatically as salaries did not keep up with the increasing cost of living over the years. It is quite telling that the participant pointed to the 80s-90s period for this apparent shift in the classical musicians 'quality of life where

neoliberal policies that pushed for dramatic decrease of state support for citizens became the prominent governing principle in the country.

> I mean, being a musician is perfect for me, it's nice. But I look like I got it together… And I don't by the way. I mean it's not even. For example if I find a position I'll get my own place. My own place, like in a nice house… it doesn't exist. That's impossible right now. I mean it's not possible as a single person. (personal communication, Appendix A, 70)

> I play for 4-5 orchestras, and I go to extra gigs whenever one comes up. Why? So I can save for the future. By year's end, my savings are defeated by inflation, don't build up. It ends up with 1-2% increase compared to the previous year, my savings. I can't buy myself a house enough to have a roof over my head in Istanbul. To buy a house people working in the 80s and 90s could buy on one salary, I need to work twice as much as I do, and that kind of human being doesn't exist. What should I do, not sleep? (personal communication, Appendix A, 71)

One participant pointed out that even when a classical musician had access to resources that were described in the previous chapter to be the ideal conditions for the production of a successful classical musician and secured a tenured job at the state conservatories or orchestras, they would still lead uncertain and exhausting lives due to the economic struggles shared by many in the sector. The reason for this statement was not only the current conditions of the classical music field or the economy in general, but an anxiety caused by having to assume responsibility for simultaneously securing their future as well, over which they essentially had no power but self-control.

> I have a lot of friends who got it together. But as I said, they have everything we talked about earlier. Having happened to have a good teacher, family support. Somehow having had good luck. Still, they're very tired. Still, they need to go to all the additional jobs. This is the footnote. They need to say no to nothing so they can make sure they have future income. (personal communication, Appendix A, 72)

To sum up, for conservatory graduates in Istanbul, the transition from training to being a full-time professional is marked by uncertainty, anxiety and exhaustion. While securing a tenured position in a state institution emerges as a financially safer

path, it is not widely available or sufficient on its own to survive in the city. Teaching in conservatories and offering private lessons provide stable economic support on the side of performance roles, while teaching in regular schools is almost synonymous with failure. Migration is perceived as a common path for the graduates, but only for those who have access to necessary financial resources. The economic and institutional realities the participants faced after graduation led them to accept overworking themselves to ensure their survival, and also to secure opportunities for their uncertain futures.

5.1.3 Opting out

In the previous parts, we discussed how classical musicians are governed through a subjectivity manufactured by their families first and conservatories second, that shaped them into individuals ready and willing to overcome uncertain conditions intensified by structural challenges through self-surveillance, discipline and self-responsibility. In this part however, we will discover under which circumstances this subjectivity encounters a disruption, leading the subjects to let go of years of investment and to change course.

One participant mentioned that when a conservatory student plays their instrument for many years but fails to proceed to the undergraduate level of their studies, one option is to try and switch their major within the conservatory faculty. While they can not continue their performance training in the institution anymore, they can study to become a musicologist if they pass the department test. While musicology students still need to possess a certain level of knowledge on music theory, they are not expected to perform, and mostly pursue academic goals.

> The story of me becoming a musicologist began this way: I trained for the violin test. I took lessons from a teacher who worked at the conservatory. I had taken lessons from another teacher before that, who was a student of the

> conservatory principal. They prepared me very seriously. I took extra theory and solfege lessons because I was to be tested on those too. I mean, I was aware I had some deficiencies but because they saw my hard work, and knew me for years, like, if they accepted me in university, by getting an education there in university I could catch up, like, I thought, I believed. And of course I didn't have a plan B because I didn't know I wouldn't get in. Because I already had taken a break for a year. Because I had a one year break I didn't have preparing for another year, like I couldn't even imagine something like that right then. The school principal followed that procedure, like, "keep calm," and then, "let's see what other exam we have today," and like, "oh, there's the musicology exam, come on, let's get you into musicology," and… But already, like, I mean, they apparently didn't require much of an exam from those already graduating from conservatory, I mean. That's how I attended the Musicology Department jury exam. Then I was accepted there. (personal communication, Appendix A, 73)

This re-direction of subjectivity is significant because it allows the conservatory education system to protect itself in the cases of personal failure on the student's part. Instead of abandoning the student to face the consequences of their failed investment in a way that could jeopardize the logic and the reputation of the institution, it facilitates a refashioning of the student's subjectivity as a music academic. After the switch, the student can keep being a part of the field, albeit in a different format, and the institution is able to produce performer subjects without compromising on their standards. Though, it is important to remember that this switch is only possible at the undergraduate level, and full-time students who fail to pass their yearly exams before graduating high school can be expelled depending on the institutional policies of each conservatory.

While some graduates quit performing for various reasons and focused their careers on teaching the next generation of classical musicians, some participants of this study moved onto paths entirely besides music, either after graduating or just shy of it, having invested years of their time. These participants reported feeling extremely tired of the economic, and more importantly, mental and emotional

pressures of the music industry. The common sentiment in their narratives was that they were grateful for being able to free themselves from the heavy expectations that had been placed on them, both externally or internally, and they expressed having found peace after their decision to leave their field. Even when they were not entirely sure what the future held, they were definitely not rushing to go back. Perhaps it was no coincidence that they gravitated towards areas like office work and yoga which were relatively free of emotionally exhausting demands. They rejected the imperative to remain bound to their musical subjectivities that ordered endless dedication without support or payback.

> Right now I'm working like a white collar worker. Actually I'm white collar. I have private students. I know my own responsibilities. My working hours are regular. When my shift is over, I don't think anythink about work at all. (personal communication, Appendix A, 74)

> I don't have to think. I don't carry that responsibility. And I can focus on my private life. No problem or stress in my work life has an effect on my private life. And that's a big bonus. I mean, it's more important than material income. Especially after a certain age it's a lot more important. (personal communication, Appendix A, 75)

> The thing is, from the start of university, I began going to paid gigs and such things. Simultaneously I was giving lessons for private courses. I had private students. But there was something inside that didn't fit. Yes, I've been doing this since childhood. I'm working like crazy as if my life's purpose and my entire reality was this one thing. I spend my energy and effort. But I said, there was something that felt lacking. That's when the pandemic exploded. And, it might not be nice to say it like this, good that it did. That way I could get out of that environment a little bit. As soon as the pandemic began I got into yoga. It hadn't occurred to me to do something else. I thought I would make music until I was 80, maybe teach it at a school or go on stage. It was liberating to see this wasn't the case. Right now it's great, I'm very happy with where I am. It's been two years. Since 2022 I've been giving yoga classes regularly. (personal communication, Appendix A, 76)

In conclusion, the stories of opting out of classical music performance represent a rupture within the subjectivities of classical musicians and reveal that the graduates may refuse to accept the norms and desires instilled during their training, once there

is a discontinuity in their subjectivation processes. Institutional, economic or societal setbacks can transform the subjects ’paths after years of perseverance, by forcing them to imagine or accept other alternatives as equally valid.

5.2 Sector evaluations of conservatory graduates

This section will explore in detail how the participants of this study experienced the different career paths and workplaces that are deemed ideal, or at least somewhat acceptable, for conservatory trained classical musicians in Istanbul. One participant efficiently summarized the rather brief list of ideal options as follows: “If, after you graduate from conservatory, you don’t get into the symphony or the opera, and you aren’t an academic, you don’t have a fourth option.” (personal communication, Appendix A, 77) The common feature of the jobs on this list is that they are all options that are officially offered by the state. While this is not a comprehensive list of all available jobs, it beautifully highlights the top priority of the graduates, as well as the source of legitimacy that determines the field’s criteria for prestigious jobs. Although the conservatory graduates who specialize in classical music performance in Istanbul constitute a small community, the options for the state or private sector-supported long term employment of classical musicians are indeed very scarce.

- Becoming a member of a state orchestra
- Becoming a member of a private orchestra
- Teaching at conservatories

There are also short-term, project based employment opportunities which I will be classifying as “contract work”. It is important to mention that in practice, most of these jobs do not offer official contracts with security or benefits.

- Working as *takviye* (supplementary performer) for state, municipal and private orchestras
- Working in art shows (such as musical theaters) that span a few nights or a few seasons
- Playing at events such as weddings, openings and commercial organizations
- Offering private lessons
- Offering individual or group lessons at local music centers

The next parts of this chapter will present the sector reviews of graduates for each employment option in order to describe the lived realities and desires of Istanbul's classical musicians.

5.2.1 State orchestras

In Istanbul, there are two state orchestras, the Istanbul State Symphony Orchestra and the orchestra for the Istanbul State Opera and Ballet. While it was explained in the previous parts that auditions for empty spots in these orchestras are rare and highly valued, the participants also talked about additional opportunities and challenges regarding playing in these orchestras. First, although that is not the case with the majority of members, one participant mentioned that some musicians who perform at the state orchestras do not have tenure, and there is a major difference between the salaries of the tenured and contracted members. Here, tenure is a privilege not enjoyed by all members, and acts as a disciplinary mechanism that regulates performance quality only for the ones who lack it.

> Well, I signed in November. After I signed in November, the law changed. Everyone got tenure in April. But not everyone did. And I mean, this was the issue, "anyone who signed before November 28," it said. I had signed on November 12. That was my biggest strike of luck, and I keep saying it. But, for example, a friend who joined in December didn't get tenure. There's this

> sheer cliff between our salaries. But the workload is the same. (personal communication, Appendix A, 78)

Many participants, with or without stable positions, stressed that the tenured seats in the state orchestras are held by members until retirement, so there are practically no external threats to members ’employment status in cases of poor performance. It is not surprising that young graduates who are either new members or currently trying for tenured jobs resent this fact, as they strived for excellence for many years under the watchful eyes of their industrious peers and strict instructors.

> This rule of “nothing happens now that I’ve got a government position” is wrong I think. Because once someone has the position there’s no one evaluating if they put an effort there. The idea of “I got it once and now it’s mine” shouldn’t exist. (personal communication, Appendix A, 79)

One participant contrasted this with examples from other countries where orchestras expect their members to stay active in various musical scenes, such as chamber music or solo performances, in order to prevent the loss of technical abilities that results from solely playing orchestral parts. This narrative provides an insightful look into the competitive subjectivity embodied by the ambitious young musician who desires to level the playing field with classical musicians from other countries that better suit the requirements of the classical music tradition.

> Even disregarding that, in good, developed countries there’s this expectation, like, you can’t just be an orchestra musician. You also have to do chamber music concerts. You should play as a soloist every once in a while. Once in a while, I don’t know, you need to be somewhere, a jury, do something somewhere, be active. Like, I’m in an orchestra, going from orchestra to orchestra, it doesn’t work. Because being in an orchestra, only playing orchestra parts is something that takes from your technique, takes from you. Meaning, you always need to be doing solo work. You need to be fulfilling that solo performance experience. In the end, playing a part with ten other people and stepping up to play a solo part feel different. (personal communication, Appendix A, 80)

Young musicians also mentioned that older members could lack the motivation to improve or maintain their technique due to having performed the same pieces over and over again, resulting in an overall drop in diligence. One such participant adopted an empathetic stance, refraining from harshly judging the members who they thought may be guilty of this while also giving credit to other members where it's due. Their narrative also made me wonder whether some members attributed more symbolic value to the overall quality of performance irrelevant of their ages.

> Now it's been 5, 6 years since I graduated, how should I put it, fresh... I mean, knowledge is fresh, there's hunger for learning. I don't want to get ahead of myself but, say, in my 10th or 15th year in the orchestra, I will have fallen a bit. I'll be more tired. Therefore I'm not judging but I see those who do. For example the man's been in this orchestra for 35 years but he's playing with such passion. But I can't force anyone to be like him. I mean, think about it, new pieces aren't being written all the time. For example, I'm reading the Ballet of Romeo and Juliette for the first time, I'll play it for the first time. I'm very excited. But there's this woman, a violinist of 35 years, who's played this so many times. Therefore this doesn't have too much of, like, I mean a big difference in quality or anything either. But actually it's more about being careful. (personal communication, Appendix A, 81)

One participant compared state orchestras to private orchestras, revealing that some tenured members of the state orchestras saved their energy for extras and short-term projects as private organizers of these events required their best performance to offer them a next opportunity. Although this strategy was considered rather unethical, it was also normalized because of the internalized market dynamics where payment, or the threat of losing it, operates as a disciplinary mechanism leading to increased effort and higher quality results while job stability is synonymous with stagnation. Another participant argued that a similar lack of drive can be observed in other public institutions as well, suggesting that this problem is not specific to orchestras but involves nearly all public servants.

> Regretfully, our private work comes out higher quality. Forgive me, why is that? In the private sector, if you don't do your job, they might not call you again. It's that simple. I'm sorry, people sometimes determine their professionalism depending on the difficulty of the conditions afforded to them. I wish they didn't, I wish we all were people trying to do the same everywhere. They exist among us and I want to say I respect them all to be honest, but I shouldn't say most, but some people sadly think this way. Salary gets paid every month. The sooner that rehearsal ends the better. In private orchestras, you invite musicians. You say, "I'm the philharmonics, I have this many rehearsals, this many concerts, I'm playing these. I'm offering this much money." They accept and they come. They come better prepared than to state orchestras. Why? Because they know the possibility of doing some work unrelated to their salary and could be critiqued. Therefore I experience sadly that the private orchestra system as going further in terms of quality. (personal communication, Appendix A, 82)

> You can already see this in every area in Turkey. You go to student affairs, they're unhappy. You go to a state agency, they're unhappy. You go to the hospital, the clerks working there are unhappy, I mean unhappy with their work. Somehow all government workers work just so they can retire. (personal communication, Appendix A, 83)

One participant empathized with the orchestra members 'lack of motivation, pointing to the economic and political landscape in the country and explaining that as making a living increasingly becomes more difficult and individual freedoms are jeopardized, survival anxieties override the artists 'professional ideals and passion for arts. They argued that the severity of the economic and political problems resemble a country at war, so the members feel the need to support one another as though they are facing a common threat of extinction.

> I mean I understand somewhat, or at least it needs to be understood. Because like everyone, in a collapsing economy and conditions where freedoms are being limited, people, by supporting each other… Okay, they're, I mean in a fight of "at least let's manage to keep breathing", so you can't blame them too much. Yes, I mean, even an artist is forced into a position to put their art to second position. It's like we're a war torn country. (personal communication, Appendix A, 84)

In addition to the economic struggles, a lack of organization and planning in the state orchestras at the institutional level made it difficult for classical musicians to

function. While certainly disrupting their daily lives, this issue also caused a strong emotional reaction in members who themselves had to become experts at preparing and following strict schedules as they often needed to juggle multiple roles and responsibilities to stay afloat.

> In the opera it's never obvious what anything is. Everything can be canceled at any moment, they change. It's not apparent when you're playing what. Most times I wait for Sunday evening, which rehearsal of which part of which piece am I playing in that week? "Which rehearsal will my other friend play, how will we divide it," I wait until Sunday evening. (personal communication, Appendix A, 85)

One participant described their unstable working hours as though they were working part-time, even though they were once expected to work everyday for two weeks, rehearsing in the morning and performing in the evening. The same participant shared living with their family two hours away from their workplace due to having insufficient funds to live on their own, but still considered themselves lucky for not having to work during summer months when the season is over.

> If you looked at it, we're working part-time. Like, yes, I commute for two hours but I work for three hours. I take a half hour of those three hours as my break. For example this week I'll play for four days. Normally I don't play four days but because one of our colleagues is like, ill, I'll play instead. Our most busy week was like every day back to back for two weeks. Rehearsal in the morning, performance in the evening. But the best part is, I know this, the season is over in June and it's comfy until September. (personal communication, Appendix A, 86)

In short, while jobs at the state orchestras may have symbolized economic safety and artistic integrity for some classical musicians in the past, they do not offer an independent and comfortable lifestyle for members who do not have access to generational wealth or family support anymore. Many members who consider themselves lucky for securing tenured seats need to work additional jobs, often to the detriment of their performance quality in their main role. As a result, the personal

goal of doing what one loves for a living crumbles for many orchestra members, leading them to let go of their ideals to better position themselves in the market.

5.2.2 Private orchestras

As the state support for the classical music field is nearly non-existent except for the funding of well-established state orchestras, short-term, project based private orchestras formed by individual organizers constitute the majority of jobs in the classical music scene in Istanbul. However, because these organizations mainly offer jobs without contracts or benefits, they will be discussed later in this chapter. This part will be focused on the major private classical Western music orchestras in Istanbul which are organizations funded by major corporations in the name of supporting the arts.

The participants often talked about The Istanbul Borusan Philharmonic Orchestra, which stood out as a major private orchestra that offers stable, long term employment to classical musicians. Although there are others, such as the Tekfen Philharmonic Orchestra and the Gedik Philharmonic Orchestra, participants mentioned that these orchestras do not perform as frequently.

> Most private orchestras are those put together by gig hiring by phone calls. Even if the same people end up playing most of the time, these are per gig. A salary, contract, permanent position aren't done generally. Yes, I mean, who does this… Borusan, Bilkent, Tekfen, and Tekfen plays only one or two concerts a year. And exams are opened very rarely. (personal communication, Appendix A, 87)

Along with the opportunity for long term, regular employment, even for a small number of musicians, The Borusan Philharmonic Orchestra was appreciated by the participants due to the high musical quality of their performances and the relative objectivity of their audition practices. The audition process takes place behind a curtain that protects the anonymity of the candidates from the judges, and each

candidate is represented by numbers instead of their names. Although, one participant mentioned, there is a camera that films the candidate as they perform, which opens to question whether the selection process is truly blind. Still, the orchestra has a special place in the field because it adheres to the international standards that musicians clearly miss in their local context.

> Very difficult. Very difficult. Because there's a lot of shenanigans going on in exams. There are so many people who're worn out, not getting the rewards of their labor. Borusan holds excellent auditions, for example. They don't declare anyone's name. Everyone has a candidate number, the test program is predetermined. There's decoding in the test, for example, playing by sight. And for those, they give a list of 50 pieces and say they're going to ask for two of those. It's compatible with the standard abroad. Also, Borusan does the auditions behind a curtain. They can't see you this way. They don't know your name, everyone who walks in is a number. You can't see what they look like, it's really nice. You can't do favoritism in any way. (personal communication, Appendix A, 88)

> I attended a single audition where they couldn't see my face, it was Borusan. They have a camera, they can look at it later but we also see the results later… I think Borusan is the most appropriate about this. Because they are really good when you listen, that I can say at least. I mean even if they do some nepotism, they're really doing a good job. (personal communication, Appendix A, 89)

Gedik Philharmonic Orchestra stood out as another private orchestra that was admired because of its efforts to support the composition and recording of new classical pieces by Turkish composers. Throughout my fieldwork, the tension about classical music belonging to the Western culture was negotiated by the participants, and private initiatives were the ones being recognized as cornerstones that improved standards and made an effort to sustain the field in the local culture industry.

> Other than that, we have a newer arts organization called Gedik Philharmonics, Gedik Arts. I'm in their orchestra. There we do what we planned for an organization to do, do things we imagine, they have a very valuable thing. At every concert, we order from Turkish composers. And it shows variance depending on the size of the orchestra. It can be for a small ensemble. It can be for a mid-sized orchestra. We rehearse, play and record those pieces we order. Not because I'm in it but it's something I have great

> respect for. Because it's been 5-6 years, and imagine there was a pandemic within that 5-6 years, we have ordered, played and recorded 115 pieces. I keep saying the same sentence when I'm telling this, I mean, if we became dust and get blown away, if Gedik Arts disappeared, 115 pieces have been written, played. I think this is a production, contribution. And for that, honestly, I'm very happy to be in it as a musician. (personal communication, Appendix A, 90)

Although there are a number of other private orchestras that increase the odds of the conservatory graduates finding employment, they are very few in total and do not cause a significant reduction in the lack of opportunities, especially for younger musicians with shorter periods of professional experience. They mostly offer hard to find, high-prestige jobs reserved for senior musicians.

5.2.3 Teaching

Teaching emerged as a common practice for nearly all participants of this study. Some participants taught at state or private conservatories, some taught at schools, and some offered private lessons or worked at music centers. Most of them started offering private lessons while they were still in training and some participants kept their master-apprentice dynamic with their instructors even after becoming tenured instructors themselves. For the classical music field, teaching, learning and performing are intertwined processes.

One of the reasons for the universality of teaching jobs is the continuous need for the financial security that they provide. Especially, but not exclusively, for the conservatory graduates who do not have tenured orchestra seats, teaching at an institution is a must for supporting themselves financially. Teaching jobs are considered as anchors that keep musicians from drifting in the precarious job market.

> Someone my age who doesn't have a permanent position but also keeps on with the instrument… I don't think it exists. Surely somewhere they've gone into teaching, or go as extras. They must've settled somewhere I mean. There are a lot of private schools. There are places that opened in these past few

> years such as the Maltepe Conservatory. I know people who got in there. Such as music departments of private schools. (personal communication, Appendix A, 91)

> I was in a gloomy state. Like, I graduated but there's nothing. I mean, I usually go to these extra jobs. Constantly, that orchestra, this thing or that. Gig based and irregular. You suffocate in that. Of course something regular gives you both safety and confidence. It's been four years like that I think. Yes, I've been working there (in a private conservatory) for four years. It's nice. (personal communication, Appendix A, 92)

According to one participant, the students who started their conservatory education at an early age were encouraged to become instructors at their own conservatories as they progressed. For many participants, working as an academic still remains to be a future goal, even if they are currently working in other roles, while others are trying to balance teaching and performance positions simultaneously. Although teaching at conservatories have always been, and still is, highly sought after, the power struggles that dominate the work culture in the institution affected a change of mind in some participants. The graduates found themselves torn between feeling nostalgic for their desire to teach where they were trained and sparing themselves the heartache of being part of a system that they knew was harsh.

> The school had begun to impose an academic career on me. They manipulate you a bit like, if you go to a conservatory since you're a kid, you'll be a professor in a school like this. I was, too, a little. For a time I thought I was going to but I said no, I'm never coming back here after I graduate. (personal communication, Appendix A, 93)

> I was (aiming for academia). I mean, I say I was because now I'm so tired of being in the vicinity of a school. The more I see people in school, and the environment of the professors… the more I'm exposed to it… when we were little, we didn't get it of course but now that we've grown up… because there's this same ego issue. There are teams, people who take each other's sides. I mean, there are people who get along. They are just in separate groups. And sometimes if they have an opponent, they can clump together suddenly, I mean the professors. It's weird, I mean. It's very flip-floppy. I don't know, I might not have any peace of mind if I work in an environment like this. But it's a living. Would I do it if I had to, and how long would I last? I can't say that at the moment. I did want to go into academia. At the moment,

> I don't want it due to the environment. Otherwise, I still want to continue. (personal communication, Appendix A, 94)

Another participant mentioned that an academician's salary was not sufficient by itself to survive in Istanbul, and instructors had to depend on additional jobs to make a living if they were not financially supported by others. However, while the salary of a conservatory instructor was not especially high, their title granted them the status of gatekeeper, which meant more private students. The participant mentioned that they had to be selective with who they taught after getting tenure at the conservatory, as the demand for their services grew visibly high.

> How it worked was, there were few professors in the same circumstances, the same circumstances as me. Those were at most with private lessons or increasing their private gigs somehow… or because they didn't have an alternative, that's one. And two, those who didn't have a monetary worry thanks to their family situation. (personal communication, Appendix A, 95)

> It works entirely on recommendations. More precisely, like, after a point, after I got tenure, I began to be more selective with students —and this is based on recommendations because once you're a conservatory professor a lot of people want their kids to take lessons from you— because I could be selective due to high demand. I used the advantage of the conservatory, I mean, the fact that I worked there [to promote myself]. (personal communication, Appendix A, 96)

In addition to an official title, most participants agreed that being present on social media provided an advantage when attracting private students. Although having a conservatory degree and tenure made it easier to find potential students, an active and popular social media account also increased the chances of being perceived as a trustworthy instructor. It was striking that while social media is generally perceived as being fake and misleading, it could still appeal to the viewers 'sense of trust in the context of musicians 'professional competence more than official qualifications.

> I think, for example, social media is a big advantage for private lessons. I don't know if it's because it somehow gives confidence or what but it seems

> that being a student of someone with a high follower count makes people happy, I think. (personal communication, Appendix A, 97)

However, according to one participant, the students who used social media to reach instrument instructors were usually adults who wanted to play an instrument as a hobby, or parents who searched for someone to help explore their child's musical interests. Aspiring or currently-in-training conservatory students relied on word of mouth or recommendations from peers when searching for a "good instructor" who could help them achieve their educational goals. As such, how students reach potential tutors and which student reaches which tutor emerged as another matter of individual subjectivity.

> I mean if someone is asking their friends and family, "we want our child to take piano lessons", I mean, they don't think to ask someone from the conservatory, music teachers were offering lessons in that area. And they also keep their prices low. But more professional ones, like, you go and say, "I want my child to take lessons from the conservatory." The conservatory professor tells you there's this or that on piano, and introduces you to them or something. Hence, the professional person doesn't need social media advertisement. Because they are already someone who's competent at their job. But in the amateur field, honestly, give those lessons by promoting themselves. I mean, it doesn't exist, the instrument skill doesn't exist. They teach badly anyway. There's no regulation after all. The people who pay for the lessons aren't aware of how their child is playing. Therefore, yes, those people are using social media very actively. (personal communication, Appendix A, 98)

To sum up, teaching jobs were indispensable for classical musicians, whether in state or private conservatories or in the form of private lessons. Not only did they provide relative financial stability, they allowed musicians to pass down their craft and ensure the continuity of their field. As revealed in participants 'earlier narratives, a "good instructor" was perceived as vital to the production of successful classical musicians, which meant that teaching jobs were as crucial as performance jobs for

the future of classical music, despite their auxiliary status in the hierarchy of desirable careers.

5.2.4 Contract work

As mentioned in the earlier parts, contract work is a fundamental means of economic survival for classical musicians in Istanbul. Even conservatory graduates who are both lucky and skilled enough to become a part of state orchestras may need to pursue contract work as an additional income source, depending on their personal goals and existing support systems for financial security.

Both the graduates without stable positions and those who depend on additional income sources expressed that the working conditions for short-term projects and their terms for being invited can be challenging. For the ones with stable orchestra seats, exhaustion is a common lifestyle feature that accompanies contract work. Especially when the pay is high, these jobs become irresistible for members who need to support larger families, even if that means working consecutive evenings or weekends.

> And, like, I don't know, the payments are good. They pay a fifth of the salary for one rehearsal and one concert, you make that in two days. But it also causes fatigue. For example, the opera schedule comes, "we're playing 5 days this week." I tell my friend, "I'm very tired," something like that, she says, like, "I went to the other jobs on the weekend. And I also went to this and that, I'm even more tired," etc. We have to do that too. We need the additional monetary support. If they have kids, family. That's how it has to be. (personal communication, Appendix A, 99)

Although some projects pay especially well, not all of them are created equal. The participants highlighted the importance of being consistent with attendance when it comes to being re-invited to perform at gigs, regardless of how much it pays. This condition certainly challenged musicians at times due to last minute schedules, overlapping commitments and personal reasons. Especially if a musician does not

have tenure, they need to constantly adapt and prove their reliability at the expense of their personal well-being in order to prevent getting excluded from future opportunities.

> So now you become dependent on these extra jobs. And if you reject one of them, you may never get another one. That's why everyone keeps running after something. Because once you accept one, it starts to come again and again, and if the same job or the person who gave you that job also organizes other jobs, they start to send them your way. For example, there is one right now who doesn't have a position anywhere and is constantly going from job to job. (personal communication, Appendix A, 100)

> You know, when you reject twice, they don't call you for the third time. They say whoever is available should come. (personal communication, Appendix A, 101)

In addition to always being ready and available, securing contract work required amicable relationships with certain gatekeepers, such as the conservatory staff or other organizers that are tasked with forming short-term orchestras for the city's major concert halls. Some of these gatekeepers were described by participants as excessively demanding with difficult personalities. In this instance, it is not sufficient to show up where one is needed for a performance, the requirements of gatekeepers structure the acceptable forms of behaving, speaking, dressing and existing, around which one has to adjust themselves to earn good standing.

> There's a monopoly situation. There are certain concert halls and stuff in the hands of certain people. The situation can be that if you want to be there, you have to get along with them. (personal communication, Appendix A, 102)

> Really it depends on the behavior. There's an authority and you have to treat that authority as an authority. And you should know very well who that is. And you need to treat the sub-authorities under them well, treat them in the framework they want. Generally, those who create minimal issues, do maximum work, are go-getters and do everything promptly… you're there immediately when asked for. (personal communication, Appendix A, 103)

One participant suggested that while befriending gatekeepers to build a network can help progress one's career, this method would not be sustainable without the

technical prowess necessary to perform well at a given job. They attributed more value to networks that develop organically as a result of one's quality of performance, which led me to believe that although some gatekeepers in the industry are known to resort to favoritism over merit, the gatekeepers themselves may be prone to falling out of favor in the long run.

> I think the best networking is the one you don't force one. You can force it. There are managers, you can meet them, there are people in high places, you can be nice to them. I can't lie. I don't think it's permanent. If you aren't equipped to do that job, the things you put together for the sake of networking will get you only so far. At the end of the day, you're left to face your negative sides. (personal communication, Appendix A, 104)

> If you're good at something, I think that's the best kind of network. I think that's the most magnificent thing about our quartet. We're very weak on networking. We don't have "that thing". We aren't the people to say, "we have this quartet." But what happened was, we're playing a concert somewhere. Someone who's there says, "would you also do a concert at this other place?" I think this is a magnificent solution. Magnificent. (personal communication, Appendix A, 105)

While performance opportunities would mostly arise as a result of consistency in gig attendance and professional networks, musicians 'social media profiles also had a supplementary role due to increasing or maintaining their visibility within their circles. The participants were hesitant to claim social media had a huge role in their industry, as most of them revealed that they did not spend much time or made a consistent effort to stay relevant on social media. However, the ones who put in the effort were known to access opportunities they otherwise may not, as a result of their popularity on social media.

> I mean like this. I don't know if I should call it a manifesto or what. But for example, when you share a gig you've been to, we put it on our story, for example, we're playing at this concert on this date, on this date, on this date... It can give me the impression that because you are more in the public eye, you get called more often. On the contrary, it can also be the opposite. Sometimes, people who don't share at all turn out to have gotten more jobs than I have. (personal communication, Appendix A, 106)

> There is a TV presenter. For example, they started on social media, posting videos all the time, but I think they were also a lecturer somewhere. Then, after they became well known, I think they started to host a program on TRT with their violin, he calls guests, again violinists... (personal communication, Appendix A, 107)

Another topic of discussion among participants without tenured positions was the artistic quality of the gigs they accepted for economic reasons. Since classical musicians are trained and socialized to perform classical pieces that require highly skilled performers, they sometimes felt frustrated having to perform more popular genres or pieces that are easier to digest by the masses that remained outside the scope they desired to take part in. The desired types of performances were described as "real jobs" while others were perceived as being irrelevant to their artistic personas.

> I mean, you can't make the music you want no matter what. What you learned, what you want to perform, no matter what… It stays bottled up, you can't do it. The they tell you, "will you play behind such and such?" The real work isn't coming. (personal communication, Appendix A, 108)

Opportunities to perform at musical theater plays that last a few seasons stood out as relatively desirable and reliable options of contract work. These shows provided regular pay, although for small groups at a time, and made it possible for musicians to plan their lives around a source of fixed income without tenure. One participant mentioned playing for the municipal theater while another talked favorably about a commercial production.

> I work project-based in the theater. I work in just a single play. Other musicians work in the other play. And within these couple years they hired many musicians this way. Even if project based, a play ends up going for 3-4 years in the end. And given that it's played for 3-4 seasons, it becomes a source of income for people. And of course, again, how many people are in a musical? I'm thinking, how many people are in the orchestra, 20 at best. I mean, it's not much. For the wind instruments… even 20 might be too high. (personal communication, Appendix A, 109)

> Amadeus would assign us a yearly schedule. Our days and hours were all fixed, the money we'd be paid… That, for example, made us feel secure. At least you knew what you would be paid next month. That's if it isn't canceled, by the way. (personal communication, Appendix A, 110)

Meanwhile, juggling multiple professional responsibilities while commuting between them in Istanbul made it difficult for participants to schedule sufficient time for instrument practice, rest or socializing with friends, who often had hectic schedules themselves. As a result, musicians often found themselves torn between their needs for extra income, recreational time and skill development. This proved to be a challenge especially for the ones who needed to improve their technique to keep auditioning for permanent roles in orchestras while performing at short term projects to generate a living income. Most participants revealed feeling too exhausted to socialize, pursue other interests or even practice to maintain their standard quality of performance.

> It's difficult for people to find time to rest, because Istanbul is a tiring city. Some are academics, others work in orchestras. I do freelance work, whenever jobs come up. It's difficult to get together because no one's schedules agree. Now, every day, someone who has graduation is practicing for 3-4 hours, or as much as they can. You, on the other hand, are jumping from job to job… You think things like, "should I rest or should I practice?" (personal communication, Appendix A, 111)

> It's because it's not possible, not possible to socialize or something. Then what happens? Musicians look for socialization within a nightlife. Alcohol becomes what makes them happy. Nightlife interactions. They can't experience the other flavors of life. If they have a day off, they try to spend it at home, resting. In pajamas, eye masks, herbal teas, this or that. Some will relax with a beer or something, at home. Watch a movie. Whatever they're doing, some will just lie there. I sometimes find myself with no energy to do anything but look at the phone. No energy to read a book, or to call my friend to ask how they are, nothing. I mean, let alone focusing on the piece you're practicing, this lowers the quality [of life] so much. (personal communication, Appendix A, 112)

The participants also mentioned that short-term organizations often failed to accommodate musicians ’basic needs such as eating, getting dressed and resting before performances. Many participants mentioned that travel and eating costs would be included in the agreed upon fee, and sometimes organizations would not even offer free water at rehearsals or events. It was not unusual for musicians to spend a quarter or even half of their fee for unexpected costs in long rehearsals or bad weather conditions. Dressing rooms could be crowded and uncomfortable, and they sometimes had to wait outside standing up or sitting on the floor before performing.

> On some jobs, they don’t even provide food, not even water. Some didn’t even have water the whole day, not even water. That’s not even mentioning, say, I get paid a certain amount for your concert. For that money, for three days, 2 days rehearsal and 1 concert, like, I don’t live on photosynthesis for those two days. I eat out. At the very least I buy water, or a coffee. You’re at rehearsal for 6 hours. You surely eat or drink something during those 6 hours. I end up having spent a fourth of it. For example, it snowed for 2-3 days recently, I took a taxi home. I didn’t have other transportation. I spent another fourth. What you’re left with is laughable, actually. They don’t even provide water, I mean. It’s insulting. (personal communication, Appendix A, 113)

> It’s a bad environment when you go to an additional gig. You have no idea and I’ve been generally called to open air like everyone. If it’s not symphony, if it’s a side gig, not in a concert hall it gets really difficult. I remember sitting on the grass, eating wraps. I remember then getting up to play Hababam Sınıfı in a very humid place. And my bow was so wet… The hairs and the wood of the bow had stuck together due to the humidity. Then I had thought, “the money I’m paid isn’t worth the damage to my violin.” It’s really difficult, I mean, the conditions. (personal communication, Appendix A, 114)

Contract work was described as being physically, logistically, emotionally and artistically challenging for classical musicians, but most of them deeply needed these jobs in order to survive. It would be an understatement to suggest that they felt undervalued in these environments, but more so, they felt internally misaligned.

5.2.5 Chamber music

For all the precarious working conditions mentioned, almost all participants expressed that their favourite mode of performance was playing in their self-formed chamber orchestras. They felt the most free and joyful when they had control over what to play, who to play it with, as well as when and where they would play – in short, when they had autonomy and agency. Although they mentioned it was impossible to maintain their standard of living by performing chamber music only, it was truly apparent in their words that these independent projects were what fulfilled their artistic aspirations.

> We can perform chamber music whenever and wherever we want, with our own group. In fact we don't have a material expectation from it. It's just something we enjoy very much. It doesn't matter where, let's be together and play kinda thing. It's what I enjoy the most, actually. That's because it's not limiting. Responsibilities can mean putting yourself into some molds. Not having that is a huge freedom. (personal communication, Appendix A, 115)

> I really wanted to do… I wanted to do chamber music more than anything. You know, to play in a trio, quartet, or quintet—I really wished for that. Because during the conservatory years, I had a group like that with my closest friends, and I had dreamed of working like that for a lifetime. But in Turkey, that's just not possible. There's simply no way to earn a living or sustain a life as a chamber musician here. (personal communication, Appendix A, 116)

Hearing the participants speak about their experiences of playing chamber music in contrast to other avenues made it very clear to me that the economic realities of the classical music market is far from offering a chance at building satisfying careers to musicians in most cases. Chamber music emerged as a symbol of artistic freedom and a site for authentic relationships and the joy of playing, providing the performers a glimpse of what life could be if only the desires they internalized aligned with the demands of the market.

CHAPTER 6

MUSICIAN AS SUBJECTIVITY

6.1 Identifying as a classical musician

This section will focus on the narratives of conservatory-trained classical musicians describing their lived experiences of being a musician on personal, relational and societal levels in order to make sense of the operational dynamics of the classical music field as they unfold in Istanbul. From their time spent in training to their struggles in the job market, we will discover how they perceived themselves, how they thought others perceived them and which mechanisms supported or hindered their development and aspirations.

6.1.1 Feeling special

Many participants of this study described their experience of being a classical musician by the expressions of feeling special, privileged or different. One participant states "I had the feeling of doing something different. Can it be called niche? I was content with studying this. I always received a positive reaction." (personal communication, Appendix A, 117) This sense of being special was sometimes grounded in their unconventional schooling, small community, daily routines and job descriptions, and sometimes in the reactions they received when they revealed what they do for a living.

> I think I feel privileged. It was beautiful. I love it. Yes, I mean, it's a difficult profession. It's physically hard, needs constant focus. You need to practice constantly. You get rusty when you don't. It's hard but I don't know. I think I always chose the hard path. That's why I like it. I mean, I like even the working hours. Yes, it's not easy to carry an instrument everywhere in a place like Istanbul if you don't have a car. Things like carrying your instrument and concert attire to the rehearsal. But when you

> play the concert, the feeling you have, the one called "goosebumps" in English… That feeling, the applause you receive, the excitement… You never get used to that excitement. It's always as if you're doing it for the first time. I think these are beautiful things. I like it, it's satisfying, I mean, it's mentally satisfying. (personal communication, Appendix A, 118)

Although their "special" status sometimes came with privilege, especially in the context of having the means to "do what one loves for a living", this status also functioned to define the boundaries of what constitutes acceptable behaviour for an individual of their standing. According to one participant, the word "musician" was used interchangeably with the word "artist" in the conservatory setting, especially when it was used as a tool to discipline students. In this context, being an artist meant being proper, following the institution's rules, working hard and overall, being an exemplary individual. Therefore, being a classical musician was not just supposed to be a blessing, it also carried certain obligations. For the institution of conservatory, an artist was tasked with giving society a direction.

> And it's such an upbringing, of course, teachers would come, say, a commotion or something had happened. Say, they go classroom to classroom, to give kids advice. They'd say, "you're candidate artists. You're very special members of society, behave that way." (personal communication, Appendix A, 119)

Although it was instilled in their subjectivity to model behavior for others to follow because they were deemed special, many participants shared that they questioned what it was that made their position seem that way. One participant rejected the idea of their status granting them privilege, both because every profession was special in its own way and because their experience of musicianship was not without problems. One participant figured that it was the notion of art that was special, not the individual performers, but still identified with the position of enlightening others by functioning as a vessel.

> Being a musician actually feels nice, I thought it was the feeling of privilege, but… having come here I now think every profession has its own privilege. I mean, since we're not able to do it perfectly… I don't think I can do that feeling justice. It has its good sides but there are parts we don't like as well. That's why I don't see it as a privilege. (personal communication, Appendix A, 120)

> In the end I had this talent. I studied that. Yes, fine arts is a valuable field but honestly, I don't think it's special compared to other professions. Now, it's true by the way, we're special people. Why special, though? Because we're artists. That's why we're special. Not because everyone else is beneath us. It's because we chose to make art and because we're guiding the people of society who appreciate art, holding a light to them, through art. That's all there is to it. We're special because we're a conduit, a conduit for art. (personal communication, Appendix A, 121)

Another topic of discussion raised by the participants was the prevalence of egoistic behavior among classical musicians. According to one participant, some people believe that "ego" is a must for a musician. But while confidence is vital, they argued, being a musician also requires humility. Another participant suggested that although conservatories are very strict in terms of practice discipline, belonging to a "special" group sometimes led to "spoiled" behaviour and looking down on others. Especially in professional settings, "egotistical" individuals were perceived as problematic and caused discomfort among performers. This debate showcased the distinct status of classical musicians in the society, revealing the inner negotiations of the subjects trying to position themselves based on the conflicting expectations of their field and extended social environments.

> There are many egotistical people. I don't know, some people claim that musicians should have a bit of ego. Should have that confidence. Of course they should be confident. But I don't think they need a nonsensical ego. I don't think it's becoming of an artist. Honestly I don't. I mean, everyone can appear like, bubbly, honest, sweet etc. See them at work though… (personal communication, Appendix A, 122)

> I might add, that discipline is just limited to the instrument. There's this pomp, besides all the cool factor it burdens you with this pompousness. In public, everywhere you feel that way. You're a small, special group of people. You go around with that group. We used to look down on everyone, for example. We used to mock everything and everyone. Every kind of music, all kinds of profession… It's because you see yourself as doing something very special and amazing. You're also a child, yes. I mean, I felt self-confident but it was also very… there was this cruel side to it too. In a way it's related to that group mentality. (personal communication, Appendix A, 123)

The elitism associated with classical music evoked different feelings among participants. They internalized the fact that the genre appeals to a distinct and rather small group of people, but also felt positive about their conservatory training introducing them into it. At the same time, they were critical about the genre being praised at the expense of others and uncomfortable with the lack of effort to reach diverse audiences. One participant stated that they never would have known how to appreciate classical music if they remained in their district of Istanbul instead of attending conservatory, essentially suggesting that the genre belonged to a different social setting than their own. Another participant regretted their "fascism" towards all other musical genres throughout their conservatory years, and was thankful that those times and that version of themselves now remain in the past.

> It's a niche field. Only those with the gusto can recognize it. I can recognize it because I received the education for it. When I hear beautiful music… or I know how to choose a nice concert. I have practical knowledge regarding that, it's the biggest current benefit to me. (personal communication, Appendix A, 124)

> As I said, I'm growing up in a place like Eyüp. Until that moment I don't know classical music exists. I don't know the shape of a violin, French horn, bassoon. Opera is something I make fun of, I mean, people using their voices that way is a source of laughter etc. I mean, I was growing up with a limited perspective, living in that environment. (personal communication, Appendix A, 125)

> Regarding music, as a student, I keep saying, I was a fascist. Let alone playing, I didn't even like listening to anything else. I saw it as, like, I was

> a bit stuck-up. Thankfully that time has passed. It's gone completely. I'm also not the same person anymore. (personal communication, Appendix A, 126)
>
> The Opera has nice projects. They began visiting retirement homes lately. They pick two volunteers to [play] at retirement homes. But they do it at Moda Retirement Home. Why Moda? People of Moda have grown up with it. Why are we still catering to this elite circle? (personal communication, Appendix A, 127)

The participants interpreted their "special" status in the society as classical musicians to be sources of pride, privilege, obligation, egotism and sometimes cultural exclusion. They questioned their stance on what makes them special and how this status makes them feel. All in all, while they acknowledged discomfort at times, they hoped to transform the negative associations with their field through self-reflection and conscious outreach.

6.1.2 Feeling underappreciated

The participants of this study also focused on the way they were being perceived by the society when discussing what being a musician means to them. Many participants seemed to be feeling defeated when describing the challenges of not having their hard work recognized or appreciated, especially because they play classical pieces where the genre is not perceived as being "a part of the culture". One participant pointed to the stark contrast between the value attributed to arts and artists in the early Republican era, when conservatories were first founded, and the contemporary neoliberal era, where classical musicians feel unsupported, even obstructed, by the state and the general public. The participant emphasized that it is not only classical music that is neglected due to belonging to a Western origin, the traditional Turkish music also shares a similar fate.

> And of course that build up period, it's very strict. Nazi-like, harsh training. Expectations are too high etc. but it pays off in the end, it's worth the effort cause there's this thing, a respect from both the government and society for the artist. Until our time, as everything else, the respect society has for artists has decreased. It's about to disappear perhaps, it's just a few people when I look around. You aren't getting what you deserve anyway, and not only that, you're getting blocked even. They try to become an obstacle at every turn. (personal communication, Appendix A, 128)

> Alright, this isn't our music. And it's name is already, I mean instead of classical music one should say polyphonic western music, it's a kind of music that came out of the west, what we're making. Okay, it's not a music that belongs to us. Yes, a taxi driver in Italy can listen to classical music. In our country they can listen to Azer Bülbül, both are normal. But rejecting it saying it's imported music is a little lazy I think. [By that logic] we never should've made this decision in the founding of our republic. We never should've encouraged composers to blend our own music with that of the west. We already aren't cultivating our own Turkish music either. That has been ignored for the past 30 years. How nice. I mean, let's continue this way. (personal communication, Appendix A, 129)

The participants also made a distinction between being a musician and being a musician in Turkey, explaining that although being a musician provides one with a unique perspective in life, the status of a musician tends to be lower in Turkey in comparison to other countries where arts are valued, especially judging by everyday working conditions. One participant shared that they felt positively encouraged but rather unsupported by society at large, because people seem to light up after finding out they are a classical musician, only to reveal they do not really listen to classical music because "it puts them to sleep".

> I think this has two sides. There's being a musician in Turkey, and there's being a musician. Of course it's an amazing thing to be a musician. After all, if I hadn't gone to conservatory and became a musician, I would have a very limited view of life. But of course, being a musician in Turkey is a horrible thing, I mean, it's a very difficult thing. It's a lot, I mean, I feel like a worker as a musician in Turkey. (personal communication, Appendix A, 130)

> It's something everyone regards positively but no one supports. It's not a part of our culture. We don't listen to it at home, we don't go to concerts. We

> aren't supporting it in general. We don't tune into it on the radio. "It's boring, it makes us sleepy," kinds of reactions. (personal communication, Appendix A, 131)

Some participants mentioned that the general public seems to have no idea about their profession and how laborious and risky it actually is, associating being a musician with "having fun". One participant revealed that they were usually consoled when they shared with others what they were studying. The only way for their efforts to be recognized as valid was through achieving state tenure.

> Societally… most people didn't assume classical music when I told them I was a musician. I didn't see much of a benefit from it. Working for the government, becoming a university lecturer, that had some value. It pays the insurance etc. that was the appreciation we got. But it's not like [they appreciate] because you're a conservatory graduate… "Oh, nice, you're learning, having fun and working at the same time," was the mentality. (personal communication, Appendix A, 132)

> They say "it's okay," etc. "What are you studying?" I'm like, "music," and they're "okay" etc. That's the reaction. The struggle I went through… if you haven't started at 6 or 7, it's almost impossible. Almost impossible. That's why the only people who are aware of the difficulties are those who do this job and their families, generally. (personal communication, Appendix A, 133)

Ultimately, being a conservatory-trained classical musician in a society where their labor is not properly valued or recognized took an emotional toll on the participants. In addition to being subjected to insecure financial conditions, classical musicians felt culturally irrelevant outside the scope of their families and professional circles. The fact that their institutional heritage used to be a symbol of progress in the nation only to be neglected and devalued later left them unsure of their place in the cultural sphere, while decreased state support and competitive market conditions forced them to work themselves to the bone.

6.1.3 Being disciplined

Discipline was conveyed as a core value for all conservatory graduates, whether they actively pursued careers in performance or not. Beginning from early ages, the importance of following strict practice schedules was ingrained in their subjectivity, and many participants mentioned facing serious consequences for going through periods of irregular effort. As a result, the graduates showed low tolerance for indiscipline, both in themselves and others, suggesting that discipline was perceived as a moral obligation rather than a functional habit. One participant found their approach to work to be "militaristic", and stated that they found joy in being neat and completing multiple tasks they intend to get done.

> A 5-6 year old child has to practice for hours in a room if they want to do this as a profession. And since this discipline is instilled in you since childhood, you put that in every part of your life, whatever you do for a living. (personal communication, Appendix A, 134)

> I think a person should be disciplined, not only in the conservatory. I hate undisciplined people, I'm very sorry. I might seem too militaristic right now, but… I really like being proper. At work or at school, being able to do everything on time… Seeing someone without discipline makes me angry. I don't like it one bit. Discipline, to me, is unnegotiable. (personal communication, Appendix A, 135)

The participants mentioned that their musical training taught them how to meticulously plan their work and focus on small details, allowing them to thrive in their professional lives even in areas besides musical performance. The ritual of planning their practice hours for the end-of-semester exams in the conservatory and the imperative to focus on tiny details in order to bring to life a piece that is hundreds of years old produced subjects that are able to transfer these management skills to whatever project they set themselves to achieve.

> For example, every semester a program is selected for us. We work on it and then we perform it. There is a planning thing that this has brought me, a teaching, if you want to call it that? I learned to plan. I mean, to finish

> something before its deadline. That's why it's good for me in my work life now. (personal communication, Appendix A, 136)

> What we do is so detail-oriented. To be able to play a piece, to be able to play a piece that was written hundreds of years ago, means that you have spent thousands of hours thinking about it. And this has made me a very detail-oriented person. And this attention to detail is reflected in my lessons today. I mean, I see the student very well, I hear them very well, you know, nothing escapes their eyes after my lessons. I always see people down to their toes, and I would not be lying if I said that I owe this ability to see details to the fact that I have studied music for many years and grew up surrounded by art. (personal communication, Appendix A, 137)

For the participants, discipline also meant internalizing hierarchies, respecting authority and acting in perfect harmony with others in orchestral settings. One participant emphasized that classical music training in the conservatory brings with it a deep understanding of the importance of state governance and the mechanisms of obedience required for a functioning society. Another participant revealed that they favored one's ability to coordinate with others over their individuality and technical proficiency regarding orchestra members. One participant stated "I adapt easily to the environment I'm in. As I said, like we must adapt so we can stay in that group. Being compatible with the group is important for me." (personal communication, Appendix A, 138) This response reflects that they strived to be the harmonious person in any group they find themselves in because it is a necessary trait to ensure acceptance in professional settings.

> Other than that, there's a mandatory hierarchy. Understanding the mandatory hierarchy correctly… There's a society, government is leading the society, an administration takes the helm. I think conservatory education and polyphony enables you to correctly understand what this means. An art organization or a concert hall, an orchestra has a director of music. There's a conductor under that. Under the conductor, there's the concertmeister, after that the head violinist, group lead and after that the members of the orchestra. So we have this kind of triangle. It's a useful triangle. It's obvious that hierarchy is something that a society has to have. I mean, because, in an environment everyone is free, quote unquote, and could say and implement whatever they wanted, more importantly, would be chaos. Managing this

> chaos has some requirements. And we fulfill these requirements with the mandatory hierarchy. (personal communication, Appendix A, 139)

> And what we call orchestra is somewhat of a group endeavor. I mean, like, there's also the art of acting together. Which means at some point we can't prefer your very goodness over your individuality. I mean if you can act together you can be present a bit more in orchestras. (personal communication, Appendix A, 140)

However, the participants emphasized that respect for authority did not mean the suppression of some ideas in favor of others. For some participants, the polyphonic nature of Western classical music symbolized the fruitful coexistence of diverse ideas, in short, democracy, because of the effort it takes to listen intently and play in harmony with others. This view was also a central theme in the early Republican era musical reforms that called for the exclusion of Ottoman art music in an attempt to create a new, national music by combining polyphonic Western musical technique with the monophonic melodies of Turkish folk music. Similarly, another participant suggested that polyphonic music had a lot to offer Turkey in this respect, referring to the cultural diversity governed through political polarization, and proposed a common ground for harmony.

> In fact, classical music brings a kind of wisdom in the face of different ideas. That is, to listen first and then speak. I mean, the idea in front of you may not belong to you. It may not interest you. Nevertheless, you listen to it and then you speak, you don't jump in the middle. Also, whether you believe in this idea or not, whether it is your belief or not, you respect it and see what you can do. You try to find a middle way. This is what we do in polyphony. No idea can be erased with a pen. It needs to be evaluated. (personal communication, Appendix A, 141)

> But I think classical western music has a lot to offer to Turkey. You may have listened to folk music until today, I like it by the way, you may have listened to other kinds of music, but I really think the fact that the different things it contains try to unite, try to play together, that a harmony comes out of those different things, that it creates very interesting things, I think it really defines Turkey. Doesn't it? Aren't we very different sometimes? But can't we also be beautiful together? (personal communication, Appendix A, 142)

To summarize, for classical musicians, discipline not only meant practicing regularly or sustaining a strict work ethic, but operated as moral guidance by describing a way of existing in the society. The internalized rationalities of hierarchy and authority that helped them achieve harmony in the polyphonic orchestra mapped out their vision for coexistence in the public and political spheres.

6.1.4 Being emotionally sensitive

In a contrasting addition to relentless discipline, the participants of this study shared that emotional sensitivity takes up a sizable space in the professional subjectivities of classical musicians. The notions of empathy, emotional reflection, even therapy, were often used when describing the experience of playing an instrument and performing on stage. While some participants used their instruments as a tool for emotional regulation, some revealed that musicians 'daily lives are quite dramatic due to the intensity of emotions they move through as part of their profession.

> You know, we actually have something great that you can reflect all your emotional states. I mean, people who don't play an instrument try to paint, take a walk, do sports... We do it too, of course, but we actually have something very, very important, like therapy. (personal communication, Appendix A, 143)

> We are not easy people mentally. We are unhappy. I mean, let me be very clear, a very big section of us are going through drama big time. (personal communication, Appendix A, 144)

One participant suggested that being a classical musician requires a certain level of emotional control along with authenticity, as if they were actors, because they are expected to mimic a composer's emotional landscape, even when they go through intense experiences themselves. Another participant found themselves to be empathizing too much, and wondered if that was due to being a musician, growing up or having moved to Turkey where emotions run high.

> My music is how I feel about myself. Of course, we are also theater people. There are soloists who lose their mothers and play concerts that evening. This is also a very sacred thing, but of course this is not something I can do, by the way. Still, as musicians we should be able to control our emotions at some point, even if not by much. Because we serve the composer and we have to play the composer's emotions anyway. That's why we should also have a great sense of empathy. (personal communication, Appendix A, 145)

> Since I came to Turkey, I have started to empathize a lot with people. Is this related to my profession? But I empathize a little too much. When that happens, I mean, I experience emotions intensely. Automatically, I have difficulty in that regard. Maybe it's related to my character, finding your own self? Because I didn't have such a thing very much. I had the ability to empathize within natural limits. I mean, it wasn't this much. (personal communication, Appendix A, 146)

The lived reality of a classical musician's subjectivity can be paradoxical, especially in Istanbul; disciplined but reflexive, Western but of Orient, statist in training but neoliberal in practice. These contradictions make up the unique circumstances in which conservatory graduates navigate their passion for their craft, to varying degrees of professional satisfaction.

6.1.5 Feeling fulfilled

Despite the complex web of challenges narrated up to this point, most participants of this study agreed on the fact that playing their instrument, especially as a small group or an orchestra, gave them immense joy and spiritual fulfillment. They described being surrounded by beautiful sounds and participating in the music with their own instrument as an experience that makes all their troubles and hard work feel "worth it". Performing not only feels good in the moment, overcoming the challenge of practicing for hours, even years on end, to finally put together a piece to be enjoyed emerges as meaningful labor that elevates the performer.

> You are in the middle of music that you can't get with the best sound system, the best headphones, and you join in. I mean, even keeping the rhythm to a song gives you a lot of pleasure, or accompanying it with your voice gives you a lot of pleasure. Being inside that music with an instrument is a very

> very beautiful thing. And I felt really good doing that. Or when I brought forth a piece after practicing a lot, I'd say "it was worth the effort." You get a lot of pleasure from that of course. The dopamine and things. I mean, the brain chemicals, you feel really nice. (personal communication, Appendix A, 147)

Another highlight of being a musician was defined as the opportunity to connect with their audience emotionally, both while performing and hearing them applaud afterwards. Perhaps because appreciation is so rare, one participant was deeply touched when the concert hall was almost full on a snowy night in Istanbul, and people cared enough to be there. Though, for some, this feeling of connection seemed to end when the performance was over and they returned to their lives off-stage, replaced by the sense of not quite fitting in, as a result of an ongoing "culture clash".

> I don't know, I think it's a beautiful thing. To be able to relate to the other side, to reflect your feelings while you play on the other side and the big applause you receive for that is really a very strange thing. For example yesterday we had a concert and because it's snowing a lot in Istanbul right now all concerts are getting canceled, and ours hadn't. Despite the snow a lot of people came. I mean it was very cold out. It was full, the hall was 75% full. I mean it was a beautiful concert. And at the end we had so much applause. (personal communication, Appendix A, 148)

> No matter what, when I sit down in that chair to perform, I forget everything and remember how sacred of a work I'm doing from the moment I play the first note. In fact it begins when I place the violin on my shoulder. It's that kind of thing. But when it's over, you close your case, head to the metrobus and face reality. You face reality constantly and when asked what it's like to be a musician in Turkey, like, every day of your life you're experiencing culture clash. You experience that all the time. There's constant conflict. In your head there's something you want to be, a life you want to live, and a personality, a character you feel belonging to and an environment which doesn't allow you. It's such a way of life. (personal communication, Appendix A, 149)

For one participant, fulfillment came from achieving a stable job, like an engineer or a doctor could. When they secured a tenured seat in the state orchestra, they felt as though they made their child self feel complete, just because the odds of success

were low but they tried anyway. One participant emphasized that they considered themselves lucky because they could "find a response" (*karşılık bulmak*) without having to depend on political maneuvers to carve a space for themselves.

> I told my family, "there's your government job. [Can you claim] I studied music for nothing?" You mention engineers or doctors… This is it, I mean. Thinking of the 10 year old girl I was, "I did it. Somehow it happened." For some it's an ordinary thing. "So what if you landed a job?" And it's not a job you make millions. It doesn't make enough for everything. I can't buy a house nor a car if I saved. But I think I paid my debt to myself. I paid the emotional thing. I said [to myself], you're it. (personal communication, Appendix A, 150)

> I think I'm lucky as a musician. Why? Profession-wise, I didn't choose the things based very much on relationships and what reward I got was enough for me. I don't like, I mean, I don't want more. Like in any sector, it can happen. It exists. But because I find that I think of myself as a musician who was rewarded [for their efforts], I feel lucky. That's why I take pressure well. I'm happy to work a lot. (personal communication, Appendix A, 151)

As the participants' narratives show, for classical musicians, fulfillment was not found through chasing financial wealth or a comfortable daily routine, but by having the opportunity to actualize themselves through musical performance in their own genre and field. It was in the rare moments they could feel in alignment with their artistic subjectivities that they found the motivation to persist in their field. However, this sense of alignment relied on more than artistic expression. It was tied to being able to sustain a basic living standard through music, to remain motivated and inspired, and to keep the emotional sensitivity that their profession required and fostered. As these conditions become harder to sustain within a precarious field, their motivation to stay committed is threatened, along with the possibility of inspiring younger generations to follow their footsteps.

6.2 Support mechanisms for classical musicians

6.2.1 Family, instructors and peers

All participants of this study emphasized how crucial external support, or lack thereof, has been to their processes of musical development and finding employment. The participants who had the backing of cultural, financial and emotional capital to support them thrived, while the ones who lacked in any of these types of support tried to compensate by relying on other sources, such as scholarships, tutors, mentors or extreme dedication. The ones who had insufficient support ended up cutting ties with their musical aspirations and moving on to other paths.

The lack of a musical background, or at least an informed direction from their families, meant that participants often started their journeys at a later age and relied more heavily on instructors for guidance, a secondary source of cultural and emotional capital. One participant puts this as follows: "I think what happens is, because families don't know they don't want to meddle too much and it becomes something like, "you've got the ball, doc." Should I say communication breaks down at that point?" (personal communication, Appendix A, 152) Even if one's parents were involved in their technical development, they could only support their child by echoing their instructor's advice. The lack of musical knowledge in the family sometimes led students to feel pressured or unsupported, because their parents would not feel confident enough to decide if and when their child needed relaxation, encouragement or practice time. In contrast, for one participant, it was their musician mother who helped them start off right by instilling in them a disciplined practice habit, which made their development faster and education much less stressful in comparison to their peers.

> For example, my mother took what the professor who trained me for conservatory said, "if you want to graduate mediocre, just do what you can with your talent and graduate, but if you want to graduate [at a better level], you will work [hard]," and beat me over the head with it for years. (personal communication, Appendix A, 153)

> If it wasn't for my mother… I don't think any child would get up at six and start practicing. I mean, if they don't have a bond of passion or if it's not something difficult to reach, no one wants to work hard, of course. A bit of a push is needed. She cared for me by poking me to work harder. In fact I have another such friend, whose father almost learned violin himself so that he could teach my friend. That's why I think parents have a big role for those who start young, and for music education, you have to start young. (personal communication, Appendix A, 154)

A student's instructor was also fundamental for their development and future paths. One participant felt that their "good instructor" made playing so easy that they decided to analyze their teaching techniques to write a doctoral dissertation. While another participant struggled with "bad instructors", their family had to help them achieve their goals by paying for private lessons. Later, their "good instructor" helped them find jobs by introducing them to their professional networks.

> There's my own teacher, of course, first of all. In fact, I have such a thing. I am now working on my PhD thesis on him. What does he do pedagogically, how does he start students, how does he keep them going, or how does he change someone he took in at an older age, and so on. I mean, he... He somehow teaches everyone as if he is doing something with a magic wand. And he teaches as if it is very easy. (personal communication, Appendix A, 155)

> My family made it easy for me to get where I am now. It is also because of my family that helped me recover after high school. Later on, during this period, because I couldn't find a job after graduation, it was my family who helped me during that period. The fact that I took lessons for ten years, or that we bought three violins… (personal communication, Appendix A, 156)

> I think one of my professors helped me a lot in my current life. This is the teacher I worked with at the end of high school and did my master's degree. They improved me a lot. Both as a violinist and as a person. I learned a lot of things about the violin in that process, which I still use, and they gave me my first job. They supported me a lot. They are the person who supported me the most in terms of my violin playing. (personal communication, Appendix A, 157)

If a student's financial resources were limited, they would struggle with buying materials, such as strings or instruments, or go without proper guidance in case of dealing with a "bad instructor". One participant mentioned never owning their instrument and relying on the one provided by their institution, and more importantly, not being able to afford private lessons even when they really needed a "good instructor" to thrive. This meant that they didn't really form an attachment to their instrument, or their instructor, making it difficult for them to cope with the demands of their training. Although a lack of funds did not entirely determine whether a student would succeed or not, it added a layer of struggle that they needed strength or strategies to overcome.

> I really wish I could have done something like [taking private lessons]. Because my ability to learn from a person who talks so much nonsense and says such things, it was so weak, but on the other hand, we didn't have the means. I mean, I couldn't convince my family that I wanted to take private lessons, so I didn't even try. (personal communication, Appendix A, 158)

If a student lacked emotional support, and found themselves having to endure harsh criticism from their instructor, they would lose their confidence and struggle with motivation. In these cases, musical practice stopped being enjoyable and became a chore instead. One participant mentioned that their piano teacher from high school, who was their "good instructor", motivated them to finish their training at the conservatory when they were considering dropping out.

> Honestly, I wasn't very happy at the conservatory. Psychologically, I wasn't very happy. But again, that high school teacher motivated me. You know, like, come and do it together, finish the conservatory here. That's how I came back again. I mean, she was such an important person for me. If it wasn't for her, maybe I wouldn't have even studied my undergraduate degree in Istanbul. Maybe I wouldn't have even graduated from this department. (personal communication, Appendix A, 159)

Another major source of emotional support was musicians ’peers. One participant mentioned that the best form of encouragement was not the applause from the audience, nor the appreciation of their instructors, but the recognition of their abilities by their peers. They viewed their peers as the ones who can best empathize with their situation, and their support meant so much as they knew how hard it was to get as far. Peer support was also indispensable when students financially struggled and felt lacking in comparison to more well off classmates. One participant suggested that these students would “see” and understand each other’s struggles, offering emotional support to one another.

> By the way, the best compliment a musician can receive is from another. Not from the audience, not from the professor. Because we understand each other. We all know this is difficult work. We all know how insane we’ve gone on this road. Therefore, if you’re giving your fellow musicians their efforts ’ worth, it’s a very precious thing. It was one of the biggest compliments I received. A friend I love very much, a very close friend, who’s also a violinist, said, “I’ll never be able to do what you just did.” They said, “it’s really strange that you’re not getting arrogant doing this, I have so much respect,” and I was like, I slept well that day. (personal communication, Appendix A, 160)

> My school friends were middle class. I was coming from a family that wasn’t wealthy. I grew up with difficulties, financial difficulties. They were, say, ninety percent were better off than I was. Of course you notice others like yourself and you start a friendship through empathy. I mean, people are like this, they find others like themselves and get closer. (personal communication, Appendix A, 161)

To summarize, as students, participants depended on the technical guidance and patience of their instructors; financial support, discipline and structure from their parents, as well as the empathy and encouragement of their peers. All these support mechanisms remained just as necessary after the participants graduated and looked for stable jobs.

6.2.2 State Support

The role of the state in supporting classical musicians was discussed many times during my fieldwork. Participants with longer careers observed a dramatic shift over the years in the living standards, career opportunities and the symbolic value of classical musicians in the public eye, resulting from the diminishing support of the state at the discursive and institutional levels. Although there are no studies readily available that compare the amount of financial support provided by the state over the years[2], younger musicians shared many stories of the good old days that they heard from senior colleagues, often with an accompanying sense of isolation and frustration.

As stated earlier, permanent positions in the state orchestras and conservatories were considered to be the most dependable sources of income among conservatory graduates in Istanbul. However, these positions are found to be very limited because there are only two major state supported classical music orchestras in the city, and new positions are available only when existing members retire, the timing of which is unforeseeable to candidates. In contrast, an experienced musician shared that although options were similarly limited in terms of different paths a conservatory graduate can pick, they did not feel as though they had to choose out of necessity because very few musicians graduated at a given time. There used to be a balance between open positions and the number of new graduates.

> Most likely, you're either the only one or one of very few. And like you said, yes, there were orchestras at the time. But there weren't many opportunities for permanent positions. Still, they were holding auditions back then. They actually offered me a few options, like, "Would you like to join the symphony orchestra, or would you prefer to stay at the school and pursue an academic career?" So it wasn't something I chose out of necessity. (personal communication, Appendix A, 162)

[2] I examined the Ministry of Culture and Tourism's budget over the years; however, I was unable to find any data specifying the funds allocated to classical music.

The selection process for orchestral positions was also debated. Many, if not all, participants agreed that the evaluations were far from being transparent, and there were even instances where the names of the selected candidates were altered after being announced. One participant suggested that the selecting authorities would be "embarrassed" to rule someone out if they were clearly exceptional, but that didn't mean everyone was accepted because they fulfilled the criteria of being exceptional. Another participant mentioned that they were afraid of being ruled out due to discrimination because of their Alevi heritage. In short, candidates did not trust the selection process and some graduates even stopped auditioning after a while because they did not want to waste time or resources. Where the state's criteria for the selection of candidates were perceived as arbitrary, or worse, politically motivated, there was no incentive to risk failure on graduates 'part, except for the motivation to reclaim the cultural space that they felt was being taken away from their hands.

> For example there was the score altering event. When, I think 3 or so years ago. Someone's, a few people's in fact, scores were altered, the test they passed was made like they hadn't and others were accepted etc… Then they sued and won, for example. (personal communication, Appendix A, 163)

> Is there corruption in aptitude tests, it's always a topic of debate of course, but… I think if you're good enough, they'd be embarrassed at some point. "Not that far" they'd probably say, but would you have to be that good… (personal communication, Appendix A, 164)

> Attendance period is also painful. And you're thinking these things too, we're in Turkey. I mean, there's nothing wrong with saying that. Everyone knows. There's nepotism, there's the background check (GBT). The background check is such a menace. Like, you attended the smallest thing, there's something in your family. I don't know, they accused someone of being whatever. That's written in your file. And I'm a bit, culturally too… Being from the east in Turkey, being alevi etc. has an effect so I was scared. It took eight or so months for the results to be released. (personal communication, Appendix A, 165)

> That's also the reason I got into Istanbul State Opera and Ballet. I wasn't going to, a friend convinced me to. I signed up. Why, because I remembered that the Opera and Ballet is a state organization not something that belongs to the current administration. Hence, it should not be left in the wrong hands. Someone needs to protect it. Now that I decided to stay here, then… It's our duty to protect these organizations that go back so much longer than any administration and that will go on so much further. (personal communication, Appendix A, 166)

Many participants shared that they heard from the older generations that when the Istanbul State Symphony Orchestra was first founded, members of state orchestras were paid the same salary as members of parliament, highlighting the value the state used to attribute to arts and artists. The participants who are the new members of state orchestras note that their current salary is nowhere near that amount, and not even sufficient to afford living on their own in Istanbul. One participant mentioned working five jobs in total, including their position at one of the state orchestras, and still not having the living standard old members used to enjoy. Through this new rationality of governance, the classical musician who was once supported and protected by the state was now being governed as an entrepreneur responsible for their own security and welfare.

> For example it was being discussed the other day. Back in the day, government musicians, say, someone playing in the Istanbul State Symphony Orchestra could buy a house within a year. They were getting paid the same as members of the parliament. I think back when the symphony was first founded. Of course something like that isn't possible now. I mean, perhaps that was how much they were valued back then. As much as a parliament member. (personal communication, Appendix A, 167)

> Last year I played at the theater, CRR Symphony, Gedik Philharmonics, Opera and Ballet, and one more thing. Five things, all the time, and outside of that, say, a pop gathering, Istanbul Symphonietta, this, that, like, things with different names, from venues, "we need a concert, can you put it together,"… You put that all together, you can't provide the salary, the purchasing power of an 80s or 90s artist working for the State Opera and Ballet. Back then they made enough money to buy houses and cars every year. These people bought summer houses in Bodrum or Cesme. Why? Because artists were valued. Teacher, artist, doctor, pilot, say, a professor, scientist etc. [were] making money, I mean. (personal communication, Appendix A, 168)

For musicians without state funded jobs, conditions were dire. They worked without social security or contracts, as no state mechanism enforced this obligation on employers who hired musicians on a project basis. Participants recalled feeling extremely vulnerable when the COVID-19 pandemic hit, as they suddenly lost their incomes with no recognition or support from the state to help them cope with the extraordinary circumstances. This way, the state ensured that private enterprises would always have access to an abundance of highly skilled and economically desperate professionals to choose from, at a low-cost.

> There's no insurance. There is no insurance anywhere. There is no insurance in any of these reinforcement works and all of this is known. But nothing is done about it. Only when I went to Bursa Symphony for reinforcement, they gave me daily insurance. Normally they can, they all can. But what they say is, "Instead of giving you this, we'll give you more money." And they draw a path like that. (personal communication, Appendix A, 169)

> Let's say teaching, you are teaching somewhere and COVID happened. You keep getting paid. During COVID we couldn't earn anything. Because we weren't already signed anywhere. And it became as if no one owed us any money. (personal communication, Appendix A, 170)

The participants also mentioned that in addition to the established cultural codes, the deteriorating economic conditions in the country led to a decline in people's ability to prioritize concert attendance or other art shows, allowing only the wealthy to partake in these events. As a result, high arts, especially classical music, increasingly came to be perceived as a domain that belongs exclusively to the wealthy, and problems of artists were rendered invisible. The participants themselves felt vulnerable because they could not afford the lifestyle that would allow them to produce quality work, and deeply empathized with audiences who could not devote time or energy into appreciating high arts.

> Anyway, art in Turkey is a rich people's profession. So in order to be able to do this, in our conservatory, in order for me to do this with a comfortable psychology, I shouldn't have to worry about money. And I should be able to spend hours in a room with the most beautiful instrument, without worrying about anything, what I'm going to eat tonight, whether my laundry is done, whether I have work to do. That's the kind of job it is. Otherwise, if you think, "I have to go to class, I have to do this and that for my rent," you can't find time for your own work. (personal communication, Appendix A, 171)

> I mean, a man who is struggling to make a living cannot try to understand Beethoven. He can't try to understand the difference in style between Beethoven and Brahms. You can't explain this, they can't go and compare Picasso's painting with Rembrandt's painting, you can't expect that from that person. First of all, you will give that person that freedom, that economic power, that level of happiness. You will offer that level of welfare, you have to offer it anyway. (personal communication, Appendix A, 172)

> Also, the way people dress at classical music concerts, the way people stand, the way they look at each other, the categorization in society, since you don't try to solve this as a policy, that person feels very bad when they go to that hall. I mean, they feel excluded, they don't feel like they belong, they look at their own clothes, they look at the other person, they feel ashamed, when they accidentally clap between parts, [the conductor] turns around and gives them a look... (personal communication, Appendix A, 173)

Participants also stated repeatedly that classical music education can be very expensive. Financial aid for students whose families lack the funds to support their education was another expectation placed on the state. One participant, who credited the government aid for foreign students as being indispensable for them to study music in Istanbul, mentioned that such support was not officially offered before and adjustments had to be made so that they could receive this scholarship. Otherwise, there was no mention of any financial assistance for music students from the state throughout my fieldwork. One participant emphasized that although tuition was free at state conservatories, they had to seek private lessons for 10 years due to institutional inadequacies, and pointed at the contrast between state support in Turkey and in European countries, where students enjoyed accommodations in times of need.

> So I don't think there is any support from the government. I don't know. There was no support even during the COVID period. Or, for example, they sent instruments to the homes of students in Europe, etc. during the COVID period, so many things happened. These are all government support… Or competitions. There are none of these either. I have never encountered anything that the government has opened, that the government has supported. In other words, the government has never supported me personally. I didn't pay for education at school. But I would like to add that I had to take private lessons for 10 years. (personal communication, Appendix A, 174)

> Now maybe you have heard of it. There is something called "Turkey Scholarships", "YTB". There is a big scholarship program that Turkey provides for foreign students. Now you will say that it is a state school, you know, maybe you didn't pay much money, but when people of other countries study at a state school, they pay a considerable amount of tuition fees, that is, compared to Turkish students. So they paid for five and a half years. I also lived in a dormitory, and they gave me money every month, an allowance to live on. That was my biggest supporter during my undergrad. I mean, if it wasn't for that, I probably wouldn't have been able to study in Istanbul anyway. Because I am not the only child of my family. My family's financial situation was not very bright either. So that helped a lot. If it wasn't for that, I probably wouldn't have been able to study, even though I was accepted. (personal communication, Appendix A, 175)

Another issue problematized by the participants regarding cultural policies was the lack of communication between decision makers and artists. The renovation of Atatürk Cultural Center and the decision to relocate the Istanbul State Conservatory from Kadıköy to Maltepe were highly contested among the participants. The new *Atatürk Kültür Merkezi* (AKM) was found insufficient in terms of acoustics and the new location for the conservatory discouraged many students from applying, leading to a significant drop in applicant quality. The participants felt as though their needs were not understood by authorities, which reinforced the belief that their field was being officially sidelined.

> For example, AKM was closed for years. And the hall that was built had nothing to do with classical music. Acoustically. And they provided it with microphones. In other words, they opened such a ridiculous place. So the people working in it are also unhappy. I don't remember the old AKM from my childhood, but my mother tells me about it, like this, the rotating stage, the elevator going up to the stage, the decor changing like that. For example, it has turned into a place where acoustics are provided with a descending

> microphone and you can't make a sound audible with anything natural. (personal communication, Appendix A, 176)
>
> I one hundred percent think the [demand] for Istanbul University State Conservatory is decreasing. You can already tell by the number of students who registered and applied after they moved there. Of course, people prefer institutions that are more central, that they can reach more easily... There is already such a problem with traffic, so as I said, they may prefer institutions in more central places. (personal communication, Appendix A, 177)
>
> In fact, the demand is probably low because they are now accepting people with the aptitude test who they would never have bothered to take into conservatories. In other words, they can also accept people who would not pass. I guess the demand has dropped. (personal communication, Appendix A, 178)

One participant in particular mentioned finding the opening of new concert halls around the country, such as the Merinos Cultural Center in Bursa, promising, and the state rather supportive of the classical music field. They supported this position by pointing out that many of their friends were able to become tenured, qualified professors were being promoted within institutions, and that the strategy to organize "alaturca" concerts performed by the Presidential Symphony Orchestra (CSO) was successful in attracting new audiences and popularizing classical music in Ankara. However, the participant described this attempt as "alaturkalaştırma" (reorientation to alaturca, as opposed to Westernization), and a conscious move by the government aimed at attracting their voter base, who were perceived as being culturally distant to the genre.

> I don't think anything got worse with the AKP. I only saw improvement. Say, Merinos Culture Center Culture opened in Bursa. Fethiye Culture Center was very bad. Merinos Culture Center opened and we had a much better hall. The CSO building in Bursa got renewed and they built an excellent building, etc. Also because they're using this as a form of advertisement, I don't think the government caused a recession here. But there are things like these. When you go into, say, CSO, you see an Emel Sayın concert. It's not only western or classical music, they also incorporated more A la Turka stuff too. They are also trying to do things like someone coming there for the Emel Sayın concert should also say, "oh there's also the symphony here." There's this idea of, let him come and go, interact with the other one. Hence, we didn't see a

> deterioration. We only, in a way, only saw improvement in a way. (personal communication, Appendix A, 179)

> I mean, a lot of my friends got into positions in state orchestras. In directorships, people I knew to be good professors became directors. These chairs switch often. It's not like the old days when someone would stay there for 20 years. There's a circulation like that. I think the government is giving support that way. I mean as I said, there's an A la Turka-ification. And that's because they want to pull their own voters that way I think. (personal communication, Appendix A, 180)

A fundamental expectation of the graduates aimed at the state was a revision of the conservatory model. All participants underlined the necessity to reorganize the conservatory education system based on new information and contemporary methodologies. The addition of physical education for musicians to the curriculum, age appropriate teaching methods for different stages of musical education, digital libraries and new technologies that allow students to listen to and record music, and facilities that promote the wellbeing of students and instructors were listed as important changes that the state could initiate to support classical music. Language barriers of graduates were also stated to limit their options to for traveling and expanding their horizons, due to the insufficient focus on foreign language acquisition. One participant states "The foreign language deficiency is definitely very, very large in education. The reason why most of our friends at the conservatory couldn't open up to the world, even if they are very good instrumentalists." (personal communication, Appendix A, 181) These expectations described a need and a vision to reshape the subjectivity of a conservatory-trained classical musician, through an institutional reform that could only be materialized by state power.

> So, of course, I think it should be separated by age. For example in Bilkent. Let's say a young child is taught by a different teacher. As they get older, the teachers change. I mean, a person doesn't have to teach a very advanced level and at the same time teach something very basic. (personal communication, Appendix A, 182)

> I consider the fact that my high school teacher was different as a chance, an extra. Or maybe we call it luck in Turkey, but maybe it would have been completely different if there had been a pedagogical training. After all, I realized that with some of my students I found myself acting like them. I feel sad. Of course I don't want it to be like that, but when you are exposed to it for a certain period of time, you start to resemble it. (personal communication, Appendix A, 183)

> We played so many programs, we don't know how to make a recording. We weren't taught how. We didn't have the opportunity in University either. If we had done such things, we could do our own "marketing" on social media with it. (personal communication, Appendix A, 184)

> They could create environments where the educators are happier so they could approach their students more positively. I don't know, maybe, are they unhappy because of that? Even the buildings they're teaching at are very make-shift. (personal communication, Appendix A, 185)

The participants 'narratives were rich with unfulfilled expectations from the state. But these expectations were disguised beneath expressions of negative experiences, comparison with other countries, and the stories of glory from the past. Many participants did not explicitly ask for improvements through institutional or formal channels, and instead, internalized their struggles as natural consequences of the political discrimination of their field and individual life choices. They refrained from targeting the government for fear of being singled out as a group, as they faced many instances of being threatened with various conservatory departments being shut down. Therefore, the graduates not only dealt with precarity and exhaustion, they also had to keep silent in order to stay out of the government's radar.

6.2.3 Private sector support

As previously stated, the private orchestras funded by major corporations to support high arts and commercial art events were found to be filling the employment gap that exists due to the increasing number of conservatory graduates and the steady number of state-funded positions. Although major private orchestras such as the Borusan

Philharmonic Orchestra provided long-term employment to a limited number of exceptional musicians, high-quality art events of smaller scales operated with short-lived ensembles. One participant who forms such orchestras described their selection criteria as follows:

> To be considered a good musician one has to have orchestra experience, be good at his instrument, be able to act together, have discipline too. In fact this doesn't define a young musician. It doesn't, to be honest, so what are we doing? We're putting together an orchestra, and personally I do this; there are young friends, new graduates, looking for jobs. Some of them are just finding jobs. As soon as I have openings, I invite them to those. Why is that? Because they need the experience. They need to gain experience in the right place. I think as much as I can I must provide the right place, so these friends can gain experience, and honestly make money. So that they can survive and see what it's like to work at the right place personally I even try to protect them a little. (personal communication, Appendix A, 186)

As delivered by the participant in their own words, new graduates who are navigating the job market trying to build their careers need plenty of experience and exposure to prove themselves to gatekeepers before they can consistently be invited to perform at privately-funded high-quality events. This period of building experience and rapport is spent with the sense of frustration graduates felt upon having to perform at gigs below their skill level and mostly irrelevant to their training, such as weddings, pop concerts and commercials.

According to participants, another way for private organizations to support classical music is through competitions. Although these competitions require extensive practice and increase the candidates 'mental load, winners are awarded advanced training opportunities as well as funds and prestigious reputations that boost their career prospects. However, one participant suggests, not all competitions are created equal. While the prestigious and well-known competitions reward high levels of technical competence in contestants, some function as mere CV builders

where winning results do not reflect excellence. In these cases, students are left wondering why their success in competitions does not translate into recognition from gatekeepers.

> There are competitions for state orchestras to pick young soloists. These are very nice opportunities, auditions held for that. But of course world wide competitions are mostly supported by certain foundations. You know, I mean, in Europe, in America… In this business the state —of course provides some support— but the gist of it is, there are many other organizations. Each is capable of maintaining its own cycle. Both financially and systemically. Hence, there…are other types of private support provided. I mean, for example, there are special awards. We see it in competitions, awards in the name of certain people, awards from a lot of different foundations… in the form of "something special award". And this other thing happens too. There's this trend. Students are applying, they're constantly applying to competitions.These competitions—the ones inside that negative trend—of course have this thing; for the sake of continuity, they have for every participant almost 70 first places, 20 second places, certificate of achievement for everyone, whatever… I'm, like, exaggerating a bit of course but when this happens the kid won't return empty handed, he'll think, "I won first place, I won whatever." Alright, it's a nice motivation but still… It's still packaging. I mean, inherently there's no actual achievement here. (personal communication, Appendix A, 187)

While private sector support is perceived as being crucial for the sustainability of the classical music field in Istanbul, the criteria for who gets it is highly competitive, which further demonstrates the precarity of the profession. The absence of state supervision allows room for exploitation, as observed in the graduates 'narratives describing real-life conditions.

6.2.4 Societal support

Societal support for classical music in Istanbul can be observed as a form of political and cultural self-preservation. The participants stated that while the general public was mostly distant to the classical music genre, there was indeed an audience keen to support classical musicians and their sector, the supporters of the main opposition party in Turkey. These groups, especially older citizens, are mentioned to regularly

visit certain concert halls and fill the seats in most events, in order to symbolically resist the sidelining of the foundational values of the republic. And lately, the participants observed, the popularization of classical music events on social media helped attract younger groups in addition to the regulars, to the point that participants were not able to find tickets for themselves.

> Yes, Sureyya has an audience. Kadikoy has a certain CHP supporting audience. And lately this sort of thing happened. Sureyya Opera got popular on Instagram suddenly. You might've even seen ballet and opera performances at the AKM began to be popular. Like, "take your date to the opera," etc. Things like this. Activities to do in Kadikoy, like, "you can see a concert in Sureyya Opera," they shoot such things. That's why it was full yesterday. (personal communication, Appendix A, 188)

> The Nutcracker was played during the winter season, I couldn't find a ticket. Right now for example, there's La Traviata and no tickets. I mean, I'm sure most don't last until the second act but it's sold out. I couldn't go to Nutcracker for example, I haven't been able to go for two years. (personal communication, Appendix A, 189)

One participant spoke of how important the support from the audience is for the future of classical music and suggested that while the European people have a natural desire to protect their own heritage from disappearing, the Istanbul audience also must have a strong motivation to keep buying tickets for classical music events in the rate that they do, for a reason. Because the political polarization in the country leads secular groups to feel like their lifestyles are being threatened with extinction, the participant emphasized that children are brought to concerts, to preserve the cultural values symbolized by classical Western music for the next generations of musicians and citizens.

> I have extraordinary respect for a family living in any neighborhood in Istanbul, pay for tickets and listen to an opera for 3 hours. I have extraordinary respect. This is an unbelievable thing. And I think we owe our existence now to those people. I know in Europe this is more cultural since it's been done for centuries. I see them supporting it as a culture that came out of them. Recently in March I went to a concert in Concert House. The average age was high there. But every concert is full. Full full

> full. They're all full. I mean it's something that's still being bought. I see it's something that's purchased in Turkey. When they step away from something a little, people even take care of those left on the other side. I think western classical music became a little like that. (personal communication, Appendix A, 190)

The societal support for classical musicians enables them to sustain themselves both economically and psychologically by affirming their place in the cultural sphere. Although the participants feel the material effects of the shifting preferences of the official aesthetic discourse daily, they can still find a stage thanks to the continuous support to their field, and reflect to the audience a sense of resilience through their public visibility.

6.3 Changes in the conservatory education and the future of classical music

The classical Western music conservatories were founded as part of a mission that sought to construct a modern Turkish citizen who devotes themselves to working tirelessly to master modern techniques and raise the nation's level of development to match and exceed those of contemporary civilizations. Reflecting this mission, the subjectivities of classical musicians in Turkey were shaped by strict and observant master-apprentice dynamics through state institutions that aimed to produce disciplined, hard-working and docile subjects. However, the participants of this study shared many observations of change in the education and parenting styles, and in the new generation of students, that informed their imaginations of the future of classical music as well.

Reflecting on the beginning of their journeys, most participants described a strict learning environment that had little room for slacking. They were expected to constantly strive for excellence and practice for hours on end, placing their musical training above all other passions. Nowadays, especially the participants who teach

younger generations, speak about adopting a softer approach. While still emphasizing the importance of regular and effective practice, they also find that students need to enjoy practicing and have agency over their practice time. One participant mentioned never telling their students that they "must" practice, and instead, explaining to them in detail the consequences of not practicing and letting them decide. This approach signals a shift in the education style that mirrors the rationality of the neoliberal entrepreneurial subject, as it instills a responsibility of self-cultivation to the student instead of the instructors pushing or punishing them.

> For example, when I was told to practice I never could because I can never practice the violin under pressure. That's why I never tell my students to practice. I never say you must practice. Because, in fact I always say this, practice is a requirement. You aren't obligated but to get better, it takes practice. Someone who fulfills requirements to do things in life will fulfill this too. But you aren't obligated to practice. But the consequences of not fulfilling that requirement are this and this and this, I'm explaining. (personal communication, Appendix A, 191)

Another participant mentioned being terrified of performing before others as a young student, even though they liked practicing on their own just fine. Now, as an instructor, they actively try to make performance a regular, low stakes occasion for their students, and associate it with a reward. "I think performances should be associated with something nice, like a weekend routine. 'This weekend we're having a pizza party and we're playing these and these. 'I think instrumentalism could turn into a nice profession then." (personal communication, Appendix A, 192) This method can be perceived as a more precise technology of conditioning the subject, because it frames performance as a desirable activity instead of a terrifying risk of humiliation for students.

According to participants, the "softening" of the training approach may also have a downside. The new generation of students are found to lack discipline and

respect for authority, which the participants found crucial for their own technical and professional development. However, they attributed this change to a generational shift in parenting styles. The participants emphasize that while their own parents used to strictly recite their instructor's advice, today, parents refuse to hear anything but how talented their children are. One participant states "Everyone sees their child as a Mozart. My child is very good, my child is like this. They don't usually prefer teachers who give negative criticism or say something negative. They don't want to hear." (personal communication, Appendix A, 193) In other words, the changing subjectivities of the parents requires new ways for their children to be treated by the instructors, which are in conflict with the traditional approach.

> Now in their (early republic) time population is smaller, and there's a desire for development, and thankfully it's believed that this could be done through art, in that period. And with an enormous expectation, there's a highly disciplined, very strict, often destructive system of education and until our time it became more flexible of course. This has pros and cons. Nowadays, ofr example when a teacher warns a student, the student is able to say, "because you gave me a warning, because you scolded me I can't play right now." It's corruption, of course, I mean it's this thing going off the rails, something like this can't happen. In the end the teacher is an authority, the person who knows and musicianship is a master-apprentice relationship anyway. (personal communication, Appendix A, 194)

> I experienced this in private lessons. Say after two sessions, "why don't you teach me to play the whatever melody from Beethoven?" Why would I teach you? You're just barely pressing the keys. But this happens because everyone's child is a prodigy. (personal communication, Appendix A, 195)

One participant pointed out that it is not only the parents 'or the students 'behaviour that results in the diminishing of instructors 'authority, suggesting that the quality of instructors also play a role. While good instructors can naturally evoke a sense of authority, it seems that others may find it increasingly hard to get the new generation to take them seriously.

> The students don't have a, how should I say it, a limit toward the teacher. They can treat them like a random person. But I think it's two-sided too. I don't think authority can be facilitated [thorough despotism]. I don't like that kind of authority one bit. I think if there's a knowledgeable person in front of you, one finds themselves behaving with respect, so for that reason I think it's two-sided. (personal communication, Appendix A, 196)

The participants suggested that there has been an inclination in conservatories towards employing their graduates that are unfit for solo or orchestral performance as instructors, which could explain their diminished authority over the new generation. One participant contrasted this conduct to the foundational years of conservatories in Turkey, where they state merit was of utmost importance, drawing a parallel between the drop in graduates 'and instructors 'skill levels over the years.

> When I graduated at the age of 21, there were many good musicians in my generation. And many of these very good musicians got jobs, and those who got jobs joined orchestras or moved abroad. Those who couldn't create these options, I'm sorry to say, most of them started to become teachers at schools. This was a somewhat romantic decision by conservatories. I mean, I think this is also the case in other professions, "We raised you". "We know you, we trust you, so you should raise people here". But frankly, I thought that to a certain extent, and to a serious extent, friends who could not provide the quality of education became teachers at the school. Well, this actually starts to create a serious tsunami then. So what happens? Education... In fact, when friends who have not paid much attention to education in their own education life go and become educators, this creates a problem of quality. I'm regretfully saying this. (personal communication, Appendix A, 197)

> In Turkey, this work was taken extremely seriously when it started, with the Republic. Atatürk is the main architect of this work. It is thanks to him that I am doing this job today and thanks to him I can make a living from this profession. I can't be unfair. But I mean, this is what he did when he wanted to establish this profession. He wants to open conservatories and the first name he goes to for this is Furtwängler. Furtwängler was the music director of the Berlin Philharmonic at the time. He goes to one of the most competent people in Europe. He doesn't go to a normal person. He doesn't go to someone he knows. He doesn't say my friend has a daughter who plays the violin. He goes to the best. And he says to Furtwängler, "I'm going to establish conservatories here, I'm going to do things like this, can you help us?" And Furtwängler says, "Thank you very much, but I'm not the person you're looking for." He says, "It's Hindemith". That's great. Hindemith is both a musicologist and a composer. He is an extraordinarily qualified person. Hindemith comes here. One of the most important musicologists of the time,

> Bela Bartok, comes here. And they say, "What is the cultural music here? What is the folkloric music here? How much can we adapt it to this system, how much should we adapt it?" These questions are discussed. This is how these foundations are laid. (personal communication, Appendix A, 198)

> In other words, we actually need to say to newly graduated children, 23, 24 years old, "Wow, look at how that kid plays". "Wow, what kids do we have, wow" and they should actually put us out of work. I don't see many such people and I feel sorry for that, let me tell you. Because then this work won't happen here anyway. It would be over. (personal communication, Appendix A, 199)

Another aspect that worried the participants about the future of classical music was the loss of aura in the conservatories. According to one participant, the fading value attributed to artists ended up destroying the "scent of art" that they used to sense upon walking into their conservatory building, leading to the loss of an important source of inspiration as well as a trusted mechanism of subjectivation.

> When I got in what I felt was truly something like back when the republic was founded. I mean, I could perceive the scent of art around me at school, when I got in. It was like, you know, I had this sound in my ear, you know how ants work together all the time. I would have that feeling when I walked through the door. I mean every day. The postures of the professors, these are people I've never seen in my life. I mean, I could see people around me who had managed to develop themselves in a field, before anything else. My upperclass brothers and sisters, the professors, all of them… Those coming and going, their attires… I mean even the care the people were putting into that… Art is everywhere. There's a painting, there's a photo of a composer on the other side, these were all sources of inspiration, really. For when it's valued, when the artist is appreciated. All of these, the composer in the painting, in the photo, the professor walking through the corridor, these are all artists and if you're a person who respects the artist, you smell the art. But the same photos, the same professors, because you aren't showing them the appreciation they deserve, because you can't understand that you need to show that appreciation to be more precise, it's impossible for you to perceive that scent. (personal communication, Appendix A, 200)

The participants also pointed to the relationship between technological developments and students 'attitudes as a factor influencing the future of classical music. According to the participants, students now have a shorter attention span due to the amount of

time they spend on social media, which makes it difficult for them to sustain an effective practice routine. One participant also suggested that the types of content the new generation is being exposed to is very different from what was available for them, leading to major changes in their attitudes towards discipline and authority.

> This is a difficult profession. I mean this is unnervingly difficult. Now we're also working with students. They don't like us at some point. Why, because we tell them to repeat something a lot. My teacher used to say, sometimes you need to practice like an idiot. I mean, without thinking, just the muscle movement you need to repeat for so many times. Nowadays young people grow up with social media. The videos most interesting to them last maybe two minutes. I think this caused a deterioration in their cognition. This is my own idea but I mean, nothing that's worth something in life can be learned in one minute. Sometimes you can learn something even in ten seconds but one minute will not be enough for any skill you want to learn. So I don't know how a generation with this much lack of focus will improve a profession that requires so much focus. (personal communication, Appendix A, 201)

> In our day, we weren't aware of anything. I mean I would see a music video on MTV for example, about sex or drugs. And I mean, I would melt into the ground [in embarrassment]. Just to think these children grew up with this and they're in a different world. For them, anything is acceptable and doable. Everything is normal, I mean, if you grow up seeing something. That's why it's difficult to discipline them. (personal communication, Appendix A, 202)

Another participant mentioned that while it had its disadvantages, social media also helped musicians share their work, especially during the pandemic where they were cut off from performance opportunities. In addition, they revealed that their student's social media account encouraged them to practice more as they received "likes". Therefore, while the institutional sites of subjectivation are certainly losing power over the new generation, with technology, new fields emerge with the potential to shape students directly in accordance with market demands.

> I have a student with autism. For the last 7 years or so, They've had a YouTube channel and they put up a new video whenever they get a new "like" for example. They feel an urge to practice more. That has a positive effect on them, motivates them. (personal communication, Appendix A, 203)

The participants further commented on the developments in digital music production technologies and concert halls ʾsubscription systems that allowed the audience to watch live performances on demand, in the comfort of their own homes. While they expressed that these technologies democratized art production and consumption, they were unsure if this development would support or hinder performing arts in the future. One participant states "Number of seats filled in concert halls is quite good. Both in Europe and in Turkey it's not bad at all but the average age is high. How much younger people will embrace this really, it's a complicated thing" (personal communication, Appendix A.204) On the one hand, they were concerned about the aging of the average classical music listener worldwide, on the other, that the digital technologies were eliminating the need to go to a concert hall to see a performance.

> They're bringing up the subscription system which has been very popular for the past ten years. For example, Berlin Philharmonics has its own digital platform where they broadcast their concerts. Some masterclasses are held, they're sharing those orchestras and musicians. There are interviews, documentaries about the histories of that orchestra, about some composers etc. And people pay a subscription fee to that but it's somewhat like shooting yourself in the foot too I think. Because our aim should be bringing people to the stage, not in the front of screens. Therefore I understand on the one hand, it's being done in Turkey too, some concerts are broadcast on the internet as well as on television. And there are people can access something on their cellphones and TVs which they otherwise couldn't afford. When they say "well, this is nice," and maybe then they'll decide to come in person. But it doesn't work like that, since technology makes us lazier, they'll say, "it's great that I can access it this way, I don't need to go." (personal communication, Appendix A, 205)

Overall, the participants were hesitant to make definitive remarks about the future of classical music in Turkey, especially due to shifting value systems in the society as a result of the political climate. While none of the participants suggested that they were being targeted by the government, they were feeling particularly vulnerable as a group because they perceived themselves to be underserved. They were uncertain of

their value in the market as well as the cultural sphere, and unwilling to compromise on their ideological positions or quality of work to better adapt. Their doubts about the future were especially evident from their answers to the question "Would you send your child to train at a conservatory?".

> I don't want to say anything about Turkey, about the future of any sector. I mean, because I don't know, I can't predict. I mean, I have good wishes and pessimist scenarios. I wish for the good things to happen. As to the bad scenarios… I don't entirely know what we can do in our lives. Perhaps we can say "we've only got this one life" and choose to get out of this place. That's always within the options too. Regardless of how old we are, I think, because you shouldn't stay somewhere you don't want. I don't know how much longer this country will want us. I don't know what purpose I can serve. I don't know how much return this will have either. (personal communication, Appendix A, 206)

> Humans always have the survival instinct, right, regardless of how much of an artist you are, no matter how much that society flows through your veins, you're still human and at some point you want to survive, you try to survive I mean, at some point you are forced to let go of some things. If you don't you'r artistry will be affected too I think, I mean if you can't take care of yourself it's not possible for you to make good art. You can't spring out of the rubble of war in all that hunger, misery and thirst and play piano that well like that movie "The Pianist". In the end you only have one life in which to live well in quality. And the artist chooses to make art to spread that advice. An artist doesn't exist to come out and tell people to suffer, wouldn't choose that. They would just aim to live more humanly, to fill the one life you have, if they discovered the ways of this to share their discoveries. Thus, I wouldn't want my child to be deprived of these. I don't want them to take that risk by going to conservatory in a destructive environment where nothing is certain supported by neither society nor politicians. (personal communication, Appendix A, 207)

One participant mentioned that they even refused to tutor children of others for the conservatory entrance exams, and warned parents about the risks of such a decision by sharing their own negative experience. Another participant stated that even if they did agree to support their child becoming a musician, they would make sure that they are educated in other fields as well. Because even with classical musicians being

their parents, they did not know if their child should burden themselves with the risks that made life quite difficult for them.

> It was around the time I was about to quit, I think I was in my third year of undergrad. There were some people who called and wanted to send their children to the conservatory. I can't tell you how much I needed it at that time. I said no. I mean, I don't want to do it, because I can't allow any of the people I talked to study at the conservatory anymore. I was not happy, on the contrary, I was very traumatized, so I spoke openly in such language. (personal communication, Appendix A, 208)

> I mean, my husband wants it. Because we're musicians, he thinks it'll be easier for [our child] to find their place in the circle and study music. He thinks [our child] will be more talented. I would want it too, by the way, of course, for [our child] to do music. But have it as a profession or… alright, as a profession too. But I would really want them to go to another school as well. I would want them to develop themselves from other angles too. Not just music because it's a risky profession. You need to take good care of your body, you need a strong psychology. I mean, it's highly risky. (personal communication, Appendix A, 209)

While the participants unanimously agreed on the risks of the conservatory model of education and a career in classical music, they also agreed on the benefits of playing an instrument and concluded that they would definitely encourage their children to play as well. Meaning, they wanted for their children to enjoy the advantages of a musical subjectivity, while protecting them from the precarious market and institutional demands.

> I would send my child to a good music teacher. I'd send them for sure. I'd make them take music, one hundred percent, instrument training, one hundred percent. They wouldn't be obligated to do it as a profession. I mean, I think it has incredible contributions for emotional and mental development. And if they don't experience the mobbing I experienced, it's only a plus. They will get out with a profit, having added to themselves. I mean it would have no negatives whatsoever, wouldn't take anything out of them. (personal communication, Appendix A, 210)

> Regarding my own child, I prefer my own child to receive instrumental education under my own supervision and with the support of private lessons. I would only let them go to the conservatory if they really wanted to, if I believed that they would be very successful. Otherwise, I would like them to be interested in music not as a professional future or anything like that, but as an area where they feel better and where they want to spend time. After all, in

> the first years of an artist's life, they usually suffer. Afterwards, you know, maybe they can earn some money. If they're lucky, they can make good money. In general, this is the case everywhere in the world. Therefore, as a profession, we [as parents] would need to support them a lot, but that's a difficult decision, I mean, it's one you can only make by observing them. But I don't have a romantic thing like, "Oh how nice, I wish he would study at the conservatory and become a pianist". That's because I know what a difficult process that is. (personal communication, Appendix A, 211)

This chapter described how classical musicians in Istanbul made sense of their positions in the shifting cultural and social ethos marked by the transformations in state governance, institutional logic and market conditions. In the absence of institutional support, they found themselves having to manage increased financial risk, isolation and motivational issues that followed cultural marginalization and relied on the support of their families, professional circles and social groups that recognized their predicaments. They identified patterns of change in the field of classical music education that took place in the light of technological developments, institutional decline and the shifting preferences in the culture industry. They expressed feelings of uncertainty regarding the future of classical music, both at home and abroad, as precarious market conditions and insufficient societal support were at odds with the dedication and discipline necessary to reproduce new generations of classical musicians.

CHAPTER 7

CONCLUSION

This thesis explored the ways in which Istanbul's classical musicians navigate a precarious job market, as well as how their subjectivities were formed and transformed in response to the shifting familial, institutional and societal influences that colored their experiences throughout their training and professionalization processes. Through in-depth, semi-structured interviews that were analyzed adopting a theoretical framework that drew on Foucauldian concepts of biopolitics, subjectivation and governmentality, the research aimed to understand and convey how conservatory graduates were called upon to manage themselves as disciplined, adaptable and dedicated individuals keen to survive the insecure market conditions that operate in the absence of sufficient state support. In three main fieldwork chapters, the study described the participants 'early beginnings in music, educational milestones that inform their careers, setbacks and struggles, aspirations and professional endeavors, as well as how they made sense of their own stories and what they thought of the future of their fields. The participants, whose privacy I tried my best to protect, generously disclosed intimate details of their frustrations, hopes and fears, allowing me to share their unique encounters in order to paint a bigger picture of what it was like to try and succeed as young professionals leading their lives in the neoliberal order.

The findings of this research revealed that while Istanbul's conservatory graduates experienced similar problems with their Western counterparts and peers of other fields in the nation when transitioning to employment, the root causes of their problems also varied in significant ways. The main issue that set them apart from

both groups was the loss of the symbolic value classical musicians used to enjoy in the foundational years of the Republic. While the literature shows that the professionals of the classical music field are experiencing decreased demand due to developments such as changing cultural preferences and the advancement of digital streaming technologies globally, the musical genre is considered worth preserving in the Western nations, as the word conservatory suggests. This was apparent in the participants ʾnarratives that explain the efforts to adapt classical music to new paradigms, such as the online subscription services of the established classical orchestras and the institutional support conservatory students received during the COVID-19 pandemic in the Western nations. Meanwhile, the participants of this study stated feeling isolated from public support during times of crisis and unsure of the future of their field in Turkey. Their hope for the sustainability of the classical music field depended on loyal secular audiences who support the genre for mainly ideological reasons. As such, it would be appropriate to suggest that what is being preserved or protected here is not the genre but the worldview that supported the genre. One participant effectively grounded this distinction by mentioning that it was usual for a taxi driver in a European city to listen to classical music just as it was usual for a taxi driver in Turkey to listen to arabesque, confirming the "march of popular taste to the center" conceptualized by Orhan Tekelioğlu (as cited in Ayas, 2016, pp. 22–25) by referencing a taxi driver to gauge the cultural relevance of a genre. Since classical Western music was born in Europe and much later introduced to the cultural sphere of the nation by the state for political reasons, the loss of state support under conservative-neoliberal governance meant both financial struggle and cultural marginalization for Istanbul's classical musicians.

According to the participants, the effects of cultural isolation was also felt within the conservatories. A loss of aura was observed by young musicians who started teaching the new generation, who miss the “scent of art” that used to inspire them. The decline of discipline, respect and meritocracy perceived as being foundational for the success of both the institutions and the graduates worried the participants. While they mentioned that the rigid teaching style of their own training challenged them, it was also intrinsic to the classical music tradition. A dramatic drop in the training discipline equaled unsuccessful results for most participants. Instead, they advised for an early adoption of practice discipline for young students which required motivated families, instructors and students; which they thought were becoming harder to come by each passing year. The literature also supports this observation as Ayas (2016, p. 367) mentions that intellectuals feel the need to hide their “elitist” tastes and music sociologists find it risky to choose research topics relating to “high culture” elements as they fear the accusation of being elitist. In this case, it is not surprising to find that the professionals in the classical music field lose motivation for upholding high standards or choose to soften their approach in an attempt to appear less intimidating.

The loss of institutional support was most apparent in the comparison made between the current salaries of the state orchestra members and those they were paid in the 1980s. Although there was no significant growth in the number or size of state orchestras, musicians ’salaries were subject to a sharp decline; evident in young musicians ’disbelief that old members used to earn the same salary as the members of the parliament and could afford to purchase summer homes or new cars annually. This expression of astonishment was directed at both the former purchasing power of

classical musicians, and the social status and cultural prestige associated with their profession.

The participants also recognized that other professionals such as teachers, doctors, pilots, academics or scientists earned higher salaries in those years, pointing to the neoliberal transformation that resulted in the devaluation of experts. However, in the case of classical musicians, this shift is felt as a threat to the survival of their field in Turkey as their highly specialized path that begins in the early ages becomes extremely risky to follow for the next generations, especially considering their cultural isolation. Most participants were wary of letting their own children train at a conservatory even though they would be able to offer expert guidance. The reason for their hesitation was the significant financial, emotional and time investment required by this path, coupled with the high likelihood of failure or low returns.

The experiences of the classical musicians participating in this study revealed that they find themselves holding a paradoxical position where they are disciplined yet precarious, emotionally driven yet rationally self-managed, culturally elite yet economically vulnerable, statist-trained yet governed by neoliberal logic. Although they are resilient, their narratives weave together a reproduction crisis for the future of their field. The state-driven cultural reform weakens, classical music becomes harder to sell and the musicians are devalued as the state withdraws from the field. The middle class disappears and both the audience and aspiring performers decrease in number. Persistence in the field becomes a form of resistance.

APPENDIX A

LONG QUOTES IN TURKISH

1. Çok küçük yaşta başladığı için aslında o yola seni ailen sokuyor. Yani sen böyle kendin ben müzisyen olacağım falan küçük yaşta diyemiyorsun zaten. Mesela ben 11 yaşında başladım ama 6-7 yaşlarında başlıyor insanlar. 4 yaşında başlayan var falan. Özellikle Asya'da, Avrupa'da, o yaşlarda başlıyorlar ve senin çok böyle bir söz hakkın yok aslında.

2. Benim ailem müzisyendi. Annem piyanist babam da flüt çalıyor. Işte onlardan dolayı zaten sürekli bir küçüklükten beri maruz kalma durumu vardı. Ben işte bu İDSO'nun konserlerine falan gidiyordum. Her cuma günü abonman vardı. Böyle annemle keyifli etkinlik diye.

3. Yani galiba ben bir karar vermedim. Çünkü 11-12 yaşında bir çocuğun karar verme yetisiyle ilgili önce bir tartışmamız lazım diye düşünüyorum. Ya ev ortamından çok mutlu bir çocuk değildim açıkçası ve bir şekilde bir müzik kursuna başlamıştım. Belediyenin ücretsiz bir kursunda piyano dersi alıyordum. Ve böyle, biraz daha fazla yönelmeye başladım. Orada herhangi bir çocuğun, hobi olarak gelen bir çocuğun yaptığından biraz daha fazla ilgi duymaya çalıştım.

4. Ben aslında erken yaşta başlamadım. Yurtdışında doğdum büyüdüm zaten biliyorsun. 15 yaşında lisede, güzel sanatlara öyle bir imkan çıktı. Babam da o sırada İstanbul'da ticaret yaptığı için ben de İstanbul'u çok sevdiğim için, tatillerde gelip gidiyordum. Öyle bir yol izlemeye karar verdim. Babam da müzisyen olduğu için aslında o ön ayak oldu bana. 15 yaşında lisede başladım klasik müzik eğitimine.

5. Şöyle, annem beni yönlendirdi, ilk başta yarı zamanlıya başladım ben yurtdışındayken, yani yurtdışında yaşıyordum 18 yaşıma kadar. Oradaki aileler biraz çocukların birbirleriyle yarıştırmak adına, işte "Benim çocuğum bunu da çalıyor, bunu da çalıyor"... Böyle bir şey uğruna biraz göndermiş oldu müzik okuluna. İyi bir şeye vesile oldu en azından. Yani mesleğimi seçmeme vesile oldu. Ama o zamanlar çok istekli değildim tabii. E giderken biraz sıkılıyordum.

6. Çok böyle neşeli, oyuncu, şey bir çocuk değildim herhalde onun şeyiyle böyle biraz çocuğun hayatına renk gelsin diye böyle kursa yazdırmışlardı.

7. Ya benim kulağımın çok iyi olduğu ailem tarafından biliniyordu ama hani duyu olarak bunun iyi olması ayrı bir konu. Hani enstrümana yatkınlık diye ayrı bir konu vardı. Bu konuda bir deneyimimiz yoktu. Açıkçası bu konserlere gidip o kemanı çok sevmem ile bir konservatuvar sınavını denememle başladı yani iş. Sonra konservatuar sınavını kazanınca şansla yani hakikaten kemana seçildim.

8. Ben şey demiştim, 'keman istiyorum 'demiştim. Bana flüt demişlerdi. Ama ben keman çok istediğim için kemanda kalmıştım. Çocuk eğer bir şey çok istiyorsa kimse onu değiştirmek için tabii ki uğraşmıyor. Ama hiçbir fikri olmayan bir çocuk ama yetenekli bir çocuk, sen elinin yapısına bakıp mesela büyük elleri olacak, boyu uzun pat diye dersin piyano. Çünkü çok az bulunan bir şey, gibi.

9. Ama piyanoyu çok istiyordum. Sonra kemanı çok sevmedim. Hatta hiç sevmedim kemanı. Ama işte mecburiyetten öyle şey yaptım… Bir de hiç aklıma bile gelmedi piyanoda ısrarcı olmak. Ya işte o orada ellerim küçük olduğu için kemana yönlendiklerini söylediler. Ama aslında en çok kemancı alıyorlar. Çünkü orkestralarda en çok kemancıya ihtiyaç olduğu için daha çok keman öğrencisi tercih ediyorlar. Şey yapıyorlar mesela, kemana alıyorlar, kemanda başarısız olanları violaya geçiriyorlar falan öyle şeyler yapıyorlar. Ya da kemanda başarısız oldu işte flüte geçiriyorlar falan gibi şeyler yapıyorlar. Başta bir kemanı öneriyorlar çoğunlukla.

10. Yani kendim seçtim aslında, ya piyano ya keman dediler ama annem keman istediği için ben kemanı seçtim. Yani o zamanlar çünkü şey, babam Galatasaraylı ben Fenerbahçeliyim yani böyle şeyler var, parametreler var ortada ya işte. Dolayısıyla annemin tarafını tutuyorum daha çok falan. Dolayısıyla annem keman istedi. Babam piyano çal dedi. Ben annemin istediğini yaptım. O yüzden keman çalıyorum şu anda.

11. Yani yer kalmamıştı aslında bana piyanoda, hocalarında yer kalmamıştı. "Yedeklerde hani beklemesin istiyorsanız başka bir enstrümana yönlendirelim." demişlerdi işte "Keman var, o olur istiyorsanız o zamanlar da Sihirli Annem vardı. Sihirli Annem'de Ceren miydi kızın adı? Şey kız, Çilek değil, öbürü. O işte keman dersi alıyordu bir tane bir bölümde ondan böyle onu hatırladım. Tamam dedim. Bu şekilde seçtim biraz kemanı.

12. Birkaç ders almıştım, biri gelmişti bana teori dersleri vermişti. Konservatuvarda fagot öğretmeniydi, adını unuttum. Yani işte sonra dördüncü sınıfta direkt başladım orada yarı zamanlı.

13. Hayır, özel olarak hazırlanmadım, normal Kadıköy Belediyesi'nin açtığı bir kurstu. Ben herhangi bir öğrenci gibi gidip haftanın bir günü derse gidiyordum. Ama özel bir hazırlık sürecim olmadı sadece sınava girip kazandım.

14. Hiç öyle bir plan (konservatuvara girme planı) yoktu. Ben sadece ilkokulumdan nefret ediyordum okurken. O yüzden, oradan nefret ettiğim için, beşinci sınıfta aynı zamanda konservatuara gidince konservatuar ortamı değişik gelmişti, sevmiştim. Daha özgür gelmişti. Bir de enstrüman çalmayı zaten çok seviyordum. Mesela böyle defterlerime falan da yazmışım işte, hayalindeki meslek diyor, piyanist olmak yazmışım falan. Herhalde işte hayalini kuruyordum. Sonra bir de annemler o dönemde batmışlardı. İşte "Sen ya konservatuvara gideceksin, ya da seni devlet okuluna göndereceğiz. Artık sen özel okula gidemeyeceksin." dediler. Özel okuldan ne kadar nefret etsem de diğer devlet okulu çok bana… Sınıflar çok büyük, çok kalabalık gelmişti. Böyle gözüm korktu onu hatırlıyorum. Hoşuma gitmemişti. O yüzden böyle o zaman konservatuvara gideyim diyip o şekilde karar vermiştim.

15. Bence bunun arka planında şu yatıyordu biraz, evden dışarda olmak. Yani, yetişkin halinde terapiye gittikten sonra böyle bir kanıya vardım. Ben evden kaçmaya çalışmışım meğer. Ve konservatuvara girmek de bunun için biçilmiş kaftandı çünkü bilirsin yani sürekli çalışmak zorundasın. Hani dersin olmadığı saatlerde de okulda bulunursun ve bu seni evden çok uzaklaştırır.

16. Ben aslında İstanbul'a gidip işte futbolcu olurum belki hayaliyle, o düşünceyle tamam dedim. Ve güzel sanatlara dediğim gibi başladım ama işte okul başladıktan sonra çok sevmeye başladığım için müziği, futbolu tamamen unuttum ve piyano hocam çok çok iyi bir insan, çok çok iyi bir eğitmen. O şekilde bir anda kendimi müziğin içinde buldum ve futbolu tamamen unuttum.

17. İstanbul Konservatuvarı'na ben hazırlanıyordum önce. Oraya annemle gittik, şey, sınav başvurusunu yapmaya. Dediler ki 11 yaşında çok geç, hiç girmesin. Yani çok geç kalmış dediler. Bizi yolladılar. Sonra işte bu bahsettiğim hocayla çalışınca o zaten İstanbul Üniversitesi'ne girmeyin, Mimar Sinan'a girin dedi. Hazırlandım ve girdim ben yani.

18. Ya o zaman piyano bölümü için en iyi konservatuvar İstanbul Üniversitesi Devlet Konservatuarı diye geçiyordu. Ya da en iyilerden biri olarak. Ve daha öncesinde lisedeki hocamla birçok kişiyi, birçok öğrencisini oraya

yönlendirdiği için ben de İstanbul'da kalmak istediğim için orayı denemek istedim.

19. Gerçekten sana özel eğitim tasarlanıyor her sene ve her dönem. Yani senin müzikal açıdan gelişimin için bu çok güzel bir şey. O da tabii iyi bir hocaya denk gelirsen. Hoca gerçekten hevesliyse, hocanla iyi anlaşıyorsan, hocanı ve enstrümanı seviyorsan… Hani her şeyin iyi gitmesi halinde çok güzel eğitim alınabilir.

20. Hangi hocadasın? Yani bu bu çok büyük bir şans. Çünkü hoca bu konuda senin anne baban gibi bir şey enstrümanda. Her türlü şeyine etkisi var. Senin ileride sahne korkun olacaksa bu yüzden. Ne bileyim, çalışmayı bilmemek, herkesin en büyük problemi. Çok büyük bir kayıp. Bunu da hocandan öğreniyorsun. Sana ilk gün nasıl mantıklı ve planlı çalışacağın öğretilirse kazanacağın zaman... Ve bunu bilmeden çalıştığın yıllar ve kaybettiğin saatler…

21. Çok değerli bir hocam oldu bence. Yani bütün bu konuşmada eğitimden bahsedeceksek zaten hocaların ne kadar önemli olduğundan bolca bahsetmek zorunda kalacağız. Aslında hem kemanda teknik olarak hem de açıkçası psikolojik olarak birçok etkende o ilk hocalar bence baya önemli oluyorlar.

22. Yani sonuçta ben tek piyanist değilim. Başka piyanistlerle de her zaman rekabet içerisindesin. Ve hocalar tarafından… Öğrencilerini birbiriyle kıyaslıyorlar ister istemez. Kendi öğrencileri arasında da yapıyor bu arada. Başka hocanın öğrencisi olmak zorunda değil. Zaten çaldırılan eserler ya da müfredat yıllardır değiştirilmiyordu ben oradayken. Çoğu öğrenci aynı eserleri icra ettiği için dolayısıyla kıyaslama oluyor. Ama insan bir birey olarak değerlendirilmiyor. Bu buna göre nasıl çalıyor gibi değerlendiriliyor.

23. Aynı zamanda yıkıcı ve gerçekten hak etmeyenlerin de, kurunun yanında yaşların da yandığı, büyük travmalarla dolu olan da bir eğitim. Hiç beklemediğin bir şey, bir kere. Birdenbire hayatında kimsenin senden beklemediği kadar bir şeyler bekleyen insanlarla dolu etrafın. Ve bu sadece hocalar tarafından değil. Büyüklerin, öğrenci olan büyüklerin de… Yani işte ne bileyim bir koridorda çalışıyorsan, oradan geçen başka bir kemancı büyüğün sana gelip ona müdahale ediyor. Bak diyor orayı tiz çaldın, burayı şöyle çal, burayı böyle çal, şurayı şöyle tutuyorsun bak, dikkat et diyor vesaire yani.

24. Büyük öğrenci mesela diyelim ki işte teneffüstesin çalışıyorsun. Onların da sürekli gözetimi altındasın. Ya da seni gördü bir yerde, bir bakıyorsun gitmiş hocana söylemiş.

25. Böyle diyoruz, evet. Müzik dersleri ve kültür dersleri. Kültür dersleri bütün, zaten öğrenmemiz gereken aslında dersler. Ama oraya üniversitenin hocaları gönderiliyordu bize öyle hatırlıyorum. Ve onlar da bizim müzik hocalarıyla biraz şey içerisindelerdi, çatışma. Çünkü işte "Bu çocuğun keman çalışması lazım." ama diğeri diyor ki "Matematik bilmiyor.", "Ama daha çok çalışması lazım." yok, "Piyano da çalışması lazım." Diğeri diyor ki "İngilizce daha öğrenmedi." Hani normal hayattan çok kopuk bir sistem. Halbuki hepsinin eşit önemlilikte olması gerekir.

26. İstanbul Üniversitesi, yine Mimar Sinan, onlarda yarı zamanlı başlayıp, teori ve sadece enstrüman dersi ile başlayıp, belli bir noktada, her okul bu noktada farklı, "Şimdi tam zamanlıya geçmek zorundasınız." dedikleri bir sınır olabiliyor. Istanbul Üniversitesi'nde böyle bir sınır yoktu ama bu sefer diploman farklı oluyor. Bizim aldığımız diplomayla aynı değil. O böyle sertifika gibi. Yine çok iyi olabilir. Yani öyle örnekler çok var İstanbul Üniversitesi'nde. Çok zeki, çok yetenekli… Böyle çoğu yurt dışında falan. Ya aslında sanırım daha iyi bir şey bu yaptıkları. Yani büyük ihtimal onlar da küçük yaşta başlıyorlar, yarı zamanlı konservatuar eğitimini bizim gibi alıyorlar ama tüm herkes gibi lise sınavı, üniversite sınavı bunlara hazırlanıyorlar. Kendi dallarını seçiyorlar bu süreç içerisinde. Ama bizde… Atıyorum, sekizinci sınıfa geldin ve diyorsun ki artık ben bunu yapamıyorum. Hiçbir şey yapılamaz. Yani geri dönüşü olur tabii ki. Ama çocuğun bir durup diğerleriyle arayı kapatmak için, konservatuvar dışındaki insanlara yetişmek için yani çok ciddi bir ekstra eğitime ihtiyacı olur. Bunu liseye çekersek neredeyse imkansız. Yani sizin girdiğiniz sınavlar gibi bizde hiç öyle bir şey yok. Bir de kültür dersleri çok şey... Nasıl diyeyim yok gibi bir şey.

27. Sonrasında konservatuara girdim, yarı zamanlı okudum. Hatta işte annemin tam zamanlı yollamak istememe sebebi de dil öğrenebilmem. Çünkü bu işte yabancı dil çok önemli ve maalesef konservatuarda doğru düzgün öğretmiyorlar bunu aslında. O yüzden ful yarı zamanlı gittim lise bitene kadar.

28. Ya biz hiçbir şeyin farkında değildik. Ne kadar yaptığımız şey ciddi, ne kadar çok çalışmamız gerek, ne kadar hayat ciddi bilmiyorsun, yani bilmiyorduk en azından. Ve bizim yaptığımız böyle hani okula gidip oyun oynamak gibiydi. O kadar başı boş bir hal almıştı. Ve bunu herhalde işte babam sanırım fark etti lise üçteyken. Halbuki bütün sınıf aynı

durumdaydık. Ama bu konuda işte ailelerin çok fazla üzerine sorumluluk düşüyor. Çünkü hiçbir şey bilmiyorlar. Müzisyen bir ailede değilsen hiçbir kontrolün yok o eğitimin üzerinde. Çocuğuna ne oluyor hiçbir şekilde anlayamıyorsun. O yüzden o benim için bir şans oldu. Lise üçte istanbul'da eğitim, işte ekstra özel dersim başladı. Sonra fark ettim ki ben hiçbir şey bilmiyorum. Tekrar kemana yeni başladım gibi. Yani dördüncü sınıfa geri döndük. Tabii her şey tutuşumdan başlayarak her şey tekrar yenilendi. Bir sene dondurdum. Sonra tekrar, fakat bu sefer İstanbul'daki bir konservatuvardan devam ettim. Ama bir yandan da şöyle insanlar var, dördüncü sınıfta, böyle örneğim var yani, süper bir hocayla işte benim lisede gittiğim hocayla başlayan… Onlar çok şanslı. Bu yüzden çok güzel olabilecek bir eğitim, kontrolünü kaybettiğinde bir faciaya dönüşüyor aslında.

29. Şimdi keman hocası ders yapmadığı için, ama bir yandan yetiştirmesi gereken bir müfredat var bizim okulda... Ama ders yapmıyor. Onu yarım yamalak öğretmek zorunda kalıyor dolayısıyla. Öyle düzgün tutuş öğretmedi. Sol elimi mesela, diyelim ki şöyle şöyle tutmam gerektiğini ben sonradan öğrendim. Şöyle tutuyordum, yapıştırıyorum mesela elimi kemana ve bileğim çok ağrıyordu. Böyle tutmam gerektiğini sonradan… Ya da mesela diyelim ki yayı, mesela şöyle bir hareket yapman gerekiyormuş, biz böyle çekiyorduk mesela, kazık gibi. Hani bu tarz teknik şeyleri bize hiç öğretmediler. Bu teknik zorluklarla başladığın zaman, teknik yeterliliğe sahip olmadan parça çalışma yapamıyorsun. Yani beceremiyorsun. Kötü çalıyorsun. Çok kötü çalıyorsun.

30. Şöyle söyleyebilirim, o zaman bir kız vardı. O kız diyelim beşinci sınıftaydı, ya da dördüncü sınıftaydı. Yani yarı zamanlıdaydı, tam zamanlıya hazırlanıyordu. Yani diyelim bir senedir iki senedir falan keman çalıyordu, yeni öğreniyordu yani keman çalmayı. Ben de işte lise sondayım. Böyle benden çok daha iyi ses çıkarıyordu kemandan mesela. Hoca bana diyordu ki ‘onun tonuna bir bakar mısın nasıl ses çıkıyor kemanından’. Teknik. Yani tamamen teknikle alakalı bir şey.

31. İlk birkaç yıl mesela şey, yastıksız çalıyordum. Keman yastığı olmadan, ve bu çok zor bir şey. Yani çok ağrılarım oluyordu. Benim mesela boynum çok uzun, mümkün değil. Ve bir de boynumla omzum arasındaki mesafe de kısa. Dolayısıyla ben kemanı tutabilmek için omzumu çok fazla kaldırmak zorunda kalıyorum mesela, ki bu işte çok büyük sakatlıklara yol açıyor yani. Yine de ben yaşamamış olmama rağmen çok fazla fiziksel sorunlar yaşayanlar var. Çünkü bedensel bir eğitim yok yani müzisyenlere, müzisyenlerin sağlığını öğreten, müzisyene göre dikkat

edilmesi gereken duruş şeyleri vesaire, Alexander teknik gibi şeyler, hiçbiri Türkiye'de yok.

32. Yurtdışında gördüğümüz eğitim çok böyle şey, sıkı bir eğitim değildi. Yani buraya geldiğim zaman bir yanda hani hem orkestra, hem oda müziği hem de kemanda teknik değiştirdiğim zaman biraz sırtımda fibromiyalji gibi bir şey olmuştu. Yani tam tanımını bilmiyorum çünkü teşhis de konulmadı. Çok çabaladım, onu gidermek için. Özellikle orkestrada daha çok kendini belli ediyordu. Fizik tedaviye vesaire gittim. Ondan sonra işe yarar gibi oldu. Sonra tabii ki keman çalmaya devam ettiğim için, yani hayatım bu olduğu için tabii ki kesin bir geçmedi orası hatta yer edindi orada. Yani şu an ben hala o ağrıyla yaşıyorum. Hatta o kadar alıştım ki hani şey, onsuz nasıl oluyor bilmiyorum.

33. Bir yandan da (yurtdışında) bu zaten fiziksel, çok fiziksel zorluğu olan bir iş olduğu için mesela fizyoterapistlerle de çalışıyorsun. Bunun fizyoterapisi var. Diyelim ki keman çalan insan fizyoterapisti, okulda var. Keman öğrencileri sadece o fizyoterapistle görüşüyorlar, gibi. Hani okulun böyle destekleri de var. Hani ben… İşte buralarımda böyle bir dirseklerimde ödemler olmuştu. Çok ağrıyordu dirseklerim. Her yerim ağrıyordu zaten. Hani skolyoz, boyun fıtığı falan hepimizin yaşadığı şeyler. Hoca bu konuda hiçbir destekte bulunmuyor. Şimdi fizyoterapiste gidiyorsun. Fizyoterapist senin yaptığın işi anlamıyor, bilinmiyor. Fizyoterapiste gittim dedi ki bana "Yüz". Ben gitmiştim hatta ilk hocama "Hocam benim hani çok sırtım ağrıyor yüzmem lazımmış" demiştim. O da demişti ki "Yüzmek de seni yoracak. Onun yerine daha çok keman çalış."

34. Konumu çok iyiydi. Mesela bir konser oluyor, Süreyya Operası dibinde. CRR'ye vapurla geçiliyor falan. AKM çok yakın. Ama şimdi okul da Maltepe'ye taşındı mesela...

35. Ankara zaten Cumhuriyet'in kurulduğu hani bir şehir olduğu için burada zaten bu sanat kurumları çok önemsenmiş. Yani Cumhuriyet kurulurken zaten bu kurumlar burada kurulmuş ve halkın buralarda gerçekten de tiyatrolarda, operalarda, senfonilerde bulunması, bu etkinliklere gitmesi zaten istenmiş. İstanbul'da zaten bir imparatorluk geleneği olduğu için oralarda böyle padişahlar 1800'lerde yabancı operaları getiriyorlarmış, işte yabancı bestecileri getiriyorlarmış. Hani böyle bir batılılaşma şeyiyle zaten İstanbul'da böyle temsiller oluyormuş. Dolayısıyla halk da onlara gidiyormuş. Birazcık aslında Avrupa'da halkın eğlence şekli bu. Yani halk Mozart'ın konserine eğlenmek için gidiyor. Bilet alıp gidiyor. Hani sefil bir insan da gidebiliyor. Ya da Shakespeare tiyatrosuna sefil bir insan da

gidebiliyor. Burada da böyle bir ortam, hani halkın ulaşacağı bir kültür sanat ortamı yaratılması hedefleniyor. Özellikle Ankara'da öyle. Dolayısıyla bu Ankara'da, Tabii CSO kuruluyor mesela. Cumhurbaşkanlığı Senfoni Orkestrası. Müzika-i Humayun diye bir orkestra var, o Cumhurbaşkanlığı Senfoni Orkestrasına çevriliyor. Burada zaten bu çok ciddiye alınan bir şey. Yöneticilerin çok desteklediği bir şey. İnönü mesela her hafta CSO'nun konserine gidiyor. Her hafta. En azından işte koltuğu var falan gibi. Diğer tarafta da İstanbul'da da dediğim gibi böyle padişahların böyle girişimleri oluyor. İşte padişahlar kendileri bestecilik yapıyorlar falan. O batılılaşmanın getirdiği bir şey. Ama Bursa'da… Bursa'da baktığın zaman böyle bir şey yok. Yani böyle bir ortam yok. Bursa'nın ortamı daha dış mekan sosyallikleri. Mesela piknik yapmak, kır gezisi yapmak, misafir ağırlamak gibi… Böyle şeyler var Bursa'da. Daha böyle bir kapalı bir ortama gidip orada bir etkinlik yapma anlayışı Bursa'da çok fazla yok. Böyle bir gelenek yok. Dolayısıyla böyle bir tiyatro, senfoni vesaire yok.

36. Okulun koşulları çok kötüydü ama beni zorlamadı. Çünkü biz hani aile apartmanındaydık okulda oda bulamasam zaten gidip evde çalışabiliyordum istediğim saatte. Kimse de hiçbir şey demiyordu. Ama hani başka insanların… Genel olarak bayağı büyük problem yaratıyordu bu diye hatırlıyorum. Çünkü oda yok, işte insanlar tuvalette falan çalışıyor, koridorda çalışıyor, evinde çalışamıyor. Komşulardan sıkıntı çıkıyor. O yüzden benim çok fazla bir şeyim olmadı aslında. Ama o da şanstan dolayı, yani aile apartmanı şansı, yoksa okul koşulları iyi değil yani.

37. Bizim yaptığımız iş usta çırak ilişkisi gibi bir şey yani sonuçta. Diğer birçok diğer üniversite bölümü gibi amfide ders görmüyoruz. Birebir hocamızla iletişimdeyiz ve o insan ilişkisindeki iletişim çok önemli. Karşı taraftan öyle bir psikolojik baskı oluşturulunca bu keyifsiz bir hale geliyor ve zorunlu bir ilişki var aslında. Bir arkadaşlık gibi değil. Hani bana iyi gelmiyor, ben bırakıyorum deme gibi bir lüksün olamıyor çoğu zaman. Tamamen o zorluğu yaratan aslında eğitmenlerdi diyebilirim.

38. İnanılmaz zordu, inanılmaz travmatize oldum. Yani benim ilk seneden sonra o okulu bırakmam gerekiyordu. Kesinlikle okuldan alınmam gerekiyordu. Yani o kadar ciddi, sürekli, zorbalık, hakaretamiz yaklaşımlar, sürekli aşağılama ve dersin içerisinde. Dersten çok ne giydim, nasıl göründüğüm kaşlarımı neden almadığım, annemle babamın köyden İstanbul'a gelmiş olduğu için bilmem ne bilmem ne onları taşralı olarak adlandırıp ve müzik ya da sanat dışında da eğitim dışında her şeyle

ilgili ağzına geleni söyleyen kötü bir insandı. Çok açık ve net söyleyebilirim. Bayağı zorbanın tekiydi.

39. Benim, dediğim gibi, annem de hep, her hafta arardı hocamı, "Nasıldı bu hafta? Bugün nasıldı?" Hocam zaten annemi de arardı. Onlar artık böyle arkadaş gibi olmuştu bir süre sonra telefonda, yani sürekli hakkımda konuşuyorlar ve ben biliyorum sürekli hakkımda konuştuklarını, bu nasıl bir baskı yani? Her hafta bir şey yani, "Bu hafta onları mutlu edebildim mi?"

40. Genel olarak her şeyi bilen, belki anne babandan daha yakın insan oluyor. Ama yani nasıl diyeyim? Bir bakıcı gibi gerçekten belki de. Çünkü gerçekten sana bakıyor. Yani aynı okuldasın, beş gün boyunca oradasın ve o senin hocan. Sürekli onun büyük bir gözetimi altındasın. Arkadaşlıkların inceleniyor, sigara mı içiyorsun? Ne giydin? Diğer derslerin nasıl? Diğer hocalara saygılı mısın? Nasıl oturuyorsun, kalkıyorsun? Yerlerde sürünüyor musun teneffüste? Ne bileyim, her şey inceleniyor bu kişi tarafından. O yüzden bir noktadan sonra gerçekten aynı insan oluyorsun. Yani aynı saç kesimi… Yani hocasının tıpkısı oluyor biraz öğrenciler. Bu çok ilginç. Çünkü çok fazla zaman geçiriyor. Anne babasından daha çok zaman geçiriyor gerçekten o insanla. O yüzden "Hoca vezir de eder, rezil de eder." diyerek…

41. Ya geçenlerde eşimle de bu konuyu konuştuk. Bence müzik eğitiminde de bu var. Çok büyük, bizden çok daha başarılı olan insanların daha fazla bedel ödediğini görüyorum hep ben. Yani bu kolay bir şey değil. Bir enstrümanla bu kadar vakit geçirmek, bu kadar profesyonelleşmeye çalışmak. Ve yani günün sonunda açıkçası eğitimimizde şey var. Sen saatlerce çalışıp bir derse gidersin. Ve orada keman hocası sana olmayan şeylerden bahsetmek zorundadır.

42. Yani şimdi ders öncesi günü diye bir şey vardı bizde, ders öncesi günü uyku uyuyamıyorsun yani. Çünkü ertesi gün nasıl geçeceğini bilmiyorsun dersin. Ne kadar çalışsam da iyi mi geçecek? Çünkü artık o psikoloji oturduktan sonra her gün 8 saat çalışsan da acaba hoca bu sefer ne diyecek diye yapabildiğini de yapamaz hale geliyordun. Yani sadece 'bu sefer fırça yemeden nasıl yırtarım 'diye düşünüyordum. Yani biz şeye bakmıyorduk hani sene sonunda sınava. Ya da bu parçayı nasıl bitiririz... 'Yarınki dersi nasıl atlatırız? 'Onu atlattıktan sonra, oh yine 6 gün rahatız ya da neyse artık bir sonraki ders kaç günse. Hani dersi bir şekilde atlatmaya yönelik bir bir psikoloji oluşturmuştu. Hepimizde. Ben çevremden yani, hepimize dediğim benim yakın çevremde bunu net bir şekilde söyleyebilirim yani.

43. Bana soru sorulmasını hiç sevmiyorum. Stres oluyorum. Beni mesela direktör çağırdığı zaman odasına, ben panikle gidiyorum. Başkaları naber diye içeri girerken bu benim için büyük bir şey. İşte performans anksiyetesi olduğunu düşünüyorum bunun. Sürekli bir gözlem, denetim. Hata yapamama. Bir mail atacağım zaman önemli olduğunu düşündüğüm, herkese gösteriyorum tek tek. Belki bundan hiç memnun değiller. Bu dezavantaj aslında. Belki de çünkü "Kendinden emin değilsin" demek bu aslında. Mükemmeliyetçilik var biraz. Çünkü bir şey mükemmel olsun diye 8 yaşından beri çalışıyorsun. Yani o eseri ne bileyim iki tane notayı 300 kere arka arkaya, arka arkaya "Aa mükemmel olmadı. Bir daha mükemmel yapayım, bir daha yapayım, daha iyi olacak." dediğin için belki de her şey mükemmel olsun diyerek biraz kafamda abartıp işleri biraz zorlaştırabiliyorum çok basit bir şeyken.

44. Yani bu konservatuar eğitiminin en zor şeyi bana kalırsa birebir ve öğretmenle çalışıyor olmak, çok küçük yaştan itibaren. Pedagojik formasyonu olmaması hocaların. Bir çocuk eğitimi verecek hiçbir bilgileri yok. Aslında sadece enstrüman icracılığını biliyorlar. Adamın yüksek lisans öğrencisi de var, ama 5. sınıf öğrencisi de var. Hangi yaş grubuna nasıl davranması gerektiğini bilmiyor.

45. Hocamın da yanlış yaptığı şeylerden biri odur. Biraz bizi yarıştırmaya çalışırdı. Bazen işte bir eşyamızı almak için giriyorduk. Böyle bambaşka övgüler bir şeyler… Ya da işte o benim dersime geldiğinde oturur dinler. Böyle sürekli değişik mimikler yapar.

46. Benim dönemimde herkes solist gibi yetiştirilmeye çalışılıyordu, sanki herkes solist olabilecekmiş gibi. Yapamadığında o kişi için çok yıkıcı tabii ki yani. Çünkü yanında yapabilen biri var. Hiç yapamayan biri de var tabii ki. Tabii ki bir yandan onun yıkılışını da görüyor. Ona karşı bir empati duyuyor. Bir yandan yapabilenin mutluluğunu ve şımarışını görüyor. Bir de şımartılmak var tabi ki. Benim hocam asla yapmadı bunu bana ama şımartan hocalar da vardı. Çok pohpohlayan, olduğundan büyük gösteren.

47. (Öğrenciler arasında) Hiç rekabet olmuyor. Aynı hocadaysan hatta, "Oo, biz aynı hocanın öğrencisiyiz." "Dayanışma!" "Çok iyi olmalıyız!" "En büyük biziz!" gibi bir birbirini gaza getirme ve güç birliği. Büyük bir aile filan gibi.

48. Ya burda zaten çok şaşırdım. Geldim yetenek sınavına girdim. Ve Türkiye'de o yetersizlik hissi o kadar verilmişti ki 2 senede... Geldiğimde

çalamıyorum falan zannediyordum. Sınava girdim, hocalar tebrik etti hepsi. Alışık olmadığım tepkiler gördüm. Ve hani yapıcı eleştiriler, hani olmayan bir şey olduğu zaman. Normalde farklı tepkilere alışığım ve burada gayet olumlu bir tepki görünce şaşırıyordum. Buna alışmam tabi bir 3-4 ay sürdü. Alıştıktan sonra da tabii ki de insan daha motive bir şekilde sarılıyor işine, çalışmalarına, yaptığı işe ve tabii ki de insani ilişkileri de güçlendiriyor.

49. Ya bir takım şeyler konuşulamıyor. Mesela şöyle, tam mezuniyet sınavım, yarı zamanlı mezuniyet sınavı, Haziran ayındaydı ve o sınavda benim hocam da vardı jüride, bir ay sonraki sınavda benim hocam jüride yoktu. Ve bir ay önce bana işte çok iyiydi, yüksek lisans mezuniyeti gibiydi, mükemmel çaldın falan diyen insanlar bir ay sonra aynı programı çalıyorum, bambaşka şeyler dedi. Ve bana da değil. Ve bundan sonra da yapmadığım şeyler söylendiği için falan… Böyle bir şok oldum. Yani küçük camia herkes böyle davranıp birbirine yüzüne bakıyor yani.

50. Hatta psikolog bir arkadaşım var. Bunu mühendisler için de söyledi, işte bizim için de söyledi. Bu aslında psikolojik işkence eğitimi diyor. Yani sen saatlerini harcayacaksın, harcayacaksın o derse gideceksin ama hala mutlaka negatif çok şey duyacaksın. Bu arada doğrusu bu. Yani eğer çok tatmin verirsen de hakikaten öğrenci çok iyi olduğunu hissedip gelişimini yavaşlatıyor. Bunu bir şekilde dengede tutman gerekiyor. Bence bu konservatuvar eğitiminde, keman eğitiminde hakikaten iyi hocaların hepsi çok ciddi bir disiplin beklerler çünkü bu işin o şekilde yapıldığını biliyorlar. Ve bu disiplin tabii kolay değildir. Yani hiç kimse için, disiplinli biri için de kolay değildir. Disiplinsiz birisi için bayağı zordur. O yüzden açıkçası bu bence kolay bir eğitim değildi.

51. Çünkü her zaman ben öz eleştirisi yüksek bir insan oldum yani ve yaptıklarımdan çok yapamadıklarımı fark eden bir insan oldum yani o da yanlış. Yapabildiklerinden beslenmeli insan onların da kıymetini bilmeliyiz.

52. Yeteneklisin ama dedi, ciddi bir eksiğin var. Profesyonel çalmıyorsun dedi. Ben dedim ki profesyonel çalmak ne demek? Eleştiriyi anlamayacak kadar bilgi yoktu bende demek ki yani. O da dedi ki bu bir paket dedi. Dedi ki, ben sana şimdi burada bir şey öneriyorum ve sen dedi onu hemen yapabiliyorsun. Asıl bunu senin bulmuş olman gerekiyor. Senin çalışmalarında benim önerimi bulmuş olman gerekiyor ve onu tekrarlamış gelmen gerekiyor. Senin eğer bir şeyi yapmak için 7 saat keman çalışman gerekiyorsa o akşam arkadaşlarınla pizza yemeden 7 saat çalışman gerekiyor. Profesyonellik bu dedi.

53. Yaz mevsimi geliyordu. Benim hocam yazları da her hafta ders yapmaya devam ediyordu. En az 3 saat çalışması lazım diyor diye 3 saati doldurmadan beni sokağa yollamıyordu. Benim arkadaşlarım bahçede top oynuyorlardı, sesi geliyordu. Ben onların sesini duyuyordum. Bırakıyordum kemanı böyle, onları dinliyordum. O an ben kemancılığımı falan geliştirmem ki zaten. Yok. Mümkünatı yok. Bugün, bu yaşımda bile aynı duyguyu yaşasam geliştirmem, bu kadar tecrübeye rağmen yani.

54. Bize "Sadece bisiklet sürün, yüzmeye gidin, başka da spor yapmayın" dendi. "Basketbol oynamayın". Benim boyum kısaydı. Basketbola gitmek istedim. Hayır, basketbol topu eline gelir, parmağına bir şey olur dendi. Ama biz ona rağmen, futbol topunu alıyorlardı, pet şişeyle oyun oynuyorduk. Savaştık bununla, ama bununla savaşmak zorunda olmak çok yıpratıcı aslında bir çocuk için. Her seferinde geliyorlardı, hevesle oynadığımız topumuzu maçımızın ortasında alıyorlardı, götürüyorlardı. Birbirimize bakıyorduk yani. Sen bana bunu yapıyorsun, o zaman ben de sana keman çalışmak istemiyorum bunu yaptığın zaman. Böyle bir şey, kısıtlanıyorsun her şekilde.

55. Ders saati geçiyordu mesela "Yarın gel", "Tamam, perşembe yapalım." falan filan oluyordu ve böyle bizim dersler hep iptal oluyordu. Kapıda beklemekle geçiyordu. Biz de böyle "Dersimiz iptal oldu. A ders iptal oldu" falan deyip gidip kantinde çikolatalı süt falan içiyorduk. Ondan sonra… O sıralarda pratik de yapmıyorduk. Çünkü zaten performans bekleyen birisi olmadığı için çalışmıyorsun da. Ders işlenmediği için, pratik de yapmadığım için… Hani en azından süreleri pratik yaparak değerlendirseydik belki de daha iyi ilerlerdik. İlerleyemiyoruduk yani.

56. Şöyle mesela, ilk masterclass'a gittim. O bir iş değil tabii ki ama süreç öyle gidiyor. Bir masterclass'a gidiyorsun orada yabancı bir hocadan veya Türk ama, başka bir hocadan, kariyerinde belli noktalara gelmiş bir insandan bir workshop alıyorsun yani. Sonra yaz kampı oluyor, yaz kampına gidiyorsun, yine para almıyorsun ama o yaz kampında kendi işini yapan, ama başka şehirlerden, başka ülkelerden olan insanlarla interaktif bir şeyin içine giriyorsun aynı zamanda. O masterclass kapsamında bir konserin de oluyor zaten. Dolayısıyla sahnede tecrübe edinmiş oluyorsun."

57. Yani biz masterclasslara gittiğimizde, diğer çocukların nasıl çaldıklarını görünce şok olmuştuk. Bizim okulda zaten hiç ders işlenmiyordu. Ama bütün okulun şeyi böyle olduğu için seviyesi geride olduğu için kimse de daha iyi olması gerektiğinin farkında değildi. Ama sonradan Hacettepe'deki Mimar Sinan'daki… Ne bileyim bizim konservatuarın

dışında yani Çukurova, Mersin hepsinden gelen çocukların nasıl çaldıklarını görünce, Eskişehir'dekiler bile böyle çok daha iyi çalıyorlardı... Ve şok olmuştuk. Sonra böyle bir şey olduk. "Aa bunlar başka bir şeyler yapıyorlar. Bizim hocalarımız galiba çok kötü."

58. Bir de seçmelere giriyorsun, yarışmalara giriyorsun. 4 yarışmaya girdim. Bir tanesinde ikinci oldum, daha doğrusu birinciliği paylaştım. 2 tanesinde de üçüncü oldum, bir tanesinde çok küçüktüm, elendim. Yarışmalar da bittikten sonra artık yavaş yavaş böyle bir yerlerde bir ismin oluyor tabii ki. Yani kendi işte okuldaki yaşıtlarının arasında böyle adın sayıklanmaya başlıyor. Aa sen o musun diyorlar filan hani öyle şeyler olabiliyor. Yurtdışı turnesi yapan orkestraya girdim sonra, gençlik orkestrasına gene. Orada ilk yurtdışı deneyimi edindim orada mesela ilk defa hacırah aldım hayatımda. Yaşımı hatırlamıyorum ama 2013 yılıydı. Hollanda, Almanya, Belçika böyle bir turneydi. Kadrolar anlamında, kalite anlamında, seviye anlamında acayip keyifliydi tabi. Yani mesela o gün o orkestrada başkemancı olan kadın bugün Berlin Filarmoni'de çalışıyor. Yani o çok değerli bir şey. Yani böyle bağlantılar olması çok güzel müzikte.

59. Yani profesyonel hayatta yapman gerekenlerle eğitim hayatında aldığın arasında ciddi fark var bizde. Yani okuldan çok iyi bir şekilde mezun olmuş bir kemancı orkestraya geldiğinde ve açıkçası bir sudan çıkmış balığa dönüyor. Çünkü o dinamiklere hakim değil, o keman çalmaya hakim.

60. Ben sanırım 12 yaşında falandım, yani konservatuarda ikinci yılım falandı, beni konservatuara hazırlayan hocam aradı dedi ki, işte İstikbal çocuk odası reklamı için çocuk sesi aranıyor. Sizin sınıftan bir kaç kişi topla geliyorsun, ses kaydedeceğiz. Gittik, İstikbal çocuk reklamı seslendirdik ilk paramı oradan kazandım mesela. Yani tabi ki bu kariyere başlangıç falan değil ama hani böyle böyle başlıyor.

61. Yani zaten çok profesyonel bir eğitim alınca bir noktada hani şey gibi oluyorsun, "Hazırım. Hadi bana iş verin." gibi oluyorsun. Hani sadece nasıl bulacağın zor olan kısmı. Ama bana Istanbul Üniversitesi'ndeyken hocalar gelip işte "Barok orkestra kuruyoruz, çalar mısın?" demişlerdi. "İşte kilisede hafta sonları ya da işte haftada 1-2 konser vereceğiz." Ve ben de seve seve kabul etmiştim.

62. Var arkadaşlarım ekstralarda, işte bütün şarkıcıların arkasında. Ama bunun da bir garantisi yok. İki yıldır falan orkestradayım. Ailenize, çevrenize de bir memuriyet, bir devlet kadrosu göstermeden aslında

kanıtlanamıyor. Bir yandan o bakımdan da beni tatmin etmişti. Ve hani onu yaşadım ilk kez. "Tamam ya" dedim. "Başardım. Değmiş. Onca sıkıntıyla onca yorgunluğa hepsine değmiş." Olmak istediğim yerdeyim. Çok da mutluyum. Çok da hayalini kurduğum bir şeydi.

63. Hani bu sınavlar da sonuçta 4 yılda bir açılıyor. Ve bu 4 yılda yeni insanlar da yetişiyor. Sonuçta yeni müzisyenler yetiştiği için daha da zorlaşıyor. Çünkü şimdi mezun olup da sınava girenler var. Sınav öyle denk gelmiş. Yani tabii ki tamamen şans meselesi. Tabii bunlar mezuniyete çalıştıkları için, zaten elleri sıcak olduğu için daha öndeler zaten. Yaş olarak da tabii daha önde oluyorlar. Hani ne bileyim 35-40 yaşında birini almak yerine 20-25'lerinde birini almayı tercih ediyor yani herkes. O yüzden şimdi bir sonraki sınav ne zaman açılır? Ben otuzumu geçmiş olur muyum? Onu da bilmiyoruz. Yani ne olacak bitecek bilmiyoruz.

64. Ya böyle sınavlar da bu arada gerçekten çok nadir yapılır. Yani birilerinin emekli olması lazım veya işte birilerinin oradan işte istifa etmesi lazım, kurum değiştirmesi lazım vesaire.

65. Yani tipik bir haftam nasıl geçiyor? Genelde mesela tiyatro olduğu zaman, tiyatro çarşamba ve cumartesi arasında oynanıyor. Çarşamba ve cumartesi çift temsil oluyor. Perşembe ve cuma da genelde tek temsil, akşam temsili oluyor. İşte onun dışında kalan pazar, pazartesi salı, öğrencileri ayarlamaya çalışıyorum, okula gidiyorum, kendim ders yapacaksam hani, o günlerden birinde yapıyorum. Öğrencileri sıkıştırıyorum genelde işte bu boş olduğum günlere. Veya işte tiyatronun akşam oynanacağı günlere sıkıştırmaya çalışıyorum öğrencileri. Onun dışında bir de gündüzleri…. Şimdi tiyatro akşam olduğu zaman perşembe cumaları gündüzleri çalışmaya vaktim kalıyor. Gündüzleri çalışabiliyorum. Tabii ki arada dinleniyorum da bu arada. Mesela pazar günlerim eğer iş yoksa bir tane dersim oluyor. Genelde pazar günü bir veya iki. Onun dışında yatarak yaşıyorum pazar günlerini bazen. Yani çok böyle evden falan pek çıkmıyorum o gün. Ama öbür günlerde gündüzleri çalışıyorum. Prova olduğu zaman zaten tabii her şey provaya göre düzenleniyor. Mesela geçtiğimiz konserin provası işte 3.30'la 9.30 arasıydı. İşte onun öncesinde okula falan gitmiştim, kendi hocamla ders yaptım. Sonrasında oradan koştur koştur provaya gittim zaten. Akşam döndüğümde gün bitmiş oluyor.

66. Ya şu an aslında 3 yıldır falan öğretmenlik yapıyorum. İşte üniversitede çalışıyorum ve hep yarı zamanlı çocuklara dersler veriyorum. O bakımdan da çok keyifli. Yani çocuklarla çalışmak, ve işte yeni bir şeylere

başlatmak onu. Enstrümana başlatmak… Hepsi bambaşka. Psikolojileri, fizikleri falan… Onları keşfetmek falan. O da hani müzisyenliğin yanında apayrı böyle bambaşka bir dünya gibi oldu benim için. Çok da keyifli oldu. Yani onun dışında işte kendim, oda müziği grubumuz var. Mesela onlarla çalmak çok keyifli.

67. Gelip dedikleri zaman 'A öğretmenlik de yapabilirsin aslında'... Biraz kırıcı oluyor çünkü performansa ihtiyacımız var. Bir seçenek olarak öğretmenliği sunmak hoş olmuyor aslında. Hiçbir yerde çalmıyorsa hocalık yapabilir, formasyon alıp. Ama mutlu olur mu? Hayır, hiçbir şekilde mutlu olmaz. Böyle şey gibi, hani 'İşsiz kaldıysam, başka ne yapabilirim? 'Son şans şeklinde başvurulabilecek bir meslek toplu sınıf öğretmenliği.

68. Ya şimdiki geçişim tamamen Türkiye'nin ekonomisinden dolayı zorunlu bir geçiş oldu. Üniversitede dediğim gibi, hocaydım. Öğretim görevlisi. Ve artık kiramın aldığım maaşı geçtiğini görünce bunun bu şekilde ilerleyemeyeceğini gördüm. Ve bir kurumda bir devlet kurumunda kadrolu olunca başka bir kurumda çalışamıyorsun. Benim başka bir şekilde para kazanmam lazım hayatımı sürdürebilmek için. Bunun böyle ilerleyemeyeceğini gördüğümde de böyle bir karar verdim.

69. Oradaki koşullarla yüzde yüz ilgisi var. Yoksa ben Kadıköy'den, İstanbul'dan her şeyden çok memnunum. Kültürümüzden… Olumlu olumsuz her şeyiyle ben barışık bir vatandaşım aslında. Ama dediğim gibi mümkünatı olmadığını gördüm öncelikle. Yani gelen bütün işlere gitsem. Hani gözümü kapatıp tamam, klasik müzik çalmıyorum ama para alacağım işte tüm bulduğum öğrencilere ders versem etsem vesaire sonucunda olan şeyin şu olduğunu gördüm. Hiçbir zaman yeterli olmuyor ve kendimi geliştiremiyorum artık. Çünkü ona da zamanım olmuyor. Ve çok yorgunum, çok yorgun bir hayat. Ve düzensiz. Ve şey. Güvenli hissetmeme. Çok fazla vardı. Hani sonrası nedir bunun? Ben bunu kaç yaşına kadar yapabilirim? 40 yaşına kadar ben takviye işlere mi gideceğim?

70. Hani müzisyen olmak, tamam bana göre evet güzel. Ama hani tuzum kuru gibi… Ki tuz da kuru değil bu arada. Yani hani çok da şey değilmiş. Ben mesela kadro alırsam evime çıkacağım... Kendi evime, şöyle güzel bir evde… Öyle bir şey yok. Öyle bir şey imkansız şu an. Hani tek bir kişiyle imkansız.

71. Hem 4-5 tane orkestraya aynı anda gidiyorum, hem de ekstra işlere de gidiyorum geldikçe. Neden? Gelecek için bir yatırım yapabileyim,

biriktireyim diye. Yıl sonunda biriken para enflasyona yeniliyor ve birikmiyor. Gene eskisinden böyle %1 %2 artmış oluyor benim param, biriktirdiğim para. Ben kendime çıkıp böyle şey başımı sokabileceğim bir ev alamıyorum İstanbul'da. 80-90'larda çalışan insanların sadece kendi maaşıyla aldıkları evleri alabilmek için benim bunun da 2 katı çalışmam gerekir ama öyle bir insan evladı yok, uyumayayım mı o zaman?

72. Bir sürü her şeyi yoluna giden arkadaşım var. Ama dediğim gibi bir önceki bahsettiğimiz her şeye sahipler. İyi hocaya denk gelmek, aile desteği. Bir şekilde şansının yaver gitmesi sonucu. Yine de çok yorgunlar. Yine de bütün takviye işlere gitmeleri gerekiyor. Bu da dipnot. Hiçbir şeye hayır dememeleri gerekiyor ki ilerideki gelirlerinden emin olsunlar.

73. Benim müzikolog olma hikayem şöyle oldu, ben keman sınavına hazırlandım. 2 sene (konservatuvardaki bir hocadan) ders aldım. Ondan önce de başka bir hocadan ders almıştım. O da konservatuvar müdürünün öğrencisiydi. Onlar beni çok ciddi bir şekilde hazırladılar. Ben işte solfej, teori dersleri de aldım ekstra, onların sınavlarını da vereceğim için. Yani bir takım yetersizliklerimin olduğunun farkındaydım ama hani çabamı gördükleri için beni senelerdir tanıdıkları için, hani üniversitede beni alırlarsa, üniversitede orada bir eğitim alarak toparlayabileceğime iyice, hani öyle düşünüyordum, inanıyordum. Ve tabii ki hiçbir B planım yoktu alınmayacağımı bilmediğim için. Çünkü ben zaten bir sene ara vermiştim. Bir sena ara verdiğim için verdiğim için artık bir sene daha hazırlanmak gibi bir şeyim, yani öyle bir şeyi hayal dahi edemiyordum o anda. Bu süreci okulun müdürü de takip etti işte, "Sakin ol.", ondan sonra "Bir bakalım bugün ne sınavı varmış başka." falan diye böyle "Aa müzikoloji sınavı varmış, gel seni müzikoloji bölümüne sokalım." deyip… Ama zaten şey, yani zaten konservatuar mezunu olan çocuklardan müzikoloji bölümünde çok bir sınav, bir şey istemiyorlarmış yani. O şekilde Müzikoloji Bölümü'nün jüri sınavına girdim. Ondan sonra oraya kabul edildim.

74. Ya ben şu an beyaz yakalı gibi çalışıyorum. Beyaz yakayım aslında. Keyfi özel öğrencilerim var. Kendi sorumluluklarımı biliyorum. Çalışma saatlerim belli. Mesaim bittiği zaman kesinlikle işle ilgili bir şey düşünmüyorum.
75. Düşünmek zorunda değilim. Onun sorumluluğunu taşımıyorum. Ve özel hayatıma odaklanabiliyorum. İş hayatımdaki herhangi bir olumsuzluk veya bir stres, ya da herhangi bir şey benim özel hayatımı etkilemiyor. Bu da en büyük bonus. Yani maddi gelirden daha da önemli bir şey. Yani belli bir yaştan sonra hele çok çok daha önemli.

76. Şöyle, üniversitenin başından itibaren orada burada böyle piyasada bir işlere bir yerlere gitmeye başladım. Bir yandan kurslarda dersler veriyordum. Özel öğrencilerim oluyordu. Fakat yani hep oturmayan bir şey vardı içimde. Yani çocukluktan beri evet bunu yapıyorum. Sanki benim hayatım amacı ve tüm gerçeğim buymuş gibi deli gibi çalışıyorum ediyorum buna. Enerjimi eforumu harcıyorum. Ama dedim, hep içimde böyle bir eksik kalan bir şey vardı. O noktada da zaten pandemi patladı. Ve, yani öyle söylemiş olmak hoş olmayabilir. İyi ki patladı. Çünkü biraz olsun o ortamın, o ortamdan dışarı çıkabildim. Ve pandemi başlar başlamaz yogaya başladım. Yani başka bir iş yapma fikri hiç yoktu. Ben 80 yaşına kadar müzik yapacağım ve hani belki okulda bunu öğreteceğim ya da sahneye çıkacağım falan sanıyordum yani. Öyle olmadığını görmek çok özgürleştirici oldu. Şu an süper, çok memnunum olduğum yerden. İki yıl oldu. 2022'den beri düzenli olarak yoga dersleri veriyorum.

77. Eğer konservatuvardan mezun olunca senfoniye, operaya girmezsen ve akademisyenlik yapmıyorsan, dördüncü bir şıkkın yok.

78. Yani kasımda ben imzamı attım. Kasımda imza attıktan sonra kanun değişti. Nisan'da herkese kadro geldi. Ama herkese gelmedi. Ya sıkıntı da şuydu, "28 Kasım öncesi imza atan" ibaresi vardı. Ben 12 Kasım'da imza attım. En büyük şansım da olur. Zaten hala söylüyorum. Fakat mesela aralıkta giren bir arkadaşım kadro alamadı. Böyle bir uçurum var neredeyse maaşlar arasında. Ama çalışma temposu aynı.

79. Bu devlet kadrosunda bir kere gelelim artık bana bir şey olmaz mantığı kuralı bence çok yanlış. Çünkü kadrosunu aldıktan sonra oraya emek vermese de orada onu denetleyen çünkü kimse yok. Onu bir kere elde ettim ve artık o benim düşüncesi olmaması lazım.

80. Onu bile geçtin yani, iyi, gelişmiş ülkelerde şöyle bir beklenti bile var, yani sen sadece bir orkestra müzisyeni olamazsın. Sen aynı zamanda oda müziği konserleri vermelisin dışarıda. İşte arada bir solistlik de çalmalısın. Arada bir, ne bileyim ben, yani bir yerlerde bulunmalısın, bir jüri ol bir yerde bir şey yap, aktif ol. Öyle ben geliyorum orkestraya, orkestradan orkestraya, öyle olmaz. Çünkü orkestracılık, tek başına orkestracı partileri çaldığın zaman o teknikten götüren bir şey, senden alan bir şey. Yani senin sürekli o solo çalışmalarını yapıyor olman lazım. O solo konser deneyimini yerine getiriyor olman lazım. 10 kişiyle beraber aynı partiyi çalmakla tek başına çıkıp tek bir solo partiyi çalmak sonuçta farklı bir duygu.

81. Şimdi ben mezun olalı olmuş daha 5 yıl, 6 yıl daha henüz nasıl diyeyim, taze. İşte bilgiler taze, öğrenme açlığı var. Ama büyük de konuşmak istemiyorum belki mesela bu orkestradaki 10. 15. yılımda biraz daha düşeceğim. Biraz daha artık yorulacağım. O yüzden yargılamıyorum da. Ama yapanları da görüyorum. Mesela adam 35 yıldır bu orkestrada ama öyle bir aşkla çalıyor ki. Fakat kimseyi onun gibi olmaya zorlayamıyorum. Yani düşünsenize mesela, zaten sürekli yeni eser yazılmıyor. Ben mesela Romeo Juliet Balesini ilk kez okuyorum, ilk kez çalacağım. Çok hevesliyim. Ama orada kadın, kemancı hani 35 yılda bunu o kadar çok çalmış ki. O yüzden hani çok da şeyi yok bunun, ya çok büyük bir fark yok bu arada kalite farkı falan diye. Ama biraz daha özenli olmakla alakalı aslında.

82. Üzülerek söylüyorum, özel sektördeki çalışmalarımız daha kaliteli oluyor. Affetsinler beni, neden? Özel sektörde şu var işinizi yapmazsanız sizi çağırmayabilirler. Bu kadar basit. Üzgünüm, insan bazen profesyonelliğini ona sunulan şartların zorluğuyla belirliyor. Keşke belirlemese, keşke her yerde aynısını yapmaya çalışan insanlar olsak hepimiz. Var aramızda, onların hepsine saygı duyuyorum ama açık söylemek gerekirse, çoğu demeyeyim, bir bölümü maalesef böyle düşünüyor. Oradaki o maaş her ay yatıyor. O prova ne kadar çabuk biterse kazanç. Özel orkestralarda siz müzisyenleri davet ediyorsunuz. Diyorsunuz ki şu filarmoni orkestrası ben, şu kadar provam var, şu kadar şu konserim var, bunları çalıyorum. Şu kadar da para öneriyorum. Kabul ediyorlar, geliyorlar. Devlet orkestralarından daha hazır geliyorlar. Neden? Çünkü orada o maaşlarından farklı, sorgulanabilir bir iş yapabilme ihtimallerini biliyorlar. O yüzden özel orkestra sisteminin kalite açısından biraz daha ileriye gidebilen bir sistem olduğunu üzülerek deneyimliyorum.

83. Bunu zaten Türkiye'de her alanda görüyorsun. Öğrenci işlerine gidiyorsun, oradaki mutsuz. Devlet dairesine gidiyorsun, oradaki mutsuz. Hastaneye gidiyorsun, oradaki çalışan memurun mutsuz, yani isteksiz çalışıyorlar. Bir şekilde emekli olmak için çalışıyor tüm memurlar.

84. Yani biraz da anlıyorum tabii ki yani anlamak da gerekiyor aslında. Çünkü herkes gibi yıkılmakta olan bir ekonomi ve özgürlüklerin kısıtlandığı bir şartlar içinde insanlar birbirine destek olarak, tamam biz en azından nefes almayı sürdürebilelim savaşındalar yani, hani çok da suçlayamazsın. Evet yani bir sanatçı bile artık sanatını ikinci plana atmak durumunda kalıyor. Sanki biz bir savaş ülkesiyiz gibi.

85. Opera'da neyin ne olduğu hiçbir zaman belli değil yani. Her an her şey iptal olabiliyor, değişiyor. Neyi ne zaman çalacağın belli değil. Ben çoğu

zaman pazar akşamını bekliyorum, o hafta hangi eserin hangi provasında ben çalacağım? “Hangi provasında diğer arkadaşım çalacak, nasıl bölüşeceğiz”i pazar akşamına kadar bekliyorum.

86. Baktığınızda part-time çalışıyoruz. Hani tamam iki saat yol gidiyorum falan ama üç saat çalışıyorum. O üç saatin de zaten yarım saati ara yapıyorum. Mesela bu hafta dört gün çalacağım. Normalde dört gün çalmıyorum ama işte bir arkadaşımız hastalandığı için onun yerine çalacağım. En yoğun haftamız şöyle oldu, iki hafta üst üste her gün. Sabah prova, akşam temsil. Ama en güzel tarafı da şu, bunu biliyorum, haziranda sezon bitiyor ve eylüle kadar rahat, tatil.

87. Çoğu özel orkestralar günübirlik kadro kurmakla, yani işte telefonla arayıp takviye şeklinde çağırmakla kurulan toplama orkestralar oluyorlar çoğu zaman. Yani çoğunlukla aynı kişiler çalıyor olsa bile takviye şeklinde bunlar bir maaşa bağlanmak, bir sözleşmeye, kadroya geçirilerek yapılan şeyler olmuyor genellikle. Evet yani bunu yapan işte kim var Borusan, Bilkent, Tekfen, ki Tekfen yılda bir ya da iki konser veriyor sadece. Ve nadir sınav açılıyor.

88. Çok zor. Çok zor. Çünkü katakulli de çok dönüyor sınavlarda. Emeğinin karşılığını alamayıp yıpranan çok fazla insan oluyor... Mesela Borusan çok düzgün sınav yapıyor. Şöyle, kimsenin adını söylemiyor. Herkesin bir aday numarası var işte, sınav programı belli. Deşifre çalma oluyor sınavlarda mesela. O an gördüğünüz bir şeyi çalma. Onları da atıyorum, 50 tane parça veriyor, bunlardan ikisini soracağım diyor. Normal yurt dışında yapılan gibi standartlara uygun. Ha bir de mesela perde arkası sınav yapıyor, Borusan. Sizi görmüyor bu şekilde. Adını da bilmiyor, içeriye giren kişi bir numara. Tipini de görmüyorsun, çok güzel. Yani hiçbir şekilde kayıramazsın.

89. Tek bir sınava girdim, yüzümüzü görmedikleri. Borusan'dı. Onda da kamera koymuşlar. Sonra görebiliyorlar ama zaten biz de sonuçları sonra öğreniyoruz... Sanırım en düzgünü Borusan bu konuda. Çünkü dinleyince iyiler. En azından bunu söyleyebilirim. Yani bir tanıdıklarını alıyorlarsa bile iyi iş çıkarıyorlar.

90. Onun dışında, Gedik Filarmoni diye, Gedik Sanat diye diğerlerine göre daha yeni bir sanat kurumumuz var. Onun orkestrasındayım. Orada aslında bir kurumun yapmasını planladığımız, hayal ettiğimiz şeyleri yapıyoruz, oranın çok değerli bir şeyi var. Biz her konserde Türk bestecilerine siparişler veriyoruz. Ve orkestranın boyutuna göre işte değişkenlik gösteriyor. Küçük ensemble için olabiliyor. Orta bir büyüklükte orkestra için olabiliyor. O sipariş verdiğimiz besteleri çalışıp

çalıp kaydediyoruz. Ben içinde bulunduğum için değil gerçekten çok saygı duyduğum bir şey. Çünkü 5-6 sene oldu, ve pandemi vardı bu 5-6 sene içinde öyle hayal edin, 115 sipariş vermişiz ve çalmışız ve kaydetmişiz. Hep aynı cümleyi kullanıyorum bunu anlatırken hani böyle toz olsak havaya uçsak Gedik Sanat yok olsa, 115 tane müzik artık yazıldı, çalındı. Bence üretimdir, katkıdır. O yüzden de açıkçası onun içinde bulunmaktan ben müzisyen olarak çok mutlu oluyorum.

91. Sabit işi olmayan ama aynı zamanda enstrümanına devam eden hem de yaşıtım… Sanırım yok. İlla bir yerde, ya formasyon alıp hocalığa girmişlerdir ve artı takviyeye gidiyorlardır. Kendilerini bir yerde sabitlemişlerdir yani. Bir sürü özel okul var işte. Maltepe Konservatuarı gibi son yıllarda açılan yerler var. Buralara girenler biliyorum. Özel okulların müzik bölümü gibi.

92. Yani böyle karalar bağlamıştım ben. Hani mezun oldum ve hiçbir şey yok. Çünkü yani genelde böyle ekstra işlere gidiyorum. Sürekli o orkestra, bilmem ne şeyi falan. Günlük ve düzenli olmayan. Onların içerisinde boğuluyor insan. Tabii ki düzenli bir şey olması hem güven veriyor hem de özgüven de veriyor insana yani. Öyle 4 sene oldu sanıyorum. Evet 4 senedir işte düzenli olarak orada (özel bir konservatuvarda) çalışıyorum. Güzel.

93. Akademik kariyer yapmayı bana okul çok fazla empoze etmeye başlamıştı. Zaten çocuk yaştan konservatuara gidiyorsan, yine böyle o okulda hoca olacaksın diye birazcık manipüle ediyorlar. Ben de biraz edildim. Bir süre öyle olacağımı sanıyordum ama hayır dedim, bittikten sonra asla buraya geri dönmeyeceğim dedim.

94. (Akademisyenlik hedefi) Vardı. Yani. Vardı diyorum çünkü o kadar yoruldum ki artık sürekli okul çevresinde olmaktan. Bir de okuldaki insanları da gördükçe, okuldaki hocaların ortamı da… Biraz daha içinde bulundukça… Şimdi küçükken çok fazla anlamıyorduk tabii de, büyüyünce biraz daha… Çünkü orada da aynı ego muhabbeti var. Takımlar var, birbirini tutan insanlar var. Hani birbiriyle iyi anlaşan insanlar var. Ve onlar gruplaşmış vaziyetteler. Ama bazen de onlara karşı gelen bir düşmanları olduğunda bir anda kenetlenebiliyorlar falan birbirlerine hocalar yani. O yüzden hani…Garip. Çok yanar dönerli. Ben bilmiyorum hiç huzurum olmayabilir böyle bir ortamda çalışırsam. Ama ekmek parasıdır. Yapmamız gerekirse yapar mıyım ve ne kadar dayanırım? Onu da şu an bilmiyorum. İstiyordum akademisyen olmayı. Şu an sadece ortamdan dolayı hani istemiyorum. Yoksa hâlâ istiyorum devam etmek.

95. Şimdi şöyle, aynı koşullarda çok az hoca vardı, benimle aynı koşullarda olan. Onlar da en fazla özel ders ya da özel kurumlardaki işlerini çoğaltarak bir şekilde… Ya da alternatif seçenekleri olmadığı için. Bir bu, ikincisi de aile durumundan dolayı maddi kaygısı olmayan insanlardı genellikle.

96. Tamamen referansla yürüyen bir iş. Daha doğrusu ben de hani belli bir noktadan sonra, kadrom geldikten sonra öğrencilerde seçici olmaya başladım ve bunu da sadece tavsiye üstüne zaten konservatuarda hoca olunca çoğu kişi senden ders aldırmak istiyor çocuğuna ve çok talep olunca da seçici davranabiliyordum. Konservatuarın, tabi orada çalışmanın avantajını kullandım yani referans olarak.

97. Mesela şu an özel ders için büyük avantaj oluyor sosyal medya sanırım. Çünkü işte bir şekilde güven mi veriyor ya da başka bir şey mi bilmiyorum ama çok takipçili ve beğenili birinin öğrencisi olmak daha mutlu ediyor gibi insanları, öyle geliyor.

98. Yani "Biz çocuğumuza piyano dersi aldırmak istiyoruz." deyip eşine dostuna soruyorsa birisi, hani bir konservatuvardan birine sorayım, ciddi birisi olsun diye düşünmüyorsa, genelde bu alanda zaten müzik öğretmenleri ders veriyordu. Bir de onlar ücretleri düşük tutuyorlar. Ama daha profesyonel olanlar şöyle, gidiyorsun, ben diyorsun, çocuğuma işte konservatuvardan ders aldırmak istiyorum. Konservatuvardan hoca sana diyor ki piyanoda işte şu var, onunla senin bağlantını kuruyor falan. Dolayısıyla profesyonel olan insanın zaten sosyal medya reklamına ihtiyacı yok. Çünkü zaten hani işinde yetkin birisi. Ama amatör camiada zaten o insan kendi reklamını yaparak açıkçası o dersleri veriyor. Yani zaten şey yok, zaten enstrüman yetisi yok. Zaten kötü öğretiyor. Orada bir denetim de yok sonuçta. Dersi aldıran kişi de çocuğunun nasıl çaldığını fark etmiyor. Dolayısıyla evet o insanlar sosyal medyayı çok aktif kullanıyorlar.

99. Bir de hani ne bileyim güzel kaşeler. Maaşın beşte birini adam, sana bir prova ve bir konsere veriyor. 2 günde kazanıyorsun onu. Ama bunun yorgunluğu da oluyor. Mesela ben işte, operanın programı geliyor. "Bu hafta işte 5 gün çalacağız." Arkadaşıma diyorum ki, "Çok yoruldum." falan, ben diyor işte 'Hafta sonları da diğer işlere gittim. Bir de şuna buna gittim, daha çok yoruldum 'falan. Onu da yapmamız lazım. Ek para desteği gerekiyor. Çocuğu varsa, ailesi varsa. Böyle olması gerekiyor yani.

100. Yani şöyle, şimdi bu ekstra işlere bel bağlayacak hale geliyorsunuz. Onların da birini reddedince bir daha hiç gelmeme durumu falan olabiliyor. O yüzden böyle herkes bir şeylerin peşinde koşturup duruyor. Çünkü birini kabul ettin mi bu sefer hep o da gelmeye başlıyor, aynı iş ya da o işi size yazan insan başka işleri de organize ediyorsa onları atmaya başlıyor falan. Var şu an mesela hiçbir yerde kadrosu olmayan ve sürekli işten işe koşturan…

101. Hani iki kere reddedince üçüncüde çağırmıyorlar. Müsait olan gelsin diyorlar.

102. Bir tekelleşme durumu var. Bir takım insanların elinde olan bazı konser salonları ve şeyleri var. İşte oraları istiyorsanız onlarla iyi anlaşmak zorundasınız gibi bir durum olabiliyor.

103. Davranışlara bağlı gerçekten. Bir otorite var ve o otoriteye senin otorite gibi davranman gerekiyor. Ve onun kim olduğunu iyi bilmen gerekiyor. Ve onun altındaki alt otoritelere de iyi davranman, onlara istedikleri çerçeve içerisinde davranman gerekiyor. Genel olarak minimum sorun çıkartan, maksimum çalışan, iş halleden ve pıt pıt pıt her şeyi zamanında yapan, istenildiğinde hemen hop ordasın…

104. Ben networkün sağlıklısının bu çok zorlanmayan network yaratma meselesi olduğunu düşünüyorum. Ha zorlarsın. Menajerler var, menajerlerle tanışırsın, iyi yerlerde insanlar var, onlara iyi davranırsın falan gibi şeyler var açıkçası yani. Yalan söyleyemem. Yani şöyle, sürekli olmadığını düşünüyorum. Yani siz eğer o işi yapmak için donanıma yeteri kadar sahip değilseniz network adına kurduğunuz şeyler sizi bir süre rahat ettirir. Günün sonunda negatif taraflarınızla yine baş başa kalırsınız.

105. Ya bir şeyi iyi yapıyorsanız bence o en iyi network. Mesela bizim quartet için bence en muhteşem şey o. Biz çok zayıf network'e sahip insanlarız. Yani şöyle, "o şeye" sahip değiliz yani. "Ya bizim de böyle bir quartetimiz var" diye konuşacak kişiler değiliz. Ama şöyle oluyordu, bir yerde konser veriyoruz. O konsere gelen bir kişi diyor ki iki tane daha konser şurada yapar mısınız? Bence bu muhteşem bir çözüm. Muhteşem.

106. Yani şöyle. Artık manifest mi diyeyim, ne diyeyim bilmiyorum. Ama mesela gittiğin bir işi paylaştıkça, işte storymize koyuyoruz mesela işte, şu şu tarihte şu konserde çalıyoruz işte bu bu tarihte... Sanki daha çok hani göz önünde olduğun için bu daha çok çağrılıyormuşsun gibi bir izlenim yaratabiliyor bende. Tam aksine şey de olabiliyor. Bazen yani hiç paylaşmayan insanlar da benden daha çok işe gitmiş olabiliyorlar.

107. İşte program sunuculuğu yapan var. Mesela sosyal medyada başlayıp sürekli videolarını atıyor falan ama bir yandan bir yerde de öğretim görevlisiydi sanırım. Ondan sonra işte, iyice tanındıktan sonra TRT'de galiba kemanıyla program sunuculuğu falan yapmaya başladı, işte konuklar çağırıyor, yine kemancıları falan…

108. İstediğin müziği bir türlü yapamıyorsun yani. Öğrendiğin şeyi, icra etmek istediğin şeyi bir türlü… İçinde kalıyor, yapamıyorsun yani. Sana gelip gelip diyorlar ki "Bilmem kimin arkasında çalar mısın?" Gerçek işler gelmiyor.

109. Ben proje bazlı çalışıyorum tiyatroda. Bir oyunda çalışıyorum sadece. Öbür oyunda da başka müzisyenler çalışıyor. Ve bu iki yılda birçok müzisyeni de işe aldılar işte bu şekilde. Hani proje bazlı bile olsa yine de bir oyun sonuçta 3-4 yıl devam ediyor. Ve hani 3-4 sezon boyunca oynandığı takdirde yine de insanlara bir gelir kaynağı oluyor. Ama tabii ki hani yine de kaç kişilik oluyor mesela bir müzikal oyun tiyatroda? Kaç kişi oluyor orkestrada düşünüyorum. Maksimum olsun 20. Yani daha fazla değil. Üflemelisi olsun… 20 bile çok demiş bile olabilirim yani.

110. Amadeus bize bir dönemlik, bir senelik program atardı. Günümüz, saatimiz, her şeyimiz belli olurdu. Alacağımız para… Bu mesela bir güvence şeyi hissettiriyordu bize. Hani en azından biliyorsun ki önümüzdeki ay şunu şunu şunu alacağım oradan. O da iptal olmazsa bu arada.

111. Yani İstanbul yorucu bir yer olduğu için insanlar dinlenmek için de zaman bulmaya… Zor zaman buluyor yani. Bazısı şey, akademisyen olarak çalışıyor, bazısı orkestrada çalışıyor, işte ben freelance çalışıyorum, iş geldikçe. Hani kimsenin takvimi birbirine uymadığı için zor oluyor ne yazık ki görüşmek. Şimdi her gün, mesela mezuniyeti olan biri, her gün 3-4-5 saat işte vakti oldukça çalışan biri. Sense mesela o sırada işten işe koşturup arada bulduğun bir saat... Hani böyle 'Ya dinleneyim mi, çalışayım mı? 'diye düşünüyorsun yani.

112. Ya, çünkü mümkün değil, mümkün değil, yani bir sosyallik, bir şey. O da ne oluyor? Müzisyenler, sosyalliği tamamen gece hayatında arıyorlar. Onları mutlu eden şey alkol oluyor. Gece hayatındaki sohbetler oluyor. Hayatın başka şekillerdeki tatlarını çıkaramıyorlar. Bir gün boşları olacak olsa evde geçirip dinlenmeye çalışıyorlar. Pijamalarıyla, göz bandı bilmem ne, bitki çayları, odur budur. Kimisi işte birasını içerek mi

rahatlıyor, öyle rahatlıyor evde. Film izliyor. Ne yapıyorsa, kimisi sadece yatıyor. Ya ben kendimi bazen böyle telefondan başka hiçbir şeye bakamaz bir enerjiyle buluyorum. Ne bir kitap açıp okuma enerjim kalıyor, ne bir arkadaşımı arayıp halini, hatırını sorma enerjim kalıyor, hiçbir şey yani. Yani bırak çalacağın esere odaklanmayı, bu o kadar kaliteyi düşüren bir şey ki.

113. E bazı işlerde mesela ne, kumanya bile verilmiyor, yani su bile yok ya. Bazısında su bile yok mesela gün içinde. Su bile yoktu... Kaldı ki ben şimdi mesela… Evet hani, belli bir ücret alıyorum mesela sizin konserinizde. Ama şimdi bu aldığım ücretle 3 gün, 2 gün prova ve 1 gün konser, ben o 2 gün boyunca fotosentez yapmıyorum sonuçta yemek yiyorum dışarıda. Su alıyorum en basitinden, bir kahve alıyorsun en basitinden. Çünkü 6 saat provadasın. O 6 saat içerisinde aralarda illa ki bir şey yiyip içiyorsun yani. Şimdi onun zaten dörtte birini harcamış oluyorum. Ben paranın dörtte birini harcamış oluyorum. E bir de mesela kar yağdı atıyorum geçen 2-3 gün boyunca, bir de taksiyle geldim eve. Hani ulaşım sağlayamadım çünkü. E onda da bir dörtte birini daha harcadım. Yani senin eline kalan şey komik bir rakam oluyor aslında. Su bile yok ya bazı işte. Ayıp yani.

114. Takviye bir işe gittiğin zaman çok kötü bir ortam oluyor. Hava şartları. Hiçbir fikrin yok ve genelde açık havaya çağırılıyordum herkes gibi. Yani senfoni değilse, takviye bir işse, konser salonunda değilse çok zor geçiyor. Şeyi bile hatırlıyorum, çimende oturduğumuz ve dürüm yediğimizi. Ve sonra çıkıp aşırı nemli bir yerde Hababam Sınıfı çaldığımızı hatırlıyorum. Ve yayım o kadar nemliydi ki… Yay kılları ve ahşap birbirine yapışmıştı artık nemden. Mesela o zaman da şey olmuştum. Hani demiştim ki yani "Kemanıma zarar. Şu an alacağım paraya değmez." filan gibi düşünmüştüm. Zor oluyor yani bütün şartlar.

115. Oda müziği kendi grubumuz onunla istediğimiz zaman istediğimiz yerde yapabiliyoruz. Yani, hatta ondan maddi olarak bir beklentimiz yok. Çok keyif aldığımız bir şey olduğu için. Hani nerede olursa beraber olalım, çalalım gibi bir şey. O yüzden en keyif aldığım o yani aslında. Çünkü bir bağlayıcılığı olmuyor. Bir şeylerin altına girdikçe birtakım kalıplara girebilmek gerekiyor bazen. Onun olmaması, büyük özgürlük.

116. Oda müziği yapmayı çok… En çok oda müziği yapmayı istemiştim. Ya işte 3'lü 4'lü veya 5'li bir grup içinde çalmayı çok istemiştim. Çünkü konservatuvarın en yakın arkadaşlarımla zaten hani öyle bir grubumuz olduğu için bir ömür o şekilde çalışmayı çok istemiştim. Türkiye'de böyle

bir şey imkanım yok. Ya oda müziği sanatçısı olarak para kazanıp hayatını idame ettirebilmenin herhangi bir durumu yok.

117. Değişik bir şey yapıyor hissi vardı. Niş mi denir? Memnundum yani ben bunu okumaktan. Her zaman olumlu tepki aldım.

118. Yani ben ayrıcalıklı hissediyorum sanırım. Güzeldi ya. Seviyorum. Evet zor bir meslek yani. Fiziksel açıdan zor, sürekli dikkat etmen gerekiyor. Sürekli çalışman gerekiyor. Yani çalışmadığın zaman hamlıyorsun. Zor ama bilmiyorum. Ben hep zor yolu tercih ettim galiba. O yüzden bu benim hoşuma gidiyor. Seviyorum yani çalışma saatlerini de seviyorum. Evet yorucu sürekli enstrüman taşımak bir yere, İstanbul gibi bir yerde, araban yoksa. Hani bir provaya giderken bile enstrümanını taşıyor olmak, konser kıyafetini taşıyor olmak vesaire. Ama konserde çaldığındaki, hissettiğin o hani ingilizce şey deniyor ya "Goose Bumps" tüy ürpermesi mi, nasıl söyleyeyim bilmiyorum. O his yani aldığın alkış, yaşadığın o heyecanı… Hiç hiçbir zaman mesela şey olmuyor, alışmıyorsun o heyecana. Yani hep sanki ilk kez yapıyormuşsun gibi oluyor. Ve bunlar bence güzel şeyler. Yani hoşuma gidiyor, tatmin ediyor, ruhen gerçekten tatmin ediyor.

119. Ve öyle de bir yetiştirme tabi, yani geliyordu hocaların mesela, bir taşkınlık, bir şey olmuş. Mesela atıyorum geliyorlar, sınıf sınıf geziyorlar çocuklara işte öğüt verecekler. 'Siz sanatçı adayısınız. Siz toplumun çok özel insanlarısınız arkadaşlar ona göre davranın 'diyorlardı.

120. Müzisyen olmak aslında güzel bir his, ayrıcalıklı bir his olduğunu zannediyordum aslında ama... Aslında her mesleğin ayrıcalıklı olduğunu düşünüyorum şimdi buraya geldikten sonra. Yani tam anlamıyla yapmadığımız için o hissi… O hissin hakkını verebildiğimi zannetmiyorum. Çünkü belli zorunluluklarımız var. Yani güzel yönleri var ama hoşumuza gitmeyen yönleri de var. Ondan dolayı ayrıcalıklı bir şey olarak görmüyorum. Sonuçta öyle bir yeteneğim vardı. Öyle bir şey okudum. Evet sanat çok değerli bir alan ama diğer mesleklere göre ayrıcalıklı görmüyorum açıkçası.

121. Şimdi bu doğru bir şey bu arada, yani tamam çok özel insanlarız. Neden özel insan ama? Çünkü sanat yapıyoruz. Bu yüzden özeliz. Yani diğerleri bizden daha aşağı bir şey olduğu için değil, biz sanat yapmayı tercih etmiş olan insanlar olduğumuz için ve bu yolla toplumun sanata değer veren insanlarına yol gösteriyor olduğumuz için, bir ışık tutuyor olduğumuz için, sanat yoluyla. Bu kadar, biz sadece aracı olduğumuz için aslında, yani sanata aracı olduğumuz için özeliz.

122. Çok fazla egoist insan var. Ben bilmiyorum, hani bazı insanlar şeyi savunuyor, müzisyende hani biraz ego olmalı. Hani o kendine güven olmalı. Tabii ki kendine güven olmalı. Ama saçma bir ego da olmamalı bence. Ben yakıştırmıyorum yani böyle bir şeyi bir sanatçıya. Yakıştırmıyorum açıkçası. Yani herkes dışarıdan çok şey gözükebiliyor, muhabbetli, samimi, tatlı vesaire. Ama bir de işte göreceksin onları.

123. Bir yandan da o disiplin sadece enstrüman özelinde olan bir şey olarak diyebilirim. Diğer tarafta şımarıklık, yani marjinalliğin dışında bir şımarıklık yüklüyor sana. Toplum içinde de her alanda kendini öyle hissediyorsun yani. Bir grupsun, küçük bir grupsun, özel bir grupsun. O grup halinde dolaşıyorsun. Diğer herkesi aşağılardık biz mesela. Herkesle, her şeyle dalga geçerdik. Her türlü müzikle, her türlü meslekle… Çünkü kendini çok özel ve harika bir şey yapıyor olarak görüyorsun. Yani tamam bir çocuksun zaten. Yani kendimi evet, özgüvenli hissediyordum ama bir yandan da çok şeydi, acımasız bir tarafı da vardı yani. O gruplaşma ile ilgili bir şey bir yandan da o.

124. Çok niş bir alan. Bir tek gustosu olanlar anlayabilir onu. Ve ben de bunun eğitimini aldığım için anlayabilirim. Güzel bir müzik duyduğum zaman… Ya da güzel bir konser seçmeyi biliyorum. Bana fayda sağlayacak bir bilgim var bu konuda, en büyük getirisi bu şu an.

125. Çünkü zaten işte dediğim gibi Eyüp gibi bir yerde büyüyorum. O ana kadar klasik müzik diye bir şeyi zaten bilmiyorum. Kemanın şeklini bilmiyorum, bir kornodur, fagottur. E opera deyince dalga geçtiğim bir konu insanların sesini o şekilde kullanması gülünen bir şey vesaire falan, yani sığ bir bakış açısıyla büyüyen, o çevrede yaşayan bir insandım yani.

126. Müzik konusunda, ben öğrenciyken hep şunu diyorum, ben faşistmişim. Yani hiçbir şekilde başka şey bırak çalmayı dinlemekten bile hoşlanmazdım. Böyle birazcık şey görürdüm, biraz kibirli bakardım. Ama çok şükür o zaman bitti. Her bakımdan bitti yani. Ben de aynı kişi değilim artık.

127. Güzel projeleri var Opera'nın. Mesela son zamanlarda huzurevlerine gitmeye başladılar. İşte iki gönüllü seçip gidip huzurevlerinde yapıyorlar. Ama onu da Moda Huzurevi'nde yapıyorlar. Neden Moda Huzurevi? Modalılar zaten bununla yetişmiş insanlar. Niye biz hâlâ elit çevreye hizmet ediyoruz?

128. Ve tabii ki o, bir şeyleri oluşturma dönemi, çok tabii katı böyle nazi gibi, şey gibi, sert bir eğitim. Beklentiler çok yüksek vesaire ama sonucunda

karşılığı alınan, emeğin karşılığı verilen, hem devlet tarafından hem toplum tarafından sanatçıya büyük bir saygı, bir şey var. Bugüne doğru geldikçe her şeyle beraber toplumun sanatçıya duyduğu saygı da azaldı. Yok olma derecesinde belki yani birkaç insan bence, şöyle etrafa baktığım zaman. Karşılığını zaten alamıyorsun, alamadığın gibi tam tersi senin önüne geçilmeye çalışılıyor. Köstek olmaya çalışılıyor her konuda yani.

129. Tamam, bu bizim müziğimiz değil. Zaten adı da şu, yani klasik müzik de demek yerine şey demek gerekiyor, çok sesli batı müziği, çünkü zaten batıdan çıkıp da gelen bir müzik, bizim yaptığımız. Tamam bize ait bir müzik değil. Evet, İtalya'da bir taksici klasik müzik dinleyebilir. Bizim ülkemizde Azer Bülbül dinleyebilir, ikisi de normal. Ama illa ya bu zaten devşirme müzik deyip dışlıyor olmak aslında işin kolayına kaçmak oluyor. O zaman hiç biz Cumhuriyet'in kuruluşunda böyle bir karar almamalıydık. Hiç bizim kendi müziğimizle Batı'nın yaptığı müziği harmanlamak konusunda bestecileri hiç motive etmemeliydik. E zaten kendi müziğimiz olan Türk müziğini de geliştirmiyoruz. Onu da bırakmış durumdayız 30 senedir. Ne güzel. Yani böyle devam etsin.

130. Yani bu iki taraflı bir şey bence. Türkiye'de müzisyen olmak diye bir şey var, bir de müzisyen olmak diye bir şey var. Yani müzisyen olmak harika bir şey, tabii ki yani. Sonuçta ben muhtemelen konservatuvara girip müzisyen olmasaydım hayata bakışım çok dar olacaktı. Ama yani Türkiye'de müzisyen olmak tabi ki çok korkunç bir şey, yani çok zor bir şey. Çok çok, yani kendimi işçi gibi hissediyorum Türkiye'de bir müzisyen olarak.

131. Bu herkesin gözünde olumlu bir şey fakat insanların desteklediği bir şey değil. Kültürümüzün bir parçası değil yani. Çünkü evde dinlemiyoruz, konsere gitmiyoruz. Bunu desteklemiyoruz genel olarak. Radyoda açmıyoruz. 'İçimiz sıkılıyor, uykumuz geliyor 'böyle tepkiler.

132. Toplumsal olarak yani… Klasik müzik olarak düşünmüyorlardı çoğu insan zaten hani müzisyenim deyince. Çok bir artısını görmüyordum. Evet yani devlet memuru, öğretim görevlisi olduğumda evet o zaman, onun bir artısı vardı sadece. Işte sigortası yatıyor falan kafasında öyle bir sadece takdir görüyorduk. Ama yoksa konservatuar mezunu ya da kafasında şey yok yani' …Aa güzel yani hem eğleniyorsun hem okuyorsun ya da hem çalışıyorsun 'mantığı var, mentalitesi var.

133. Yani "Olsun." falan diyorlar. "Sen ne okuyorsun?" işte "Müzik". "Olsun", falan. Böyle tepkiler yani, çektiğim zorluğu, ben onu söylüyorum hani…

Yani sen 6 yaşında 7 yaşında başlamadıysan işin imkansıza yakın yani. İmkansıza yakın. Ondan dolayı bu işin zorluğunun farkında olanlar sadece bu işi yapanlar ya da aileleri genellikle.

134. Yani 5 yaşında, 6 yaşındaki bir çocuk bir odada saatlerce çalışmak zorunda bu mesleği yapmak istiyorsa. Ve bu disiplin çocukluktan beri aşılandığı için bu disiplinini hayatının her yerine koyuyorsun. Ne iş yaparsan yap.

135. Ya bence sadece konservatuvar değil, insan disiplinli olmalı ya. Ya ben nefret ediyorum disiplinsiz insanlardan çok üzgünüm. Belki çok şey asker gibi gözükebilirim şu an ama. Ben düzgün olmayı çok seviyorum. İşlerde de okul hayatımda da hani her şeyi yetiştirebilmek gerçekten... Disiplinsiz birini görünce tepem atıyor. Yani hiç sevmem. Disiplin bence hayatın olmazsa olmazı.

136. İşte mesela her dönem bize bir program seçiliyor. Biz bunu çalışıyoruz ve sonra bunu sunuyoruz ya. Bunun bana getirdiği bir planlama şeyi var, öğretisi mi denir ona? Planlamayı öğrendim. Yani bir şeyi bitirmeyi, zamanından önce. Bu yüzden şu an iş hayatımda da bu iyi oluyor.

137. Yaptığımız şey o kadar detay işi ki. Bir eseri çalabilmek demek, yüzlerce yıl önce yazılmış bir eseri çalabilmek demek, ona binlerce saat kafa patlatmış olmak demek. Ve bu da beni çok detaycı biri yapmış. Ve bu detaycılık bugün derslerime de yansıyor. Yani öğrenciyi çok iyi görüyorum. Çok iyi duyuyorum. Hani hiçbir şey gözünden kaçmıyor derslerimden sonra. Hep yani ayak parmağına kadar görüyorum insanları ve bu detayları görebilme becerimi uzun yıllar müzik çalışmış olmama, sanatla iç içe büyümüş olmama borçluyum desem yalan olmaz.

138. Olduğum ortama kolay uyum sağlıyorum. Dediğim gibi çünkü hani uyum sağlamak zorundayız zaten o grubun içerisinde kalabilmek için. Grubun içerisinde uyumlu insan olmak benim için önemli.

139. Bunun dışında zorunlu hiyerarşi var. Zorunlu hiyerarşiyi doğru anlayabilmek… Yani bir toplum var, toplumu bir devlet yönetiyor, bir hükümet geçiyor başa. Bunun ne demek olduğunu doğru anlayabilmeyi de sağlıyor aslında bence konservatuvar eğitimi ve çok seslilik. Bir sanat kurumunun veya bir konser salonunun, bir orkestranın bir müzik direktörü vardır. Bunun altında bir şef vardır. Şefin altında konsertmayster, konsertmaysterden, sonra baş kemancıdan sonra yani grup şefleri vardır ve ondan sonra orkestra üyeleri şeklinde sıralanır. Yani böyle bir üçgenimiz var bizim. Bu yararlı bir üçgen. Hiyerarşi toplumlarda olması gereken bir şey olduğu zaten açık. Çünkü yani tamamen herkesin özgür

olup tırnak içinde herkesin her istediğini söyleyebildiği ve uygulamaya geçirebildiği daha önemlisi ortamda zaten kaos olacaktır. Bu kaosu yönetebilmenin de belli bir takım gereklilikleri oluyor. Bu gereklilikleri de bu zorunlu hiyerarşi ile sağlıyoruz.

140. Bir de orkestralar dediğimiz şey biraz grup işi. Yani hani birlikte hareket etme sanatı da var. Yani sizin çok iyiliğinizi belli bir noktada o bireyselliğinize tercih edemiyoruz. Yani hani birlikte hareket edebiliyorsanız biraz daha var olabiliyorsunuz orkestralarda.

141. Aslında klasik müzik farklı fikirler karşısında bir tür bilgelik de getiriyor insana. Yani işte önce dinleyip öyle konuşmak. Yani karşındaki fikir sana ait olmayabilir. Seni ilgilendirmiyor olabilir. Buna rağmen dinlersin ve ondan sonra konuşursun, atlamazsın ortasına gibi. Bir de bu fikre inansan da inanmasan da yani senin inancına sahip olsa da olmasa da saygı duyarsın ve ne yapabileceğine bakarsın. Orta yolu bulmaya çalışırsın. Bizim çok seslilikte yaptığımız şey bu. Hiçbir fikir, öyle bir kalemde silinemiyor. Değerlendirilmesi gerekiyor.

142. Ama bence klasik batı müziğinin Türkiye'ye bayağı bir önerisi var. Sen bugüne kadar tamamen halk müziği dinlemiş olabilirsin, ben severim bu arada, yani başka müzikler dinlemiş olabilirsin ama gerçekten, içinde bulundurduğu farklı farklı şeylerin birlik olmaya çalışması, birlikte çalmaya çalışması, o farklı şeyden bir armoninin çıkması, bayağı ilginç şeyler yaratması bence, Türkiye'yi bayağı tanımlıyor. Tanımlamıyor mu? Çok farklı değil miyiz bazen? Ama birlikte de güzel olamaz mıyız?

143. Hani elimizde aslında bütün duygu durumlarınızı yansıtabileceğiniz müthiş bir şey var. Yani enstrüman çalmayan insanlar ne bileyim resim yapmaya çalışır, yürüyüş yapar, spor yapar… Biz de yapıyoruz elbette ama, aslında çok çok önemli bir şeyimiz var elimizde, terapi gibi.

144. Ruhsal olarak kolay insanlar değiliz. Mutsuzuz. Ben şey, çok açık söyleyeyim, çok büyük bir bölümümüz de yani çok büyük dramalar yaşıyoruz.

145. Ya ben kendimi nasıl hissediyorsam müziğim de öyle bir şey. Tabii ki biz aynı zamanda tiyatrocuyuz. Annesini kaybedip akşam konsere çıkan solistler var. Ya bu da çok kutsal bir şey ama bu benim yapabileceğim bir şey değil tabi ki bu arada. Yine de, o kadar olmasa da bir noktada kontrol edebilmeliyiz müzisyenler olarak duygularımızı. Çünkü biz besteciye hizmet ediyoruz ve bestecinin duygularını çalmalıyız zaten. Çok büyük bir empati duygusuna da sahip olmalıyız bu yüzden.

146. Türkiye'ye geldiğimden beri çok fazla empati kurmaya başladım insanlarla. Hani bu mesleğimle mi alakalı? Ama biraz aşırı derecede fazla empati kuruyorum. Öyle olunca da yani duyguları yoğun yaşamış oluyorum. Otomatik olarak yani zorlanıyorum o konuda. Belki de karakterimle mi alakalı, benliğini bulmakla mı alakalı? Çünkü böyle bir şeyim yoktu çok fazla yani. Doğal çerçeveler içerisinde diyeyim, empati kurma yeteneğim vardı. Bu kadar fazla değildi yani.

147. En güzel ses sistemiyle, en iyi kulaklıkla elde edemeyeceğiniz bir müziğin ortasında oluyorsun ve sen de katılıyorsun ona. Yani bir şarkıya ritim tutmak bile insana çok keyif veriyor ya da sesle eşlik etmek de çok keyif veriyor. Bir enstrümanla o müziğin içinde olmak çok çok güzel bir şey. Ve ben onu yaparken kendimi çok iyi hissediyordum. Ya da çok çalışıp sonucunda bir eser çıkarttığım zaman ortaya işte "Çalıştığıma değdi." diyordum. Oralarda çok haz alıyorsun tabii ki. Tabi dopaminler, bir şeyler. Hani kimyasallar beyninde, güzel hissediyorsun gerçekten.

148. Bilmiyorum, çok güzel bence hani. Karşı tarafa hitap edebilmek, yani senin hissettiğin şeyleri çalaken karşı tarafa da yansıtabilmek ve onun karşılığında gelen büyük bir alkış gerçekten çok garip bir şey. Mesela dün işte bir konserimiz vardı ve İstanbul'da şu an çok kar yağdığı için bütün konserler iptal oluyor son birkaç gündür, bizimkisi iptal olmamıştı. Ve kar yağmasına rağmen çok fazla insan gelmişti. Yani çok soğuktu hava. Dolmuş yani, salonun %75'i doluydu. Yani çok güzel bir konserdi. Sonda o kadar çok alkışlandık ki.

149. Her şeye rağmen ben mesleğimi icra etmek için o koltuğa oturduğumda, o sandalyeye oturduğumda ben her şeyi unuturum ve ne kadar kutsal bir iş yaptığımı hatırlarım yani ilk notayı çalmaya başladığım andan itibaren. Hatta kemanımı omzuma koyarken başlar o yani. Bu böyle bir şey. Ama bittikten sonra kapatırsın kutunu, bir metrobüse doğru yollanırsın ve o zaman tekrar gerçeklerle yüzleşiyorsun. Sürekli gerçeklerle yüzleşiyorsun ve Türkiye'de müzisyen olmak nasıl bir şey diye sordun ve bu işte, sürekli, hayatının her gününde, her saatinde kültür çatışması yaşıyorsun. Sürekli bunu yaşıyorsun. Sürekli bir çatışma var. Kafanda olmak istediğin, yaşamak istediğin bir hayat, ve kendini ait hissettiğin bir kişilik, karakter ve bunu olmana izin vermeyen bir çevre yani. Böyle bir yaşam şekli.

150. Hem aileme yönelik bir içten içe dedim ki "Bakın size devlet işi." "Boşuna mı okumuşum ben müzisyenliği." Hani mühendis, doktor diyorsunuz… Bak bu işte yani. Hem de kendi küçüklüğüme karşı işte, 10 yaşındaki kızı gözümün önüne getirip "Tamam ya başardım. Valla bir

şekilde oldu.” Bazı insanlar için evet çok sıradan bir şey. “Ne var ki alt tarafı bir işe girdin.” Üstelik de çok böyle milyonlar milyarlar kazandığımız bir iş de değil. Her şeye yetecek bir şey değil, para biriktirsem ev de alamam araba da. Fakat kendime olan borcu ödedim gibi düşündüm. Yani o duygusal şeyi ödedim. Ve böyle tamamsın dedim artık.

151. Ben şanslı bir müzisyen olduğumu düşünüyorum. Neden? Biraz daha kendim, hayatta, yani şey mesleki anlamda çok ilişkiler üzerinde kurulan şeylere sahip olmayı tercih etmedim ve açıkçası yani karşılığım neyse o kadarı benim için yeterliydi. Yani ben şeyi sevmiyorum, yani daha fazlasını... Her sektörde olduğu gibi, birçok sektörde öyle şeyler de olabilir, vardır yani bu. Ama hani kendimi bu şekilde düşünen ve karşılık bulabilmiş bir müzisyen gibi gördüğüm için de şanslı hissediyorum. Yoğunluğumu o yüzden iyi yaşıyorum, yani memnunum çok çalışmaktan.

152. Sadece şöyle bir şey oluyor sanırsam, bilmedikleri için aileler çok fazla karışmak istemiyorlar ve “Top sizde hocam.” gibi bir şey oluyor. O noktada da herhalde iletişim kesiliyor mu diyeyim…

153. Annem mesela o ilk konservatuvara hazırlayan hocanın söylediği lafı “Vasat bir şekilde mezun olmak istiyorsan, kendi yeteneğinle yaptığın kadar yap mezun ol. Ama iyi bir şekilde mezun olmak istiyorsan çalışacaksın.”, annem bu lafı yıllarca kafama kaktı, yıllarca.

154. Yani annem olmasa… Tabii ki hiçbir çocuğun ben sabah altıda kalkıp bir şey çalışacağını düşünmüyorum. Yani hani böyle, aşkla falan bağlı değilse ve ulaşması zor bir şey değilse kalkıp kimse çalışmak istemiyor tabii ki. Biraz iteklemek gerekiyor. Beni sürekli dürtüp çalıştırıp, ilgisi oldu. Hatta mesela bir arkadaşım daha var öyle, onun mesela babası neredeyse keman çalmayı öğrenmiş, ona öğreteceğim diye. Yani o yüzden ebeveynlerin rolü büyük oluyor bence küçük yaşta başlayanlar için, ki zaten küçük yaşta başlamak da gerekiyor müzik eğitimine.

155. Kendi hocam var tabii ki en başta. Hatta yani öyle bir şeyim var ki. Şimdi doktora tezimi de onun üstüne yazmaya çalışıyorum. Pedagojik olarak neler yapıyor öğrencilere, işte nasıl başlatıyor, nasıl devam ettiriyor ya da büyük yaşta aldığı birini nasıl değiştiriyor falan gibi. Onun yani… O öyle sihirli değnekle sanki bir şeyler yapıyor gibi bir şekilde öğretiyor herkese. Ve çok kolaymış gibi öğretiyor yani.

156. Benim şu an olduğum yere gelmemi kolaylaştıran ailem. Bu liseden sonra toparlanmamı sağlayan da çünkü ailem. Daha sonra, bu süreçte çünkü işte iş bulamadım mezun olduktan sonra, o sürede de yardımcı olan yine ailem. Bu on sene kadar ders almış olmam, ya da üç tane keman almış olmamız…

157. Bir hocamın çok desteği olduğunu düşünüyorum şu anki hayatıma gelmede. Bu lise sonda çalıştığım ve masterımı yaptığım hoca. Beni çok geliştirdi. Kemancılık açısından da insan olarak da. Hem o süreçte çok fazla şey öğrendim kemanla ilgili hâlâ bunları kullanıyorum, hem de ilk işimi o bana verdi. Bana çok destek oldu. Kemancılığım konusunda en çok bana destek olan insan o.

158. Valla öyle bir şey (özel ders almak) yapmış, yapabilmiş olmayı çok isterdim. Çünkü bu kadar boş konuşan ve böyle şeyler söyleyen bir insandan öğrenme şeyim o kadar zayıftı ki ama bir yandan da öyle bir maddi güç yoktu. Yani ben özel ders almak istiyorum deyip ailemi ikna hiçbir şekilde edemezdim. O yüzden denemedim bile.

159. Konservatuvarda çok mutlu değildim açıkçası. Psikolojik olarak çok mutlu değildim. Ama o lise hocam da beni motive etti yine. Hani gel birlikte yaparız, konservatuvarı hallet burada gibisinden. O vesileyle tekrar geri döndüm. Yani öyle de önemli bir insandı benim için. O olmasaydı hani belki de lisansı hiç okumazdım bile İstanbul'da. Bitirmezdim bile belki bu bölümü.

160. Bu arada bence bir müzisyen için alınan en güzel övgü meslektaşındandır. Seyirciden değil, hocandan da değil. Çünkü biz birbirimizi anlarız. Bunun zor bir iş olduğunu hepimiz biliyoruz. Bu yolda ne kadar kafayı yediğimizi hepimiz biliyoruz. O yüzden o emeğin karşılığını meslektaşına veriyorsan bu çok değerli bir şey. Aldığım büyük övgülerden biri oydu. Yani çok sevdiğim, çok yakın arkadaşım, çok iyi kemancı bir arkadaşım dedi ki hayatım boyunca şu yaptığını yapamayacağım. Ya dedi ki, bu kadar, bunu yaparken bu kadar sivrilmemen çok acayip bir şey dedi. Yani ya çok saygı duyuyorum dedi ve ben böyle, o gün rahat uyudum.

161. Okuldaki arkadaşlarım yani aslında toplumun ortalama kesimiydi. Yani hani ben mesela varlıklı olmayan bir aileden geliyorum. Daha böyle zorluklarla, maddi zorluklarla büyüyüp geldim. Benden daha iyi durumda olan insanlardı hepsi de, ya da yüzde doksanı diyeyim. Tabii ki senin gibi olan insanı fark ediyorsun mesela ve onunla bir empati kurarak onunla da arkadaşlık kuruyorsun. Yani insan böyle bir şey, kendi gibi olanı bulup yakınlaşıyor.

162. Zaten çok büyük ihtimalle teksin ya da çok azsın. Dediğin gibi o zaman da zaten hani orkestralar evet var. Evet çok fazla kadrolaşma imkanı yok. Ama hali hazırda o zamandan yine sınav açıyorlardı. Hani bana bayağı şöyle seçenek sundular, hani "Senfoniye mi girmek istersin, okulda kalıp akademik kariyer mi yapmak istersin?" Hani ben mecburiyetten seçmedim.

163. Mesela not değiştirilme olayları oldu. Ne zaman, 3 sene önce falan. Birinin, birkaç kişinin hatta, notları değiştirilip kazandığı sınavı kazanamadı olup, başkalarını alıp falan… Sonra dava açıp kazandılar mesela.

164. Hani sınavlarda usulsüzlük yapılıyor mu, yapılmıyor mu, bunlar her zaman tartışma konusu olmuştur tabii ama... Sanırım yeteri kadar iyiysen bir noktada utanırlar zaten. "O kadar da değil" derler herhalde ama, o kadar da iyi olmak gerekir mi yani tabii…

165. O sınava giriş süreci de sancılı. Çünkü şunları da düşünüyorsunuz, Türkiye'deyiz. Yani bunu söylemekte bir sakınca yok. Herkes biliyor. Şimdi torpili var, GBT'si (background security check) var. GBT denen bir şey var ve o kadar illet bir şey ki. Hani en ufak bir şeye katıldınız, bir şey var ailenizde. İşte birine bilmem neci diye iftira attılar, atıyorum. O size, GBT'nize yazılıyor. Ben de biraz, kültürel olarak da… İşte Türkiye'de doğulu olmak, Alevi olmak vesaire bunlar etkilediği için korktum. Sekiz ay falan sürdü o sınavın açıklanması.

166. İstanbul Devlet Opera Balesi'ne girme sebebim de o, girmiyordum. Beni bir arkadaşım ikna etti. Girmeyecektim yani. Sağ olsun iyi ki ikna etti, girdim. Girdim, niye girdim, çünkü hatırladım ki Devlet Opera ve Balesi iktidara, hükümete değil, devletin kendisine ait bir orkestra, bir kurum. Dolayısıyla onu yaban ellere de bırakmamak gerekiyor. Yani birilerinin sahip çıkması gerekiyor. Ben madem ki burada kalmaya karar verdim, o zaman… Hükümetlerden çok daha geçmişe dayanan ve çok daha fazla geleceğe gidecek olan kurumlara sahip çıkmak da bizim görevimiz.

167. Mesela geçen gün konuşuluyordu. Eskiden devlet memurları yani İDSO'da çalan biri mesela, bir yıl içinde ev alabiliyormuş falan. Milletvekiliyle aynı maaşı alıyorlarmış eskiden. İlk kurulduğu zamanlar sanırım Devlet Senfoni'nin. Şu anda tabii öyle bir şey mümkün değil. Yani öyle bir değer de veriliyormuş herhalde o zamanlar. Milletvekili kadar.

168. Ben geçen sene tiyatroda çaldım, CRR Senfoni, Gedik Filarmoni, Opera Bale, bir şeyde daha çaldım. Beş, sürekli, ve onun dışında da işte öyle pop toplanması, yok İstanbul Sinfonietta, yok o, yok bu, hani böyle değişik değişik isimlerle diyorum ya işte konser salonlarından, bize konser lazım, ayarlar mısın… Onlar filan, hepsini topluyorsun, bir 80ler 90lar zamanında Devlet Opera Balesi sanatçısının aldığı maaşı, aldığı alım gücünü sağlayamıyorsun. Yani o zamanlar aldıkları maaşlarla her yıl ev alabilecek, araba alabilecek paralar kazanmışlar. Bodrumlardan Çeşmelerden yazlıklar almışlar bu insanlar. Neden? Çünkü sanatçıya değer var. Öğretmen, sanatçı, doktor, pilot bunlar yani profesör, bilim insanı falan bunlar para kazanıyor yani.

169. Sigorta yok zaten. Hiçbir yerde sigorta yok. Bu takviye işlerin hiçbirinde sigorta yok ve bunların hepsi biliniyor. Ama bu konuda da hiçbir şey yapılmıyor. Sadece Bursa Senfoni'ye takviye gittiğimde bana günlük sigorta yapmışlardı. Normalde yapabilirler, hepsi yapabilir. Ama dedikleri şey "Biz bunu vermek yerine sizin size daha fazla para verelim." gibi bir sonuca kırdırıp öyle bir yol çiziyorlar.

170. Mesela hocalık diyelim, herhangi bir yerde hocalık yapıyorsun Covid oldu. Sen maaşını almaya devam ediyorsun. Ama Covid olduğunda biz hiçbir şey kazanamadık. Çünkü zaten hiçbir yerde imza atmamıştık. Ve hiç kimsenin bize hiçbir borcu yok gibi bir durum oldu.

171. Zaten Türkiye'de sanat zengin işi. Yani bunu yapabilmen için, zaten bizim konservatuarda benim bunu rahat bir psikolojiyle yapabilmem için benim para kaygımın olmaması lazım. Ve saatlerce bir odada en güzel enstrümanla, hiçbir şey, akşam ne yiyeceğim, çamaşırlarım yıkandı mı, yapmam gereken işler var mı diye düşünmeden yapabilmem lazım. Öyle bir iş zaten bu. Yoksa diğer türlü, ben hani derse gitmem lazım. Kiram için şunu da yapmam lazım, bunu da yapmam lazım diye düşünürsen zaten kendi işinle ilgili vakit bulamıyorsun.

172. Yani geçim sıkıntısı çeken bir adam Beethoven'ın anlamaya çalışamaz. Beethoven'la Brahms arasındaki stil farkını falan anlamaya çalışamaz yani. Anlatamazsın bunu gidip de orada Picasso'nun tablosuyla Rembrandt'ın tablosunu karşılaştıramaz, bekleyemezsin o insandan bunu. Sen öncelikle o insana o özgürlüğü, o ekonomik gücü, o mutluluk seviyesini vereceksin. O refah seviyesini sunacaksın, sunmak zorundasın zaten aslında.

173. Bir de zaten klasik müzik konserlerindeki giyim tarzı, insanların duruş şekli, birbirine bakış şekli, toplumdaki sınıflanma, bunu da çözmeye çalışmadığın için sen politika olarak, o insan o salona gittiği zaman kendini çok kötü hissediyor. Yani kendini dışlanmış hissediyor, ait hissetmiyor, kendi kıyafetine bakıyor, karşısındakine bakıyor, utanıyor, işte bir bölüm arasında yanlışlıkla alkışladığı zaman dönüyor oradan bakıyor…

174. Yani hiçbir destek olduğunu düşünmüyorum devletten. Bilmiyorum yani. Covid döneminde bile olmadı destek sonuçta. Ya da mesela Avrupa'da enstrümanlar gönderdiler öğrencilerin evlerine vesaire Covid döneminde, yani bir sürü şey yaşandı. Bunların hepsi devlet desteği… Ya da yarışmalar. Bunlar da yok. Devletin açtığı, devletin desteklediği herhangi bir şeyle ben karşılaşmadım. Yani bana kişisel olarak hiçbir desteği olmadı devletin. Eğitime para vermedim okulda. Ama 10 sene özel ders almam gerektiğini eklemek isterim.

175. Şimdi belki duymuşsundur. “Türkiye Bursları”, “YTB” diye bir şey var. Büyük bir burs programı var Türkiye'nin yabancı öğrenciler için sağladığı. Şimdi devlet okulu diyeceksin hani çok para ödemedin belki ama yabancılar devlet okulunda okudukları zaman bayağı yüklü bir miktarda harç ödüyorlar, yani Türk öğrencilere göre. Yani bunu karşıladı işte beş buçuk yıl. Bir de yurtta kaldım. Bir de cebime her ay para, yani geçinmem için harçlık parası veriyordu. Yani en büyük destekçim buydu lisansta. Yani bu olmasaydı büyük ihtimalle okuyamayacaktım zaten Istanbul’da. Çünkü ailemin tek çocuğu değilim. Ailemin durumu da çok parlak değil maddi durumu. O yüzden yani bu bayağı bir yardımcı oldu.

Şey olmasaydı herhalde okuyamayacaktım büyük ihtimalle kazanmama rağmen.

176. Mesela yıllarca AKM kapalı kaldı. Ve yapılan salonun klasik müzikle hiçbir alakası yoktu. Akustik olarak. Ve onu mikrofonlarla sağlamışlar. Yani böyle, aslında saçma sapan bir yer açmışlar. Yani içinde çalışanlar da mutsuz. Eski AKM'yi çok çocukluğumdan hatırlamıyorum ama annem falan da anlatıyor böyle işte, dönen sahne, sahneye çıkan asansör, dekorlar öyle değişiyor. İnen mikrofonla akustik sağlanan, işte doğal hiçbir şeyle ses duyuramadığımız bir şeye dönüşmüş mesela.

177. Bence İstanbul Üniversitesi Devlet Konservatuarı'na (talep) yüzde yüz azalıyor. Oraya taşındıktan sonra kayıt olan, başvuran öğrencilerin sayısından da anlayabilirsin zaten. Insanlar tabii ki de daha merkezi, daha rahat ulaşabilecekleri… Zaten trafik sorunu diye bir şey de var ondan dolayı dediğim gibi daha merkezi yerlerdeki kurumları tercih edebilirler.

178. Aslında talep de düşük muhtemelen ki normalde hiç almaya tenezzül etmeyecekleri insanları kabul ediyorlar artık konservatuvara yetenek sınavıyla. Yani geçirilmeyecek olan bir insanları da alabiliyorlar. Herhalde talep düştü.

179. Ben AKP ile ilgili kötüleşen bir şey görmedim açıkçası. Ben hep iyileşme gördüm. Yani atıyorum, Merinos Kültür Merkezi açıldı Bursa'da. Çok kötüydü Fethiye Kültür Merkezi, Merinos Kültür Merkezi açıldı ve çok daha iyi bir salon oldu işte. Burada CSO binası yenilendi harika bir bina yaptılar falan gibi. Ben onların yani bir yandan bunu da reklam aracı olarak kullandıkları için hani hükümet, burada bir gerilemeye sebep olduklarını düşünmüyorum. Ha ama şöyle şeyler var. CSO diye girdiğin zaman orada işte ne bileyim Emel Sayın konseri görüyorsun. Hani batı müziği, sadece klasik müzik gibi şeyler değil de daha alaturka şeyleri de işin içine kattılar. Ama bir yandan da adam şunu yapmaya çalışıyor. Şimdi Emel Sayın dinleyen adamı oraya getirip "A burada bir de senfoni konseri de varmış." desin. Hani adam o binaya girsin çıksın bir yandan diğeriyle de temas etsin gibi de bir fikir var. Dolayısıyla biz böyle bir gerileme görmedik. Biz bu anlamda hep iyileşme gördük diyebilirim.

180. Yani sonuçta benim bir sürü arkadaşım devlet orkestralarında kadrolara girdi. İşte müdürlüklerde, hep iyi hocalar olduğunu bildiğim insanlar müdürlüklere geldi. Bu kadrolar sık sık değişiyor. Eskisi gibi oturup 20 sene orada kalmıyor hani gibi. Böyle bir sirkülasyon var. Ben o anlamda devletin desteklediğini düşünüyorum. Yani dediğim gibi bir alaturkalaştırma durumu var. Hani o da kendi seçmenini o tarafa çekmeye çalışıyor diye düşünüyorum çünkü.

181. Eğitimde kesinlikle yabancı dil eksikliği çok çok büyük. Bizim zaten konservatuvardaki çoğu arkadaşın dünyaya açılmama nedeni, belki çok iyi bir enstrümanist olsa bile.

182. O yüzden tabii ki bence yaşlara göre ayrılmalı. Mesela Bilkent'te öyle. Diyelim ki küçük yaştaki çocuğa farklı hoca ders veriyor. Büyüdükçe hocalar değişiyor. Yani bir insan hem çok ileri seviye bir seviye öğretip hem de çok temel seviye bir şey öğretmek zorunda değil yani.

183. Lise hocamın farklı olmasını bir şans bir ekstra olarak değerlendiririm. Ya da belki biz buna Türkiye'de şans diyoruz ama bunun bir pedagojik eğitimi alınsaydı belki bambaşka olabilirdi. Sonuçta ben de aslında bazı öğrencilerimle kendimi onlar gibi davranırken bulduğumu fark ediyordum. Üzülüyorum. Tabii ki de öyle olsun istemiyorum ama belli bir süre buna maruz kalınca insan ona da bir zaman benzemeye başlıyor.

184. Onca program çaldık, hani kayıt yapmayı bilmiyoruz. Bu öğretilmedi. Üniversitede öyle bir imkanımız da olmadı. Şu an mesela öyle bir şeyleri yapsaydık en azından sosyal medyayla bununla kendi "marketing"imizi yapabilirdik diye düşünüyorum.

185. Eğitmenlerin daha mutlu oldukları ortamlar yaratabilirler ki onlar da öğrencilerine daha pozitif bir yaklaşımda bulunabilsinler. Bilmiyorum belki ondan dolayı mı mutsuzlar? Eğitim verdikleri binalar bile çok derme çatma.

186. İyi müzisyen dediğiniz hem orkestra deneyimine sahip olacak, hem enstrümanında iyi olacak, hem de birlikte hareket edebilecek, hem de disiplinli olacak. Aslında bu genç bir müzisyeni tanımlamıyor. Tanımlamıyor, gerçeği söylemek gerekirse, biz ne yapıyoruz? Böyle bir orkestra kuruyoruz ve açıkça kendi adıma şunu yapıyorum, var, genç arkadaşlar var, yeni mezunlar, iş arıyorlar. Bazıları şimdi yeni iş buluyorlar. Belli bir kontenjanım olduğu anda onları o işe davet ediyorum. Çünkü neden, onların da deneyim kazanması gerekiyor. Doğru yerde deneyim kazanmaları gerekiyor. Ben kendi haddim oldukça o doğru yeri sağlamak zorunda olduğumu düşünüyorum, hem o arkadaşlar deneyim kazansın, hem açıkçası para kazansınlar. Hayatta kalabilsinler, hem de doğru yerde iş yapmayı görsünler diye kendi açımdan onları biraz kollamaya çalışıyorum hatta.

187. Devlet orkestralarının kendilerine genç solistler seçmeleri için yarışmalar oluyor. Hani, bunlar çok güzel fırsatlar; audition'lar yapılıyor bu anlamda. Ama tabii, dünya çapındaki yarışmalar çoğunlukla bir takım foundation'lar tarafından destekleniyor zaten. Biliyorsunuz yani, Avrupa'da olsun, Amerika'da olsun... Hani bu iş, devlet bir yere kadar — bir tabii ki desteği var — ama özünde de başka başka kuruluşlar var. Hepsi kendi içinde döngüsünü sürdürebilecek yetkinliğe sahip. Hem maddi olarak hem sistematik olarak. O yüzden, hani, onlar oralarda... Farklı özel destekler de sağlanıyor. İşte, mesela özel ödüller olur. Yarışmalara baktığımızda görürüz, bir takım isimlerin ödülleri, bir sürü başka vakıfların ödülleri... 'Bilmem ne özel ödülü', 'bilmem ne özel ödülü' şeklinde. Şimdi şöyle bir şey de oluyor. Bir furya var. Öğrenciler

katılıyorlar, sürekli katılıyorlar yarışmalara. Bu yarışmaların—dediğim o negatif yöndeki furyaya dahil olanlarında—tabii şöyle bir şey var. Sürekliliği sağlayabilmek için, her katılana neredeyse 70 tane birincilik, 20 tane ikincilik, her katılana başarı sertifikası, bilmem ne falan gibi... Biraz abarttım tabii ama yani, hani bu gerçekleştiği zaman eli boş dönmeyince çocuk zannediyor ki, "Ben birinci oldum, ben bilmem ne oldum." Tamam, çok güzel bir motivasyon ama işte... Yine bir ambalaj. Yani burada, içerikte gerçekten elde edilmiş bir başarı yok.

188. Evet Süreyya'nın bir kitlesi var. Kadıköy'ün belli bir hani CHP'li bir kitlesi var. Bir de son zamanlarda şöyle bir şey oldu. Süreyya Operası Instagram'da popüler oldu bir anda. Hatta görmüşsündür belki AKM'deki bale ve opera gösterileri de popüler olmaya başladı. İşte "Sevgilinizle operaya date'e gidin." falan. Hani böyle şeyler işte. Kadıköy'de yapılacak aktiviteler işte "Süreyya Operası'nda bir konser izleyebilirsiniz" falan işte çekiyorlar böyle. Dün bence dolmasının bir sebebi de oydu yani.

189. Ya kış sezonunda Fındıkkıran oynanıyor, bilet bulamadım ya. Şu anda da mesela La Traviata oluyor, bilet olmuyor. Ya eminim çoğunun ikinci perdeye kalmadığına ama yani biletler tükendi. Fındıkkıran'a gidemedim mesela, 2 yıldır gidemiyorum.

190. İstanbul'da herhangi bir semtte yaşayıp bir ailenin gelip bilet parasını verip 3 saat opera dinlemesine olağanüstü saygı duyuyorum. Olağanüstü saygı duyuyorum. Bu inanılmaz bir şey. Bence çok değerli bir şey. O insanlar çok önemli insanlar. Çocuklarını getiriyorlar, çok saygı duyuyorum. Ve o insanlar sayesinde bugün var olduğumuzu düşünüyorum. Avrupa'da bu işin biraz daha kültürel bir hâle, yüzyıllardır yapıldığı için, olduğunu biliyorum. Onların, onlardan çıkan bir kültür olduğu için, onların da oradan sahip çıktığını görüyorum. Geçen işte mart ayında Concert House'da bir konsere gittim. Orada da yaş ortalaması yüksekti. Ama her konser dolu. Dolu dolu dolu. Hepsi dolu. Yani satın alınan bir şey hâlâ. Türkiye'de de satın alınan bir şey olduğunu görüyorum. Hatta bazen bir şeyden uzaklaşınca bazı insanlar o diğer tarafta kalana da sahip çıkarlar. Klasik batı müziğinin biraz o hale geldiğini düşünüyorum.

191. Mesela bana çalış dendiğinde ben hiçbir zaman çalışamadım çünkü ben baskıyla hiçbir zaman keman çalışamam. O yüzden de öğrencilerime hiçbir zaman çalışın demem. Çalışmak zorundasınız hiç demem. Çünkü, hep hatta şunu söylerim yani, çalışmak bir gerekliliktir sadece. Zorunda değilsin ama çalışman gerekir iyi olmak için. Sen hayatında bir şeyleri yapmak için gereklilikleri yerine getiren bir insansan bunu da yerine getir, bu kadar. Ama çalışmak zorunda değilsin. Ama bu gerekliliği yerine getirmediğinde sonuçları da bu, bu bu. Anlatıyorum.

192. Performansın bir şey gibi, hafta sonu rutini gibi, güzel bir şeyle bağdaştırılması gerektiğini düşünüyorum. "Hafta sonu pizza partisi yapıyoruz ve şunları şunları çalıyoruz." O zaman güzel bir meslek haline dönüşebilir enstrümancılık diye düşünüyorum.

193. Herkes çocuğunu Mozart gibi görüyor. Benim çocuğum çok iyidir, benim çocuğum böyle. Onlar genellikle olumsuz eleştiride bulunan ya da olumsuz bir şey söyleyen hocayı tercih etmiyorlar. Duymak istemiyorlar.

194. Şimdi onların (Erken Cumhuriyet) döneminde nüfus daha az, ama bir kalkınma şeyi arzusu söz konusu ve bunun sanatla yapılabileceğine inanılıyor çok şükür o dönem. Ve çok büyük bir beklentiyle, çok disiplinli, çok sert, çoğu zaman yıkıcı olan bir eğitim sistemi var ve günümüze geldikçe bu biraz esniyor tabii ki. Bunun avantajları ve dezavantajları var. Şimdi artık mesela günümüzde hoca öğrencisini uyardığı zaman öğrenci demoralize olup "ama siz beni uyardığınız, siz bana kızdığınız için ben çalamıyorum şu an" diyebiliyor öğrenci. Bu yozlaşmışlık tabi yani bu şeyin rayından çıkmış olması artık, işlerin, böyle bir şey olamaz. Sonuç olarak bir hoca orada bir otoritedir, bilen kişidir yani ve usta çırak ilişkisidir zaten müzisyenlik.

195. Ben özel derslerde bunu deneyimledim. Mesela iki ders yapıp, "Öğretmenim Beethoven'ın işte bilmem ne melodisinin neden çaldırmıyorsunuz?" Niye çaldırayım yani? Daha yeni tuşlara basıyoruz. Ama işte herkesin çocuğu üstün yetenekli olduğu için böyle bir şey oluyor.

196. Öğrencilerin de bir şeyi yok, nasıl diyeyim yani, bir sınırı yok hocaya karşı. Herhangi biriymiş gibi davranabiliyor. Ama iki taraflı da bence. Ama otoritenin de böyle "höt zöt" ile sağlandığına hiç inanmıyorum. Yani sevmiyorum da o tarz otoriteyi. Gerçekten bilgili bir insan varsa karşında bir şekilde zaten saygı duyarak davranır buluyor insan kendini, yani o yüzden iki taraflı gibi geliyor.

197. Ben mezun olduğumda 21 yaşında, benim jenerasyonumda çok iyi müzisyenler çıktı. Ve bu çok iyi müzisyenlerin birçoğu iş sahibi oldu, iş sahibi olanlar işte orkestralara girdiler ya da işte yurtdışına taşınanlar oldu. Bu seçenekleri oluşturamayanların, çok üzülerek söylüyorum, büyük bir bölümü okullarda hoca olmaya başladı. Bu biraz romantik bir karardı konservatuvarlar tarafından. Yani bence bir diğer meslek gruplarında da vardır bu arada yani, "Seni biz yetiştirdik". "Biz seni tanıyoruz, biz sana güveniyoruz, e sen burada insan yetiştir" dendi. Ama açıkçası belli oranda, ve ciddi büyük bir oranda, eğitim kalitesine hizmet edemeyecek arkadaşların okulda hoca olduğunu düşündüm. E bu aslında o zaman ciddi bir tsunami yaratmaya başlıyor. Yani ne oluyor? Eğitim… Aslında yani kendi eğitim hayatında çok eğitime dikkat etmemiş arkadaşlar gidip eğitimci olunca bir kalite problemi başlıyor. Bunu üzülerek söylüyorum.

198. Türkiye'de bu iş olağanüstü ciddiye alınmış başladığında, Cumhuriyetle birlikte. Atatürk bu işin şeyi, ana mimarı. Ben bugün onun sayesinde bu işi yapıyorum ve onun sayesinde hayatımı bu mesleği yaparak geçindirebiliyorum. Haksızlık edemem. Ama yani adam şöyle yapmış bu işi kurmak istediğinde. Konservatuarları açmak istiyor ve bunun için gittiği ilk isim Furtwängler. Furtwängler Berlin Filarmoni'nin o zamanki müzik direktörü. Avrupa'daki en yetkin insanlardan birine gidiyor. Normal birine gitmiyor. Tanıdığına gitmiyor. Benim arkadaşımın kızı var, keman çalıyor demiyor. En iyisine gidiyor. Ve Furtwängler'e diyor ki, "Ben burada konservatuvarlar kuracağım, böyle şeyler yapacağım, bize yardımcı olur musun", gibi. Furtwängler de diyor ki "Çok sağ olun, ama aradığınız kişi ben değilim" diyor. "O, Hindemith" diyor. Harika. Hindemith hem bir müzikolog, hem bir besteci. Olağanüstü donanımlı bir insan. Hindemith buraya geliyor. Zamanın en önemli müzikologlarından, Bela Bartok buraya geliyor. Ve diyorlar ki "Buradaki kültürel müzik ne? Buradaki folklorik müzik ne? Bunu bu sisteme ne kadar adapte ederiz, ne kadar adapte etmeliyiz?" Bu sorular tartışılıyor. Bu temeller bu şekilde atılıyor.

199. Yani yeni mezun olan çocuklara, 23, 24 yaşında, "Vay be çocuk ne çalıyor" dememiz gerekiyor bizim aslında. "Vay be ne çocuklar var, vay be" falan deyip bizi işimizden etmeleri gerekiyor aslında. Çok böyle tipler görmüyorum ve buna üzülüyorum, onu da söyleyeyim yani. Çünkü o zaman da bu iş olmaz burada zaten. Yani biter.

200. Ben girdiğimde hissettiğim gerçekten cumhuriyetin kurulduğu dönemlerdeki gibi bir şeydi. Yani etrafımda sanatın kokusunu alıyordum okulda, okula girdiğim zaman. Yani hani öyle bir şey, kulağımda bir sesi vardı o, hani karıncalar hep bir arada çalışır ya mesela. Öyle bir duyguya sahip oluyordum kapıdan içeri girdiğimde. Her gün yani. Hocaların duruşları, hiç hayatımda görmediğim insanlar bunlar. Yani işte kendini bir konuda geliştirmeyi başarmış insanlar görüyordum etrafımda, her şeyden önce yani. Ağabeylerim ablalarım, hocalar, hepsi... Girip çıkanlar, kılık kıyafetleri… Yani ona bile gösterdikleri özen insanların… Her yerde sanat var. Orada bir tablo var, öbür tarafta bir bestecinin fotoğrafı var falan bunlar büyük ilham kaynakları yani aslında. Değeri bilindiği zaman, sanatçıya değer verildiği zaman için. Bunların hepsi, o tablodaki, fotoğraftaki besteci, koridorda gezen hoca, bunların hepsi sanatçı ve sen sanatçıya saygı duyan bir insan olduğun zaman evet o sanatın kokusunu alıyorsun. Ama aynı fotoğraflar, aynı hocalar bugün sen onlara yeteri kadar hak ettikleri değeri göstermediğin için, o değeri göstermen gerektiğini algılayamadığın için daha doğrusu, o kokuyu alman imkansız zaten.

201. Bu iş zor bir iş. Yani bu iş, çok sinir bozucu zor. Şimdi biz de öğrencilerle çalışıyoruz. Belli noktada bizi sevmiyorlar. Çünkü neden, biz bir şeyi çok tekrar etmelerini söylüyoruz. Yani bazen benim hocam söylerdi, aptal gibi çalışmak lazım bazen. Yani hani çok düşünmeden, sadece bir kas hareketini o kadar saat tekrarlamam gerekiyor ki. Şimdiki gençler sosyal

medyayla büyüyorlar. Onların ilgilerini çeken en iyi video bir dakika sürüyor bazen. Bu onların bence algılarında bir zayıflamaya yol açtı. Benim kendi fikrim bu ama yani aslında dünyadaki hiçbir şey, değerli hiçbir şey bir dakikada öğrenilmiyor. Bazen 10 saniyede de öğrenirsin bir şeyleri ama yeti olarak öğrenmek istediğin hiçbir şeye bir dakika daha sahip olunmuyor. O yüzden konsantrasyonu düşük bir jenerasyonla bu kadar konsantrasyon isteyen bir mesleğin nasıl ilerleyeceğini ben de bilmiyorum.

202. Bizim zamanımızda, bizim bir şeyden haberimiz yoktu. Yani ben MTV'de çıkarsa bir klip orada görüyordum mesela cinselliğe ya da uyuşturucuya dair bir şeyi. Ve hani yerin dibine falan giriyordum. Düşünsene bu çocuklar bunlarla büyüdüler ve bambaşka bir dünyanın içindeler. Onlar için her şeyi kabul edilebilir ve her şey yapılabilir. Her şey normal yani sen onu görerek büyüyorsan o senin için normal olur. Dolayısıyla onu disipline etmek de zor.

203. Benim otizmli bir öğrencim var. 7 yıldır falan öğrencim. Youtube kanalı var ve "like"lar geldikçe yeni bir video koyuyor mesela. Daha çok çalışası geliyor. Ona da olumlu etkisi var. Onu da motive ediyor.

204. Konser salonlarındaki doluluk oranı bir hayli iyi. Avrupa'da da, Türkiye'de de hiç fena değil ama yaş ortalaması yüksek. Ve hani gençler bunu ne kadar kabul edecek yani hakikaten böyle komplike bir şeyi var.

205. Bu son 10 yıldır çok moda olan abonelik sistemini gündeme getiriyorlar. Mesela Berlin Filarmoni'nin kendi dijital platformu var konserlerini yayınladıkları. Bazı masterclasslar yapıyor mesela o orkestraları, müzisyenleri, onları paylaşıyorlar. Orkestranın akademisi var, onları paylaşıyorlar. Röportajlar oluyor, belgeseller oluyor o orkestranın tarihiyle alakalı, bazı besteciler ile alakalı vesaire. Ve insanlar buna abonelik ücreti ödeyip buna gidebiliyorlar ama bu biraz kendi ayağına sıkmak gibi de oluyor bence. Çünkü yani bizim amacımız sahneye getirmek olmalı insanları, ekran başına toplamak değil yani. Dolayısıyla bir yandan anlıyorum, Türkiye'de de yapılıyor, bazı konserler canlı olarak internette de, televizyonda da yayınlanıyor. Ki parayla erişilemeyen şeye insanlar, ceplerinden, televizyonlarından erişebilsinler. Ve buna bir "Bu güzelmiş ya" desinler ve o zaman belki gelme kararı alırlar. Ama aslında öyle bir şey değil ki yani teknoloji zaten bizi tembelleştirdiği için "A ne güzel ben buna ulaşabiliyorum, hiç gitmeme gerek yok" diyecek.

206. Türkiye'yle ilgili, hiçbir sektörün geleceğiyle ilgili bir şey söylemek istemiyorum. Yani bilmiyorum çünkü, ön göremiyorum. Yani iyi dileklerim var ve kötümser senaryolarım var, iyi dileklerimin gerçekleşmesini diliyorum. Kötü senaryolar için... Hayatımızda ne yapabileceğimizi de tam olarak mı bilmiyorum. Hani herhalde bir tane hayatımız var deyip buradan çekip gitmeyi de tercih edebiliriz. O da

seçenekler arasında kalır her zaman. Yaşımız ne olursa olsun bence. Çünkü istemediğin yerde kalmamalısın hiçbir zaman. Bu ülke bizi ne kadar isteyecek bilmiyorum. Ben neye hizmet edebileceğimi biliyorum. Bunun ne kadar karşılığı olacağını da bilmiyorum.

207. İnsan hep hayatta kalmaya çalışan bir varlık ya içgüdüsel olarak, ne kadar sanatçı olursan ol, yani damarlarından böyle bir toplum aksa sen insansın ve bir noktada yaşamak istiyorsun, yaşamaya çalışıyorsun yani, bir noktada bir şeylerden ödün vermek zorunda kalıyorsun. Ödün vermezsen sanatçılığın da etkilenir bence yani kendine iyi bakamazsan iyi sanat yapabilmen de öyle mümkün değil. Piyanist filminde o savaş yığınının arasından çıkıp da o kadar açlık sefalet, susuzluk içinde çıkıp da o kadar iyi piyano çalamazsın mesela. Dolayısıyla yaşamaya çalışıyorsun ve işin özünde bir kere geliyoruz şu hayata, kaliteli, güzel yaşamak için. Ve sanatçı da zaten bunu öğütlemek için sanat yapmaya karar veriyor yani. Sanatçı çıkıp da insanlığa acı çekin demek için var olmaz, onu seçmez. Daha insanca yaşamayı daha, bir kere geldiğin hayatı doldurabilmeyi, onun yollarını keşfedebildiyse keşfettiği şeyleri paylaşabilmeyi amaçlar sadece yani. Dolayısıyla ben çocuğumun bunlardan mahrum olmasını istemem. Konservatuvara girip çok yıkıcı ve çok sonucunun belli olmadığı, hiçbir taraftan, ne toplum tarafından ne devlet politikaları tarafından desteklenemediği bir ortamda, böyle bir risk almasını istemem.

208. Bırakmama yakın zamanlardı herhalde lisans üçte falandım. Arayıp böyle çocuğunu işte çocuğunu konservatuvara göndermek isteyen bazı insanlar oluyordu. O zaman ne kadar ihtiyacım vardı, anlatamam. Hayır dedim. Yani yapmak istemiyorum. Çünkü herhangi bir konuştuğumun konservatuvarda okumasına göz yumamıyorum artık. Ben mutlu olmadım, aksine çok travmatize oldum diye açıkça böyle dille konuştum yani.

209. Yani eşim istiyor. Çünkü biz müzisyen olduğumuz için onun için daha kolay olacağını düşünüyor çevrede yer edinmenin ve müzik öğrenmenin. Hani daha yetenekli olacağını düşünüyor. Ben isterim, tabii ki bu arada, hani müzikle uğraşsın. Ama meslek olarak yapsın mı, yoksa... Meslek olarak da yapsın, o da tamam. Ama başka bir okulda da okumasını mutlaka isterdim yani. Yani başka bir yerden de kendini geliştirmesini isterdim. Sadece müzikle değil çünkü riskli bir meslek. Yani vücuduna çok iyi bakman gerekiyor, psikolojinin çok sağlam olması gerekiyor. Yani riskli bayağı.

210. Çocuğumu iyi bir müzik hocasına gönderirim. Kesin gönderim yani. Müzik yüzde yüz, enstrüman eğitimi yüzde yüz aldırırım. Profesyonel olarak bunu yapmak zorunda olmaz. Ya duygusal gelişim için, zihinsel gelişim için inanılmaz katkıları olduğunu düşünüyorum açıkçası. Ve benim yaşadığım mobbingleri yaşamazsa, yani sadece artı. O kendine artı katmış olarak bu işten karlı çıkar. Yani hiçbir eksisi olmaz, ondan götürüsü olmaz.

211. Kendi çocuğumla ilgili, kendi çocuğumun enstrüman eğitimi almasını, kendi kontrolümde ve özel ders desteği ile yapmayı tercih ederim. Konservatuara gitmesini ancak gerçekten çok istediği, çok başarılı olacağına inandığım durumda yaparım. Yoksa bir mesleki gelecek olarak falan değil de, daha kendini iyi hissettiği, hani vakit ayırmayı isteyeceği bir alan olarak müzikle ilgilenmesi isterim. Sonuçta bir sanatçı yetişirken ilk yıllarında zaten genelde sürünür. Sonrasında hani biraz belki para kazanabilir. Şanslıysa da iyi para kazanabilir. Genelde, dünya genelinde bu böyle. Dolayısıyla hani bir meslek olarak, hani bizim çok desteklememiz lazım. Ama hani o zor bir karar, yani ancak onu gözlemleyerek verebileceğin bir kadar. Ama şöyle bir romantik bir şeyim yok, "Ay ne güzel, keşke konservatuvarda okusa da piyanist olsa". Çünkü ne kadar zor bir süreç olduğunu biliyorum.

APPENDIX B

INTERVIEW QUESTIONS IN ENGLISH

Questions for graduates

1. Classical music training is a long process that often beginning at an early age. Could you tell me about how you started this journey and share a bit about yourself? (Where and when were you born? When and how did you become interested in classical music?)
2. Which individuals or institutions played a part in your music training? Are there any musicians in your family?
3. What challenged you the most during your school years? Did you experience any mental or physical illnesses or injuries during your training?
4. Have you ever thought about leaving music for another field? If so, what made you leave/continue?
5. How do you feel about being a musician?
6. How did your career in classical music begin and progress? Did you struggle to find a job? What was your first job?
7. What are the common job search strategies employed in the classical music field?
8. What does a typical work week look like for you?
9. What are the advantages and disadvantages of being a classical musician in Turkey?
10. What is the role of the private sector in classical music?
11. How can the state support your field?
12. How would you evaluate the changes in the working conditions of your field over time?
13. How has social media affected your field?
14. What are the most significant skills you acquired during your classical music training that you use in other areas of your life?
15. How do you envision the future of classical music in Turkey? Would you consider sending your child to a conservatory?

Questions for experienced professionals

1. Classical music training is a long process that often beginning at an early age. Could you tell me about how you started this journey and share a bit about yourself? (Where and when were you born? When and how did you become interested in classical music?)
2. Which individuals or institutions played a part in your music training? Are there any musicians in your family?
3. What challenged you the most during your school years? Did you experience any mental or physical illnesses or injuries during your training?
4. Have you ever thought about leaving music for another field? If so, what made you continue?
5. How do you feel about being a musician?
6. How did your career in classical music begin and progress? How has the industry changed since you began training in your field?
7. What does a typical week in your current professional life look like?
8. What are the advantages and disadvantages of being a classical musician in Turkey?
9. What have you done/do you do to build a professional network?
10. What are the criteria you consider to be important when choosing students, collaborators, or institutions to work with?
11. What is the role of the private sector in classical music? How has it changed over time?
12. How can the state support your field?
13. How has social media influenced your field?
14. What are the most significant skills you acquired during your classical music training that you use in other areas of your life?
15. How do you envision the future of classical music in Turkey? Would you consider sending your child to a conservatory?

APPENDIX C

APPROVAL OF THE ETHICS COMMITTEE

T.C.
BOĞAZİÇİ ÜNİVERSİTESİ REKTÖRLÜĞÜ
Sosyal ve Beşeri Bilimler İnsan Araştırmaları Etik Kurulu (Sbinarek)

2025 AİLE YILI

Sayı : E-84391427-050.04-221973 25.02.2025
Konu : 2025-07T Kayıt Numaralı Başvurunuz Hakkında

Sayın Doç. Dr. Bülent KÜÇÜK

Tez danışmanlığını yürüttüğünüz öğrenciniz Pelin Akkaya Can'ın "İstanbul'daki Klasik Batı Müziği Konservatuvarı Mezunlarının İş Piyasasına Katılım Süreçlerinin incelenmesi" başlıklı projesi ile Boğaziçi Üniversitesi Sosyal ve Beşeri Bilimler İnsan Araştırmaları Etik Kurulu (SBİNAREK)'e yaptığınız 2025-07T kayıt numaralı başvuru 17.02.2025 tarih ve 2025/02 sayılı kurul toplantısında incelenmiş ve projeye etik onay verilmesi uygun bulunmuştur.

Bu karar tüm üyelerin toplantıya on-line olarak katılımıyla ve oybirliği ile alınmıştır. Onay mektubu tüm üyeler adına Komisyon Başkanı tarafından e-imzalanmıştır. Bilgilerinizi rica ederiz.

Saygılarımızla,

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Işıl ERDUYAN
Kurul Başkanı

Bu belge, güvenli elektronik imza ile imzalanmıştır.
Belge Doğrulama Kodu : 0B32-2UUD-06LE Belge Doğrulama Adresi : https://www.turkiye.gov.tr/bogazici-universitesi-ebys

REFERENCES

Ayas, G. (2016). *Türkiye'de müzik sosyolojisi: Değişen paradigmalar, kesişen temalar*.

Barry, A., Osborne, T., & Rose, N. S. (1996). *Foucault and political reason: Liberalism, neo-liberalism, and rationalities of government*. University of Chicago Press.

Bennett, D. (2007). Utopia for music performance graduates: Is it achievable, and how should it be defined? *British Journal of Music Education, 24*(2), 179–189. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051707007383

Bozdoğan, S., & Kasaba, R. (Eds.). (1997). *Rethinking modernity and national identity in Turkey*. University of Washington Press.

Bröckling, U. (2016). *The entrepreneurial self: Fabricating a new type of subject*. SAGE.

Burchell, G. (Ed.). (1992). *The Foucault effect: Studies in governmentality with two lectures by and an interview with Michel Foucault*. University of Chicago Press.

Chafe, D., & Kaida, L. (2020). Harmonic dissonance: Coping with employment precarity among professional musicians in St John's, Canada. *Work, Employment and Society, 34*(3), 407–423. https://doi.org/10.1177/0950017019865877

Christiaens, T. (2020). The entrepreneur of the self beyond Foucault's neoliberal homo oeconomicus. *European Journal of Social Theory, 23*(4), 493–511. https://doi.org/10.1177/1368431019857998

de Reizabal, M. L., & Benito Gómez, M. (2020). When theory and practice meet: Avenues for entrepreneurship education in music conservatories. *International Journal of Music Education, 38*(3), 352–369. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761420919560

Ellis, H. M. (1999). *The escalation of commitment: How conservatory students form the notion of a career and sustain the pursuit of their professional ambition in the face of career uncertainty* (Doctoral dissertation). Northwestern University.

Jarvin, L., & Subotnik, R. F. (2010). Wisdom from conservatory faculty: Insights on success in classical music performance. *Roeper Review, 32*(2), 78–87. https://doi.org/10.1080/02783191003587868

Kadushin, C. (1969). The professional self-concept of music students. *Theory and Society*. http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/t-and-c

Kelly, P., & Pike, J. (2016). Is neo-liberal capitalism eating itself or its young? In *Neoliberalism, austerity, and the moral economies of young people's health and well-being* (pp. 1–31). Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-58266-9_1

Knotek, S. E., Foley-Nicpon, M., Kozbelt, A., Olszewski-Kubilius, P., Portenga, S., Subotnik, R. F., & Worrell, F. C. (2020). Gatekeeping in high-performance settings. *Review of General Psychology, 24*(3), 254–267. https://doi.org/10.1177/1089268020905578

Lazzarato, M. (2012). *The making of the indebted man: An essay on the neoliberal condition* (J. D. Jordan, Trans.). Semiotext(e).

Lemke, T. (2011). *Biopolitics: An advanced introduction*. New York University Press.

Ondracek-Peterson, E. (2013). *An investigation of the careers of conservatory-trained string players in the United States: Their preparation, development, and success in the twenty-first century* (Doctoral dissertation). Teachers College, Columbia University.

Özbek, M. (1997). Arabesk culture: A case of modernization and popular identity. In S. Bozdoğan & R. Kasaba (Eds.), *Rethinking modernity and national identity in Turkey* (pp. 211–234). University of Washington Press.

Parkinson, T., & Muslu Gardner, O. (2021). Protectionism and rapprochement in Turkish higher music education: An analysis of the mission and vision statements of conservatoires and university music departments in the Republic of Turkey. *Arts and Humanities in Higher Education, 20*(4), 365–385. https://doi.org/10.1177/1474022220983255

Sternberg, R. J., Jarvin, L., & Desmet, O. A. (2022). Lessons from the conservatory model as a basis for undergraduate education and the development of intelligence. *Journal of Intelligence, 10*(2). https://doi.org/10.3390/jintelligence10020034